



Detention conditions of

Crimean political prisoners

Overview of cases

“ To be honest, over the years of civic activism in the area of similar atrocities in detention centers related to FSB, my experience said: do not await cardinal results and changes. There will be attempts to hide or hush up all obvious violations.

Server Mustafayev, civil activist, political prisoner



The publication was prepared with financial support from the European Union and the International Partnership for Human Rights. Its content is the sole responsibility of CrimeaSOS and does not necessarily reflect the position of the European Union and the International Partnership for Human Rights.

Content

2	Introduction
3	General Inputs and Methodology
6	International legal guarantees for the protection of human rights in relation to persons kept in places of detention
8	Standards for the treatment of prisoners in accordance with the national legislation of the Russian Federation as an occupying state
10	The structure of the penitentiary service in occupied Crimea
12	Analysis of the main trends in violation of standards for the treatment of prisoners subjected to politically motivated prosecution
18	Recommendations
20	“Sentsov-Kolchenko Case”
25	“Hizb ut-Tahrir Cases”
43	Case of Ahtem Chiygoz
44	Cases of Euromaidan activists
50	Case of Murad Aliiev
53	Cases of “Crimean saboteurs”
58	Case of Ilmi Umerov
60	Cases of Ukrainian activists
65	“Vedzhie Kashka Case”
71	Case of Ismail Ramazanov
74	Case of Yevhenii Karakashev
76	Case of Nariman Memedeminov
78	Case of Oleksandr Steshenko
81	Case of Edem Bekirov

Introduction

On February 20, 2014, the Russian Federation occupied the Crimean Peninsula. The establishment of Russian control over the territory of Crimea has led to systemic violations of human rights and international humanitarian law. This report provides systematized information on one of the most serious categories of human rights violations in Crimea - violation of the right to freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment, as well as violation of related rights, such as the right to health protection, the right to freedom of religion, prohibition of discrimination based on language, religion, political or other beliefs, ethnicity.

“ According to the NGO “CrimeaSOS”, during the period of the occupation of Crimea by Russia, at least 138 persons were subject to criminal prosecution for political reasons. At least 119 of them were deprived of freedom for various terms. When they were kept in places of detention, their rights were systematically violated, many of them were severely tortured, as a result of which, even after being released in connection with serving a sentence or as a result of mutual release under political agreements, the physical and psychological health of these persons was not fully restored. Currently, at least 96 persons are still in places of detention.

At the same time, the authors of the report state that facts of violation of the rights of persons accused or convicted for political reasons became known to the general public due to their extensive media coverage. At the same time, the information found indicates that the rights and freedoms of prisoners under general criminal cases, who are kept in places of detention on the territory of occupied Crimea or transferred from Crimea to Russia, are also systematically violated. However, due to the closed nature of the penitentiary service institutions and the lack of full access to Crimea for independent monitoring missions, the real extent of these violations is currently unknown.

On behalf of the team of the NGO “CrimeaSOS”, the authors of the report express their gratitude to everyone who documents the facts of human rights violations in Crimea, since the report is based on these materials. The authors of the report express special gratitude to the Crimean lawyers working with persons subjected to politically motivated criminal prosecution; to professional and citizen journalists who worked and continue to work in Crimea, and to the media which cover the situation in the occupied territory (“Crimea.Realities”, Crimean news agency (QHA), “ATR” TV Channel, “15 minutes” news web-site, Center for Investigative Reporting and others); to civic activists who attend court hearings, organize parcels for political prisoners, financially and morally support their families.

We hope that this report will contribute to the process of de-occupation of Crimea and to the effort of bringing to justice those responsible for violations of human rights and international crimes, as well as contribute to the assistance and rehabilitation of the persons affected.

General Inputs¹ and Methodology

The act of aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine in the form of the invasion of the armed forces into the territory of Crimea and its military occupation in February 2014, as well as the official recognition by the occupying party of establishing control over the occupied territory, changed the international legal status of the Ukrainian peninsula. The parliament of Ukraine, parliaments of other countries, as well as key international institutions such as the UN General Assembly and the Council of Europe, officially recognized the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol as a territory temporarily occupied by the Russian Federation.

The Russian Federation is a party to international legal acts regulating the issue of occupation (IV Hague Convention on the Laws and Customs of War on Land 1907, IV Geneva Convention dated August 12, 1949 relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, Additional Protocol I to the 1949 Geneva Conventions relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts 1977). According to the Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, the occupying state exercises the functions of government and maintains the legislation of the occupied country during the period of establishing effective control over the occupied territory, without acquiring sovereignty over it.

Since the establishment of such control, the duties of the occupying state include ensuring public order and security in the controlled territory, inadmissibility of violating the rights of the local civilian population. In case of non-fulfillment of international legal obligations by persons or entities acting on behalf or under the control of the occupying state, international legal liability is provided.

Since the beginning of the occupation of Crimea by the Russian Federation, Ukrainian and international human rights organizations have recorded a wide range of violations of civil, political and socio-economic rights. Cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, as well as the use of torture against persons kept in places of detention, are the most serious violations of international humanitarian law and international human rights law. The severity of these violations stems from the intense physical and psychological suffering experienced by the victims, as well as the serious harm done to their health and the well-being of their families and communities. As a rule, persons who have suffered from torture and cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment for a long time cannot recover from what happened and restore their mental and physical condition.

The subject of this report is the conditions of detention of Ukrainian citizens with a Crimean residence registration or Ukrainian citizens living in mainland Ukraine, detained by the occupying authorities in Crimea who are recognized as political prisoners by the NGO "CrimeaSOS" and other human rights organizations, in

¹ See CrimeaSOS, Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights, "Advocacy in occupied Crimea and working conditions for human rights lawyers under occupation": <https://krymsos.com/files/b/d/bdb5f48-----pdf>, page 5

certain categories of places of detention: 1) in institutions of the penitentiary service (temporary detention facilities, pre-trial detention centers, colonies, prisons) in occupied Crimea and the Russian Federation (in cases of transfer from Crimea to the Russian Federation, which is a violation of the norms of international humanitarian law); 2) in psychiatric institutions, where the Ukrainian political prisoners are placed to undergo a forensic psychiatric examination, by decision of the authorized bodies of the occupation authorities; 3) in places that do not belong to the official institutions of the Federal Penitentiary Service of Russia, but are used by the de facto law enforcement officers of Crimea to detain and torture persons recognized as political prisoners (e.g. basements, buildings owned by individuals, etc.); 4) directorates and departments of points of internal affairs bodies and security services; 5) specialized vehicles, including vehicles with an escort, designed to transport detainees, suspects, accused and convicted persons. It should be noted that the conditions of detention of persons held in places of detention as a punishment for committing an administrative offense are not subject of the report.

For the purposes of this report and according to international law, the following actions are recognized as torture 1) any act by which severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person, 2) for such purposes as obtaining from him or a third person information or a confession, punishing him for an act he or a third person has committed or is suspected of having committed, or intimidating or coercing him or a third person, or for any reason based on discrimination of any kind, 3) inflicted by or at the instigation of or with the consent or acquiescence of a public official or other person acting in an official capacity².

Thus, torture is an act that contains three elements: 1) the intentional infliction of severe mental or physical suffering, 2) by a public official, who is directly or indirectly involved, 3) for a specific purpose³.

Inflicting pain and suffering of a lesser degree of intensity, committed by an official outside legal measures, is cruel, inhuman and/or degrading treatment or punishment⁴.

The purpose of the report is to inform the Ukrainian and international community, including international organizations, interested experts, journalists, public and political figures, as well as all other interested parties about the revealed facts of violations of the standards of treatment of Ukrainian political prisoners by the de facto state bodies of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol occupied by the Russian Federation.

The report describes documented facts of human rights violations against 36 individuals criminally prosecuted for political motives as of March 29, 2020; presents analysis of the

² See Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Adopted by General Assembly resolution 39/46 of 10 December 1984: https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/conventions/torture.shtml, Art. 1

³ See The Association for the Prevention of Torture, A legal definition of torture: <https://www.appt.ch/en/what-we-do/torture-prevention/definition-torture>

⁴ See The Association for the Prevention of Torture, Torture in International Law. A guide to jurisprudence: policehumanrightsresources.org/content/uploads/2016/01/Torture-in-International-Law-a-Guide-to-Jurisprudence.pdf?x96812

general situation and main trends regarding Russian compliance with standards for the treatment of prisoners, accused or convicted for political motives.

Report sources: in-depth interviews with the released political prisoners and lawyers defending the interests of political prisoners; questionnaires about the detention conditions of political prisoners, which came to the disposal of “CrimeaSOS”; internal information and analytical materials of “CrimeaSOS”, materials of other human rights organizations; publications by journalists, activists, and in media.

At the same time, the authors of the report suggest that due to obstacles to the documentation, such as lack of full access of monitoring missions to Crimea and the closed nature of institutions which are used as places of detention, the report materials do not fully reflect the real scope of the violations committed.

International legal guarantees for the protection of human rights in relation to persons kept in places of detention

Art. 7 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights⁵ (ICCPR) prohibits torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. Art. 8 of ICCPR prohibits forced or compulsory labour. Art. 10 of the ICCPR enshrines the right of all persons deprived of their liberty to be treated with humanity and with respect for the inherent dignity of the human person, and also defines the essential goal of the penitentiary regime to reform and socially rehabilitate the convicted offenders. In addition, Art. 26 of the ICCPR prohibits discrimination on any ground such as race, color, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status. The effect of this prohibition, of course, applies to persons held in places of detention.

“**Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment⁶, adopted by General Assembly resolution 39/46 of 10 December 1984, determines the nature of the state’s obligations in this area. It should be noted that the Russian Federation is a party to the Convention, which means that it has to comply with all provisions of this document. In particular, deliberate infliction of pain or suffering (both physical and mental), as well as non-recognition of any exceptional circumstances as a justification for torture (war, political instability, etc.) is absolutely prohibited. In addition, the Russian Federation, as a party to this Convention, is obliged to investigate all facts of torture that took place in its territory or were committed by its officials (article 6), and also refrain from using testimony obtained by means of torture during the trial (article 15).**

The prohibition of torture, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment is enshrined in Art. 3 of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR)⁷ and the relevant jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights.

In addition, the requirements for the national penitentiary system are set up in accordance with standards of international organizations, which are not legally binding, but widely taken into account by states due to the progressive nature of these documents, particularly, Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners⁸ (updated, adopted at the 24th session of the Commission on Crime

⁵ See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. Adopted by Resolution 2200 A (XXI) of the General Assembly of December 16, 1966: https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/conventions/pactpol.shtml

⁶ See Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Adopted by General Assembly resolution 39/46 of 10 December 1984: https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/conventions/torture.shtml

⁷ See the European Convention on Human Rights, as amended by Protocols Nos. 11 and 14 and supplemented by Protocols Nos. 1, 4, 6, 7, 12, 13 and 16: https://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/Convention_RUS.pdf

⁸ See Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners. Adopted by the First United Nations Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders, held at Geneva in 1955, and approved by the Economic and Social Council by its resolution 663 C (XXIV) of 31 July 1957 and 2076 (LXII) of 13 May 1977: https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/conventions/prison.shtml

Prevention and Criminal Justice, Vienna, 18-22 May 2015); Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment⁹, adopted by the General Assembly in 1988; Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Istanbul Protocol)¹⁰; Statement of principles relating to the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty in the context of the Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic¹¹.

As the occupying power, the Russian Federation is also obliged to comply with the norms of international humanitarian law, which relate to the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty in the occupied territory. Some guarantees for such persons are identical to the norms of international human rights law, in particular, the prohibition of all forms of torture, corporal punishment, humiliating and degrading treatment (paragraph 2 of article 75 of Additional Protocol I to the Geneva Conventions relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts), prohibition of discrimination against persons in custody on the basis of religion, language, national origin and other criteria (paragraph 1 of article 75 AP I), the right to receive necessary medical care (article 76 IV of the Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War). In addition, the GC IV provides that the occupying state must hold the accused and convicted within the occupied territories (articles 49, 76) and allow representatives of the International Committee of the Red Cross to visit all places where these persons are being held (article 143).

9 See Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment. Adopted by General Assembly resolution 43/173 of 9 December 1988: https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl_conv/conventions/detent.shtml

10 See Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Istanbul Protocol. Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment: <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/training8Rev1ru.pdf>

11 See Council of Europe. European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT). Statement of principles relating to the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty in the context of the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic: <https://rm.coe.int/16809cfa4d>

Standards for the treatment of prisoners in accordance with the national legislation of the Russian Federation as an occupying state

“ According to Art. 21 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation¹² no one should be subjected to torture, violence, other cruel or degrading treatment or punishment. Art. 22 of the Constitution of Russia establishes prohibition of arbitrary detention without a court decision for a period exceeding 48 hours, and Art. 48 guarantees the detained, imprisoned and indicted persons the right to use the assistance of a lawyer from the moment of arrest, detention or indictment.

The procedure for the transfer, placement, detention, release from places of detention, the regime and conditions of detention, as well as the legal status of persons held in places of detention on suspicion of committing a crime or charged with a criminal offense, or in connection with serving a criminal sentence, as well as the legal status of the personnel of places of detention of the penitentiary service is regulated by a number of regulatory legal acts of the Russian Federation, such as codes, federal laws and laws of Russia, bylaws of the Government of Russia and relevant ministries:

- ▶ Criminal Executive Code of the Russian Federation dated January 08, 1997 #1-Φ3¹³;
- ▶ Federal Law “On Detention of Suspects and Accused of Committing Crimes” dated June 21, 1995 # 103-Φ3 (hereinafter — FL # 103)¹⁴;
- ▶ Federal Law “On Public Control Over Ensuring Human Rights in Places of Detention and on Assistance to Persons in Places of Forced Detention” dated June 10, 2008 #76-Φ3 (hereinafter — FL #76)¹⁵;
- ▶ Law of Russia “On Institutions and Bodies Executing Criminal Sentences in the Form of Imprisonment” dated July 21, 1993 #5473-1¹⁶;
- ▶ Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation dated December 28, 2012 #1466 “On the approval of the Rules for the provision of persons in custody or serving a sentence of imprisonment with medical care in medical organizations of the state and municipal health care systems, as

12 See Constitution of the Russian Federation (adopted by popular vote on December 12, 1993) (with amendments introduced by the Laws of Russia on amendments to the Constitution of Russia dated December 30, 2008 # 6-ΦК3, December 30, 2008 # 7-ΦК3, February 05, 2014 # 2-ΦК3, July 21, 2014 # 11-ΦК3): http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_28399/

13 See The Criminal Executive Code of the Russian Federation dated January 08, 1997 # 1-Φ3 (wording as of December 27, 2019): http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_12940/

14 See Federal Law “On Detention of Suspects and Accused of Committing Crimes”, adopted by the State Duma on June 21, 1995: <http://pravo.gov.ru/proxy/ips/?Docbody=&nd=102036506&intelsearch=%F3%F1%EB%EE%E2%E8%FF+%F1%EE%E4%E5%F0%E6%E0%ED%E8%FE>

15 See Federal Law dated June 10, 2008 # 76-Φ3 “On Public Control Over Ensuring Human Rights in Places of Detention and on Assistance to Persons in Places of Forced Detention” (with amendments): <https://base.garant.ru/12160914/>

16 See the Law of the Russian Federation dated July 21, 1993 # 5473-1 “On Institutions and Bodies Executing Criminal Sentences in the Form of Imprisonment”: <http://ivo.garant.ru/#/document/1305321/paragraph/118119:0>

well as invitation for consultations of specialist doctors from these medical organizations if it is impossible to provide medical care in institutions of penal system”¹⁷;

- ▶ Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation “On Approval of the Concept for the Development of the Penal System of the Russian Federation until 2020” dated October 14, 2010 #1772-P¹⁸;
- ▶ Order of the MIA of the Russian Federation dated August 2, 2012 #754 “On the procedure for visiting without special permission by members of public councils under the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation and its territorial bodies of premises of internal affairs bodies, as well as places of forced detention of suspects and accused of committing a crime, detained persons, persons subjected to administrative arrest”¹⁹;
- ▶ Order of the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation dated December 28, 2017 #285 “On Approval of the Procedure for Organizing the Provision of Medical Care to Persons in Custody or Serving a Sentence of Imprisonment”²⁰;
- ▶ Order of the Federal Penitentiary Service “On Approval of the Procedure for Organizing Meals for Convicted, Suspected and Accused Persons Held in Institutions of the Penal System” dated September 2, 2016 #6966²¹.

In addition, a number of issues related to the individual rights and obligations of detainees and the personnel of places of detention are regulated by the internal regulations and job descriptions of institutions of the penitentiary service. It should be noted that these documents cannot contradict the Constitution of the Russian Federation and other acts with higher legal force specified in this report.

17 See Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation dated December 28, 2012 # 1466 “On the approval of the Rules for the provision of persons in custody or serving a sentence of imprisonment with medical care in medical organizations of the state and municipal health care systems, as well as invitation for consultations of specialist doctors from these medical organizations if it is impossible to provide medical care in institutions of penal system”: <http://ivo.garant.ru/#/document/70292628/paragraph/1:0>

18 See Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation dated October 14, 2010 “On Approval of the Concept for the Development of the Penal System of the Russian Federation until 2020” (with amendments): <http://base.garant.ru/1357449/>

19 See Order of the MIA of the Russian Federation dated August 2, 2012 #754 “On the procedure for visiting without special permission by members of public councils under the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation and its territorial bodies of premises of internal affairs bodies, as well as places of forced detention of suspects and accused of committing a crime, detained persons, persons subjected to administrative arrest”: <http://base.garant.ru/70284174/>

20 See Order of the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation dated December 28, 2017 #285 “On Approval of the Procedure for Organizing the Provision of Medical Care to Persons in Custody or Serving a Sentence of Imprisonment”: <http://ivo.garant.ru/#/document/71874866/paragraph/1:0>

21 See Order of the Federal Penitentiary Service dated September 2, 2016 #696 “On Approval of the Procedure for Organizing Meals for Convicted, Suspected and Accused Persons Held in Institutions of the Penal System”: <http://ivo.garant.ru/#/document/71563102/paragraph/1:0>

The structure of the penitentiary service in occupied Crimea

Before the occupation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea by the Russian Federation in February 2014, two pre-trial detention centers (Simferopol and Kerch), two colonies (Simferopol Corrective Labor Colony #102, Kerch Corrective Labor Colony #126) and a corrective labor center (Kerch) functioned on the territory of the peninsula. According to the Regional Center for Human Rights, at the time of the military invasion of Russia, roughly 3.5 thousand people were held in the colonies and pre-trial detention centers of Crimea²². In addition, persons who were detained on suspicion of a criminal offense but who have been not yet issued a pretrial restraint by the court, were kept in temporary detention facilities located in the same building as the local internal affairs bodies (police stations).

After establishing effective control over the territory of Crimea in the spring of 2014, the Russian authorities began creating their own penitentiary system and institutions on the peninsula. Currently, the following divisions operate in the department of the “Federal Penitentiary Service of Russia for the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol”, which are places of detention²³: pre-trial detention center #1, Simferopol (limit 747 persons); corrective labor colony with a strict regime #1, Simferopol (limit 515 persons); corrective labor colony with a general regime #2, Kerch (limit 710 persons); penal colony #1, Kerch (limit 106 persons); corrective labor center in Simferopol (operates since December 25, 2019, limit 50 persons); medical-sanitary unit #91, Simferopol.

One of the most serious problems of the de facto penitentiary service in Crimea is cruel, inhuman and degrading conditions of detention in pre-trial detention center #1 in Simferopol. It should be noted that the center was commissioned in 1803 and has never undergone a major overhaul²⁴.

Another problem is the extreme overcrowding of the center: with a limit of 747 places, up to 1800 prisoners were held in the pre-trial detention center in different periods²⁵. In February 2016, information circulated that the de facto Crimean authorities planned to build a new pre-trial detention center on the peninsula²⁶. In 2019, it became known that two blocks of pretrial detention facilities for 1000 and 500 places were under construction²⁷, however, there is no official information about the completion date of the construction and the date of commissioning of the new pre-trial detention center.

22 See Ivan Putilov, Imprisoned at homeland: Crimean prisoners want to be held in Ukrainian colonies: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/27918461.html>

23 See Federal Penitentiary Service of Russia in the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol. Structural units: <http://www.krim.fsin.su/structure/index.php>

24 See Overhaul in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center has not been carried out for more than two centuries - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-kapremont-v-sizo-simferopolya-ne-provodili-bolee-200-let/30244790.html>

25 According to the editor-in-chief of the publication “Graty” Anton Naumliuk.

26 See A new prison for 82 million rubles will appear in Simferopol: <https://ruinform.com/page/v-simferopole-pojavitsja-novaja-tjurma-za-82-milliona-rublej>

27 See New pre-trial detention centers are being built in Crimea to increase the number of prisoners - the human rights activist: <https://www.rbc.ua/ukr/news/krymu-stroyat-novye-sizo-uvelichit-kolichestvo-1573424149.html>

“ In addition, the problem of the Russian Federal Penitentiary Service in Crimea, which automatically leads to large-scale violations of international humanitarian law, is the lack of corrective labor colonies on the peninsula for women, minors and people infected with HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and hepatitis²⁸. As a result, these categories of prisoners are transferred to serve their sentences in corrective labor colonies in Russia. Moreover, many corrective labor colonies in Russia have cruel, inhuman and degrading conditions of detention. For example, in 2016, a Crimean resident suffering from hepatitis and tuberculosis was transferred to CC-1 of the Republic of Adygea, Russian Federation, where he died due to the lack of medical care²⁹.

There is one more institution to mention in associated with the Russian penitentiary system, which de facto functions in Crimea. It is Public Monitoring Commission for the Protection of Human Rights in Places of Forced Detention (hereinafter PMC). The legal status of the PMC is regulated by the Federal Law dated June 10, 2008 #76-Φ3 “On Public Control Over Ensuring Human Rights in Places of Detention and on Assistance to Persons in Places of Forced Detention” (with amendments)³⁰. However, despite the fact that the PMC is claimed by the Russian authorities to be an independent body of public control over the observance of the rights of prisoners, in many regions of the Russian Federation, as well as in occupied Crimea, the PMC staff includes persons loyal to the government, who create an illusion of public control but do not truly protect the rights of prisoners.

28 See Elena Removskaya, From Crimea to Russian colonies: prisoners are taken away from the peninsula: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/interviu-vitaliy-nabuhotnyi-peremeshenie-krymchan-v-rossiyu/30030194.html>

29 See Two deaths of Ukrainian citizens recorded in prisons in Russia and Crimea: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/zafiksovano-dva-vipadki-smerti-gromadyan-ukrayini-v-tyurmakh-rosiyi-ta-krimu/>

30 See See Federal Law dated June 10, 2008 # 76-Φ3 “On Public Control Over Ensuring Human Rights in Places of Detention and on Assistance to Persons in Places of Forced Detention” (with amendments): <http://base.garant.ru/12160914/>

Analysis of the main trends in violation of standards for the treatment of prisoners subjected to politically motivated prosecution

Monitoring of the conditions of detention of Ukrainian citizens subject to politically motivated criminal prosecution in places of detention in occupied Crimea and the Russian Federation indicates that the use of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment is systemic.

It should be noted that de facto law enforcement officers tortured many political prisoners to obtain their testimonies. As a result, many victims were forced to incriminate themselves and/or other defendants in their case. At the same time, in some case categories, this practice took place in relation to all or almost all detainees. As a rule, tortures were applied by officers of the Russian special services (FSB, Center for Combating Extremism) in special vehicles designed to transport detainees, in the buildings of the FSB Directorate, internal affairs bodies, as well as in the basements of unidentified buildings. It is noteworthy that among the FSB officers who tortured the detainees, some victims identified FSB officers which repeatedly took part in torture. Based on that we made an assumption that the de facto Crimean authorities selected certain employees of the special services specifically to torture suspects. It should also be noted that in almost all reviewed cases, from the moment of detention until the court's decision to issue a pretrial restraint (between 1 and 5 days), the detainees were not provided with either food or water

Numerous facts of torture were documented on the territory of detention centers (Rus. ИBC, СИЗО) and colonies. According to available information, in Crimea, such practices are widespread in Corrective Labor Colony #2 in Kerch. The use of torture there both in relation to political prisoners and in relation to those convicted in general criminal cases began in 2016, when the officers from Russian Federal Penitentiary Service (FPS) arrived to the colony. According to the victims, these persons had an order to teach the Crimean employees of the FPS the unofficial “rules” of the work of the penitentiary typical for the Russian Federation. After the arrival of these officers from Russia, the colony staff began to torture prisoners with electroshock weapons, beat them up, douse them with urine, use sexual violence, and compel them to actions degrading human dignity.

In other Crimean places of detention, no mass use of torture was recorded. However, in some cases, torture was used by staff of places of detention and law enforcement bodies against political prisoners to obtain their desired testimony from them or as revenge for their ideological or religious beliefs. One particular method of torture was to place a victim to a cell with prisoners who cooperate with the prison officials. Those prisoners then used violence against political prisoners. There was a case when special forces officers who arrived from the Chechnya Republic beat ethnic Ukrainian prisoners in the temporary detention facility (Rus. ИBC) in Simferopol for a “physical training”.

“ In Russian places of detention, where Ukrainian political prisoners from Crimea are transferred to serve their sentences, the situation with torture instances is much worse. According to “CrimeaSOS” monitoring, in many Russian corrective labor colonies torture is often used to force prisoners to cooperate with colonies’ officials, and to demonstrate the power-subordination correlation.

It should be noted that in order to inflict severe physical and psychological suffering, persons controlled by the Russian authorities use various forms of torture: beating with an iron pipe, water bottles (so that no traces remain), the so-called “swallow” (tying the legs and pulling them to the arms behind the back), strangulation with a plastic bag, imitation of execution by shooting, forcing prisoners to perform various degrading actions naked, hanging by handcuffs, application of electric current, sexual abuse, keeping prisoners wrapped in a mattress for 24 hours, keeping them in the fetal position in a metal box, keeping them naked or in wet clothes in a cold cell, etc. In addition, colonies’ officials threatened prisoners who went on hunger strikes with forced feeding, which is also a form of torture. “CrimeaSOS” recorded instances in which Russian-controlled courts put into custody persons who, according to Russian legislation cannot be kept in custody due to their health conditions. The authors of this report consider the detention of these as torture.

In all cases, despite the complaints of torture filed by prisoners and their lawyers in the appropriate manner, the authorized Russian state bodies refused to investigate the facts of torture for contrived reasons. Appealing such refusals at the national level also brought no result.

The vast majority of Crimean political prisoners face violations of the standards of treatment in the form of cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment and punishment in Crimean and Russian places of detention. Most often, all categories of prisoners are subjected to these violations. However, in some cases, additional factors that make conditions of detention harsher are created for political prisoners. For example, people who are carriers of deadly infectious diseases are placed in political prisoners’ cells; they are baselessly denied visits of their relatives for extended periods of time (a year or more); they are unlawfully subjected to disciplinary punishments punishment cell (rus. карцер), solitary confinement; there are frequent searches, including at night, and with seizure of documents necessary for the exercise of procedural rights; their religious rights are infringed upon (e.g. religious literature is seized); they are denied access to Ukrainian diplomatic staff and lawyers; they are subjected to physical violence, psychological pressure, and ethnic discrimination; some political prisoners are transported to remote northern regions of Russia with harsh climatic conditions. A case was recorded when prison officials directly told the defendants of the so-called “Hizb ut-Tahrir Case” that they were placed in worse conditions because they were “terrorists”.

“ Pre-trial detention center #1 in Simferopol has the most inhuman and cruel conditions of detention among Crimean detention facilities. As noted earlier, the center is designed to hold no more than 747 prisoners at the same time, but at different times, it held up to 1,800 people. As a result, the prisoners lack space and beds, they cannot move freely

around the cell and are forced to take turns to sleep. The cells lack adequate lighting and ventilation; the windows of some cells do not have any glass. As a result, prisoners freeze and get sick in cold seasons. In some cells, the light is not switched off at night so that prisoners cannot fully rest. Convicts suffer from parasite bites, which in some cases cause allergic reaction. The quality of food and drinking water is also substandard. It is unfit for consumption and causes gastrointestinal diseases. As a result, prisoners who do not receive parcels from their relatives are forced to starve.

In addition, one of the grossest violations is the widespread practice of not providing medical assistance even in cases of direct threat to life. Medical block of the pre-trial detention center lacks practically all basic categories of medications. Passing medicines to prisoners from relatives in 2016 was complicated: in addition to the doctor's prescription and a receipt from the pharmacy, penitentiary staff began demanding additional documents — a drug quality certificate and a doctor's referral³¹. This has led to the fact that prisoners have to suffer from pain while their relatives put together all necessary documents. In addition, there are reported cases when officials of the pre-trial detention centers refuse to accept vital medicines from the relatives.

Despite the fact that the large number of prisoners needs dental care, there is no dentist. However, one of the most serious problems is that the administration of the pre-trial detention center does not send or untimely sends them to the hospital for examination and treatment. The medical examination in the hospital lacks objectivity, even if the prisoners have an acute condition that poses a threat to their lives the examination results fail to reflect that. In January 2017, Emir-Usein Kuku, a human rights defender and defendant in the so-called "Hizb ut-Tahrir Case", held in the pre-trial detention center, said that during the year he was in the detention center, he witnessed deaths of 10 prisoners due to lack of medical care³². The exact number of such deaths during the occupation of the peninsula remains unclear due to the closed nature of places of detention and the refusal of the Russian authorities to admit international observers there. In some high-profile cases, when the health conditions of the prisoners were dire, the issue was resolved only after the intervention of the Ukrainian Ombudsman.

Since March 2020, due to COVID-19 pandemic, the lack of medical care in places of detention poses a particularly serious threat to the life and health of prisoners. According to available information, prisoners with COVID-19 symptoms do not undergo medical examination or testing, they are not provided with treatment, and they are not isolated from other prisoners. As a result, inmates become infected. At the same time, the de facto authorities ignore the demands of Ukrainian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ukrainian Ombudsman, and Amnesty International to examine and treat prisoners. It is worth noting that Ukrainian, foreign and international human rights organizations have appealed to intergovernmental organizations and their member states to take urgent measures to prevent the catastrophic consequences of the spread of Coronavirus in prisons in Crimea, in

31 See The process of transferring medicines to prisoners was complicated in Simferopol pre-trial detention center: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/u-simferopolskomu-sizo-uskladnili-protses-peredachi-v---yaznyam-likiv/>

32 See Inhuman conditions of detention in Simferopol pre-trial detention center, 10 people died in a year - human rights activists: https://zmina.info/ru/news-ru/u_simferopolskomu_sizo_neljudski_umovi_utrimannja_za_rik_pomerlo_10_ljudej_pravozahisniki/

Russian-controlled Donbas region, and in Russia. According to their statement³³, the administration of places of detention is not able to implement the WHO recommendations for protection from COVID-19, and that places of detention are places of increased risk for the spread of infectious diseases and prisoners are constantly at risk of infection.

Administration of Simferopol pre-trial detention center violates prisoners' religious rights: staff of the pre-trial detention center deliberately does not tell Muslim prisoners if there is pork in their food, as Muslims do not eat pork; due to overcrowded cells, prisoners cannot carry out religious rituals there, there is no specially designated place where Muslims can perform religious ceremonies on the territory of the pre-trial detention center; Christians are denied access of Orthodox priests, there are records of baseless seizure of permitted religious literature.

It should be noted that in the pre-trial detention center of Simferopol, almost all persons persecuted for political reasons are kept in a special block with more severe detention conditions and complete informational isolation.

“ One of the forms of cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment is a compulsory psychiatric examination in a psychiatric hospital (Crimean Republican Clinical Hospital #1). According to one of the victims, the hospital staff said in a private conversation that they had no doubts about the mental health of the prisoner, however, in accordance with the law, they were obliged to keep him for at least 21 days. It is obvious that this kind of investigative action is carried out with the sole purpose of humiliating the human dignity of political prisoners. In the hospital, political prisoners are held together with persons with real mental disorders. In addition, the toilets and showers are under video surveillance and are not separated from each other to provide privacy while a large number of people gather there.

In places of detention in Russia, where Ukrainian political prisoners are transferred, the conditions of detention differ depending on the specific institution. However, none of them have sufficient medical care. They all fail to provide timely and objective medical examination in a hospital. In some places of detention, the religious rights of prisoners are violated. There were cases of threats to murder inmates who profess religions other than Orthodox Christianity. In the pre-trial detention center of Rostov-on-Don and the pre-trial detention center in Krasnodar, the cells are overcrowded (in the Krasnodar pre-trial detention center, 7-8 people were accommodated in separate cells on one bed), and the temperature regime is not observed. In Corrective Labor Colony # 5 in Kirovo-Chepetsk, Kirov region, the administration forced the prisoners to work for free; those who refused were subject to disciplinary sanctions. The administration deliberately created the notion of low social status of prisoners with Ukrainian citizenship, by insulting them and encouraging other prisoners to do so too. The administration representatives and the local priest they incited ethnic hatred.

33 See Statement on COVID-19 in places of detention in Russian-occupied Crimea and Russian-controlled Donbas: <https://krymsos.com/ru/reports/propozitsiyi-dlya-uryadivdiplomachnikh-ustanov/zayava-shchodo-covid19-u-zakritikh-tyurmakh-na-okupovanomu-rosiyye-krimu-ta-pidkontrolnomu-rosiyi-donbasi/>

Another violation of the rights of prisoners is the compulsory imposition of Russian citizenship. Due to forced Russian prisoners are subsequently denied extradition to Ukraine, access to Ukrainian diplomatic staff and the ombudsman. In some corrective labor colonies, there were delays in the delivery of parcels with warm clothes (during the cold season) and food. There is a quite common practice to place prisoners in a punishment cell for their political views, refusal to work in a colony, refusal to strip naked because of their religious beliefs and on other illegal or fabricated grounds. There were cases when the colony administration first applied to some political prisoners a number of disciplinary sanctions and then transferred them to the part of the colony with stricter regime (Rus. помещение камерного типа) and complete informational isolation.

It should be noted that some types of violations take place both in Crimean and Russian places of detention.

“ The administrations of places of detention do not provide prisoners with packed lunches or give them packed lunches wit on the days of court hearings. Prisoners are brought to the courts before breakfast and returned after dinner. Thus, the prisoners starve on court hearing days, which negatively affects their ability to fully participate in the process and protect themselves. Smokers and nonsmokers are often held in the same cells, which is especially detrimental for the nonsmokers’ health when the cells are overcrowded. At the same time, the administrations of places of detention apply disciplinary sanctions to prisoners who file complaints about the conditions of detention.

The officers of the Russian special services visited a number of political prisoners in places of detention. The officers threatened to harm the prisoners’ families or initiate new criminal cases against them if they did not “cooperate” and conspire with third parties.

Conditions in which prisoners are transferred amount to cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment (in most cases, they are equally bad for all categories of prisoners). It should be noted that the transfer is carried out by police vans, in which the prisoners are in a half-sitting position in the so-called “glass” (these cells are 50x65x180 cm). Moreover, even during long transfers, prisoners are not given water and are not allowed short stops (e.g. to stretch, use the bathroom). In addition right after their arrest, the prisoners are transferred with bags on their heads.

Thus, the minimum standards for the treatment of prisoners are not observed in Crimean and Russian places detention where Ukrainian political prisoners are kept. As a result, prisoners develop gastrointestinal tract diseases, allergies, respiratory diseases, teeth decay, exacerbated chronic illnesses and serious psychological problems. Most of the documented violations are common to all or most of the monitored places of detention, which indicates that these violations are of a systemic nature. One of the most serious problems is the lack of medical care, even when prisoners are in critical condition. In Crimea, the most severe conditions of detention are in Pre-trial Detention Center #1 in Simferopol: overcrowded cells, unsanitary conditions, lack of ventilation and access to drinking water, poor quality of food. At the same time, we documented instances in which the administration

of Pre-trial Detention Center #1 in Simferopol, and in other places of confinement, intentionally made harsh conditions of detention for political prisoners.

Another extremely serious problem is the use of torture, violence and psychological pressure on political prisoners. The situation is complicated by the lack of effective mechanisms to investigate such cases and bring those responsible to justice. It should be noted that the practice of torture was introduced in Crimea by employees of the de facto special services and employees of the Federal Detention Service, who came from Russia. In a number of cases, testimony provided under torture formed the basis of convictions.

Recommendations

We demand the Russian Federation as a state exercising de facto control over the territory of occupied Crimea to:

- ▶ stop the practice of politically motivated criminal prosecution of Ukrainian citizens, immediately release all persons recognized by Ukraine and international organizations as political prisoners;
- ▶ stop the practice of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment and punishment against persons held in places of detention on the territory of Crimea and those who were transferred to Russia, observe the minimum standards for the treatment of prisoners established by international law;
- ▶ conduct an effective investigation of all cases of politically motivated criminal prosecution, torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment, prosecute those responsible and provide compensation to victims of human rights violations;
- ▶ refrain from transferring prisoners from the territory of the Crimean Peninsula to the territory of the Russian Federation, and ensure their safe return to Crimea;
- ▶ stop discrimination against Ukrainians and Crimean Tatars in places of detention on the basis of ethnic origin, language, religion, political views and other differences;
- ▶ ensure unhindered access for representatives of the International Committee of the Red Cross to all institutions under the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation where Ukrainian citizens are detained.

We call on Ukraine as a state on whose sovereign territory violations occur and whose citizens are victims of violations to:

- ▶ use all available means and tools to conduct an effective investigation of cases of torture, cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment, bring those responsible to liability for committing international crimes;
- ▶ provide full support to the families of victims of politically motivated prosecutions;
- ▶ use all available means and tools to force the Russian Federation to fulfill its international obligations in terms of the above requirements.

We draw the attention of other states to the fact that the use of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment is a gross violation of international humanitarian law and international human rights law. Thus, we ask to:

- ▶ hold those responsible for crimes liable under universal jurisdiction or other procedures that allow to hold them liable for international crimes;

- ▶ use all available means and tools in order to force the Russian Federation to fulfill its international obligations in terms of the above requirements;
- ▶ strengthen sectoral sanctions against the Russian Federation for systemic and gross violations of human rights, war crimes in occupied Crimea.

We recommend international non-governmental and intergovernmental organizations to:

- ▶ consider cases of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment in Crimea within the framework of their mandates and take measures to ensure that states fulfill their obligations;
- ▶ to the extent possible, organize international fact-finding missions related to cases of human rights violations in Crimea.

“Sentsov-Kolchenko Case”

Oleh Sentsov

Oleh Sentsov, a Ukrainian filmmaker, was detained on May 10, 2014 near his home, for 24 hours his relatives were uninformed as to his whereabouts. During the time of his imprisonment both Sentsov and his lawyer regularly reported alleged torture. In addition, he was repeatedly placed in solitary confinement without reasonable grounds, sometimes as a reaction to strong public opinion in his favor. Two weeks after the arrest, Oleh Sentsov was transferred to the Lefortovo pre-trial detention center in Moscow. On August 25, 2015, the North Caucasus District Military Court sentenced Sentsov to 20 years in a maximum security penal colony, allegedly for creating a “Right Sector” cell and planning a number of terrorist acts in Crimean cities (part 1 of article 205.4, part 2 of article 205, part 3 of article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After the conviction Oleh Sentsov served his sentence in remote regions of the Russian Federation, characterized by a harsh northern climate (penal colonies No. 1 in Yakutsk, and No. 8 in Labytnangi), which made access to lawyer too difficult. Moreover, due to the hunger strike, which Oleh Sentsov held for 145 days, his health condition significantly deteriorated. In October 2018, Sentsov was awarded the Sakharov Prize for Freedom of Thought. A number of international intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations such as the UN, the European Union, the Council of Europe, Human Rights Watch, Amnesty International declared Oleh Sentsov a political prisoner and demanded his release. In September 2019, Sentsov was released as part of the so-called “big exchange” between Ukraine and the Russian Federation.

“According to Oleh Sentsov, on May 10, 2014, Russian intelligence officers seized him near his home, handcuffed him, put a bag over his head and took him to the FSB headquarters. He was beaten for 3-4 hours, asphyxiated with a plastic bag, threatened with rape by a wooden baton, all in attempt to make him to confess³⁴. Numerous bruises on his body were documented by the employees of the pre-trial detention center in Simferopol, but the Investigation Committee of the Russian Federation refused to institute criminal proceedings for alleged torture³⁵.”

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation twice (in 2016 and 2017) refused to extradite Sentsov to Ukraine, since it considered him a citizen of the Russian Federation in accordance with the procedure for compulsory imposition of the Russian citizenship on Crimean residents (according to article 5 of the Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Crimea on the Accession of the Republic of Crimea in the Russian Federation and on Forming New Constituent Entities within the Russian Federation”, citizens of Ukraine and stateless persons living in Crimea were automatically recognized as citizens of the Russian Federation, unless they submitted an application for renouncing Russian citizenship within a specified time), hence, the Ukrainian consul was not admitted and extradition to Ukraine could not take place (the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine submitted a relevant request to the Russian Federation).

34 See Anton Naumliuk, “It’s Hard to Sit Having Been Hit with a Wooden Baton”: www.svoboda.org/a/27173887.htm

35 See LetMyPeopleGo, Oleg Sentsov: <http://letmypeoplego.org.ua/uk/prisoner/oleg-sentsov/>

In early March 2016, Oleh Sentsov was transferred to the penal colony No. 1 in Yakutsk to serve his sentence. While serving his sentence in the northern regions of the Russian Federation, the political prisoner had serious health issues (rheumatism, chest pain, hair loss, dental problems). In October 2017, he was placed in solitary confinement for two weeks as a result of strong public opinion in his favor in the Yakut region.

On November 13, 2017 Oleh Sentsov was transferred to the penal colony No. 8 in Labytnangi, Yamal-Nenets Autonomous District of Russia. Later, after his release, the political prisoner stated³⁶, that colony officers, in line with the established practice, beat and tortured all newly arrived prisoners, as well as pressurized them to become informants. In particular, prison guards kept prisoners wrapped in a mattress for 24 hours, placed them in an embryo pose in an iron box, kept them naked or in a wet robe in a cold cell, and electrocuted them.

In May 2018, Sentsov went on a hunger strike demanding the release of all Ukrainian political prisoners in the Russian Federation. The hunger strike lasted 145 days and was discontinued after officers of the Federal Penitentiary Service announced their intention to force-feed Oleg. At the same time, Amnesty International, an international human rights organization, declared forced feeding a form of torture. During the hunger strike, Sentsov had medical emergencies several times, hence he agreed to supportive therapy (nutritional formulas). However, despite the supportive therapy, such a long hunger strike extremely negatively impacted the health of the political prisoner (low hemoglobin count and heart rate, anemia and hypoxia, heart, liver and kidney damage), and he lost 20 kgs. In addition, the first month of Sentsov's hunger strike was spent in solitary confinement. Although Oleh Sentsov's demands for the release of all Ukrainian political prisoners were not met by the Russian side, his hunger strike drew attention to the problem of Ukrainian political prisoners in the Russian Federation and led to a great international response.

In 2018, the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine lodged application with the European Court of Human Rights in order to ensure that Russia granted access to the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova to Oleh Sentsov, who at that time was still on a hunger-strike. Russia justified its refusal of access by Sentsov's Russian citizenship, which, in fact, had been imposed on him. In addition, the Russian side ignored inquiries of the Ukrainian Foreign Ministry about Sentsov's health status. It should be noted that not even a priest was allowed to visit Sentsov.

In December 2018, colony administrators withhold Sentsov's parcel with warm clothes and food items for about three weeks, allegedly because of its overweight. Although the requirements to the weight of the parcel, referred to by the prison officials, had been canceled a year earlier. Thus, the refusal to accept the parcel was illegal³⁷.

In March 2019, the administrators of the penal colony No.8 several times, under various pretexts, did not allow Sentsov's lawyer to visit the prisoner.

36 See La-Pyt-Nan-Gi: <https://novayagazeta.ru/articles/2019/12/29/83298-la-pyt-nan-gi>

37 See Tatiana Shchur, December 9, 2018: https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=2244303559177294&id=100007930145803

Oleh Sentsov’s application, in which he complains of a violation of his right to freedom and security, as well as infliction of torture, is currently pending at the European Court of Human Rights.

Oleksandr Kolchenko

Oleksandr Kolchenko, a leftist activist involved in Oleh Sentsov’s cases, was detained on May 16, 2014. Kolchenko was charged with aiding arson at the office of the Simferopol branch of the United Russia party (part 2 of article 205.4, part 2 of article 205 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). When communicating with his lawyer, Kolchenko repeatedly stated that while being detained and during the detention he was beaten by FSB officers. On August 25, 2015, the North Caucasus District Military Court sentenced Oleksandr Kolchenko to 10 years in a maximum security penal colony. In March 2016, he started serving his sentence in the penal colony No. 6 in the city of Kopeisk, Chelyabinsk Region. In September 2019, Kolchenko was released as part of the so-called “big exchange” between Ukraine and Russia.

“The administration of the penal colony No. 6 of Kopeisk preventively registered Oleksandr Kolchenko as a person susceptible to terrorism and extremism³⁸. It is also known that he repeatedly was placed in solitary confinement without reasonable grounds³⁹. After his release, Kolchenko said that he and 9 Muslim prisoners, whose names were included into the prevention register, were put by prison administrators into solitary confinement on public holidays and other significant dates, such as the election of the President or the World Cup. According to Alexander, such practice is foreseen in internal instructions of the Federal Penitentiary Service⁴⁰.

The Russian Foreign Ministry twice (in 2016 and 2017) refused to extradite Kolchenko to Ukraine: Alexander’s Russian citizenship, similarly to other persons involved in “Sentsov cases”, was compulsorily imposed on him, although the political prisoner officially renounced it⁴¹. On the same grounds, he was repeatedly refused a meeting with the Ukrainian consul.

In 2017, the Federal Penitentiary Service of the Russian Federation twice refused Kolchenko’s request to continue University studies in absentia.

During his imprisonment Oleksandr’s health deteriorated. In November 2017, he was admitted to a hospital with a diagnosis of “weight deficit”, and in February 2018, with a diagnosis of “arrhythmia.”

On May 31, 2018, Oleksandr Kolchenko went on a hunger strike in support of Oleh Sentsov, which he held for 7 days and had to discontinue for health reasons (due to fainting spells and weight loss up to 54 kgs)⁴². After the hunger strike commenced,

38 See The media published an interview with political prisoner Oleksandr Kolchenko (video): <https://www.unian.net/society/1292077-smi-obnarodovali-intervyu-s-politizaklyuchennyim-aleksandrom-kolchenko-video.html>

39 See LetMyPeopleGo, Oleksandr Kolchenko: <http://letmypeoplego.org.ua/uk/prisoner/oleksandr-kolchenko/>

40 See I and nine Muslims were put in solitary confinement on holidays — Kolchenko: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-kolchenko-sazali-v-sshizo-po-prazdnikam/30205430.html>

41 See Kolchenko described how he refused a Russian passport: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-kolchenko-rossijskij-pasport/30266952.html>

42 See Kolchenko stopped the hunger strike. A Ukrainian activist held in the Russian Federation, Oleksandr Kolchenko, said he overestimated his strength, when he declared a hunger strike: <https://gordonua.com/news/crimea/kolchenko-prekratil-golodovku-249809.html>

Oleksandr’s mother said that she had received a call from a representative of the Public Monitoring Commission of the Chelyabinsk Region, who pressed her to persuade her son to discontinue the hunger strike. Oleksandr upon his release stated that, after he started the hunger strike, the prison staff threatened to start searches in the barracks and to inform other prisoners that the searches were held because of Kolchenko. Thus, the prison staff planned to prejudice other prisoners against Oleksandr.

After being released as a result of the exchange of prisoners between Ukraine and the Russian Federation, which took place in September 2019, Oleksandr Kolchenko currently resides in mainland Ukraine.

Oleksii Chyrynii

Oleksii Chyrynii was detained by Russian security forces on May 14, 2014, allegedly for membership in the “Oleh Sentsov terrorist group” (part 2 of article 205.4 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, part 3 of article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). In the summer of 2014, Chyrynii was detained in the psychiatric ward of the Butyrka Prison and the Serbsky Psychiatric Hospital in Moscow, where, with a high degree of probability, psychotropic drugs were administered⁴³. According to the friends of Chyrynii, as a result of these actions, Alex was in a pre-suicidal state of mind⁴⁴. Later, Oleksii Chyrynii was referred to several psychiatric evaluations at the Serbsky hospital, possibly as a result of tortures inflicted during the investigation. In April 2015, the North Caucasus District Military Court sentenced Oleksii Chyrynii to 7 years in a maximum security penal colony.

“Under duress Oleksii Chyrynii incriminated himself and other persons involved in the case, agreed to collaborate with the investigation, and as a result he was tried separately. Subsequently, other defendants in the case were charged based on the “incriminating” evidence provided by Oleksii Chyrynii.

After the conviction, Chyrynii was several times transferred to various penal colonies and pre-trial detention centers (penal colony No.4 in Magadan, pre-trial detention center No. 5 in Rostov-on-Don, penal colony No. 15 in Bataisk). Currently he is serving his sentence in the penal colony No. 9 of the city of Shakhty, Rostov Region.

After the arrest Oleksii for 9 months was kept incommunicado. The procedure of compulsory imposition of the Russian citizenship was applied to him. According to the lawyer, Chyrynii was recognized as a Russian citizen due to the fact that his written renunciation of the Russian citizenship allegedly had not been found. Only in February 2015, the Ukrainian consul visited Oleksii Chyrynii in the Lefortovo pre-trial detention center in Moscow. During the meeting, Chyrynii informed the consul that when he was detained in May 2014, Russian law enforcement officers bet him, tortured, inflicted psychological pressure and threatened in order to obtain the required evidence⁴⁵.

⁴³ See LetMyPeopleGo, Oleksiy Chyrynii: <http://letmypeoplego.org.ua/uk/prisoner/oleksiy-chyrynii/>

⁴⁴ See To a Ukrainian detained in Crimea, methods of punitive psychiatry were applied - activist: <https://www.unian.net/politics/952940-k-zaderjannomu-v-kryimu-ukraintsu-primenyali-metodyi-karatelnoy-psihiatrii-aktivist.html>

⁴⁵ See In Russia a Ukrainian, brought from the Crimea, is being tried, Prosecutor’s office demands 12 years: <https://www.unian.ua/politics/1069726-u-rosiji-sudyat-vivezenogo-z-krimu-ukraijntsy-chirniya-prokuratura-vimagae-12-rokiv.html>

In July 2017, in prison colony No. 15 in the city of Bataysk, Chyrynii's standard regime of detention was substituted by stricter prison regime. It is known that, while in the colony, Chyrynii was placed in solitary confinement at least 4 times under various pretexts. According to Russian lawyer Ilya Novikov, the real reason for the disciplinary measure is Chyrynii's refusal to work in the colony⁴⁶. Since July 2017, Oleksii Chyrynii has been held in the penal colony No. 9 of the city of Shakhty, Rostov Region, in a cell block (incommunicado).

46 See Ilya Novikov, July 26, 2017: <https://www.facebook.com/Ilya.S.Novikov/posts/10208151597947477>

“Hizb ut-Tahrir Cases”

Ruslan Zeitullaiev

Ruslan Zeitullaiev was detained in connection with the Hizb ut-Tahrir Case on January 23, 2015 (part 1 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). First he was held in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, and later he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center. On September 7, 2016, the Russian Military Court in Rostov-on-Don sentenced Zeitullaiev to 7 years in prison. After two appeals in July 2017, the sentence was prolonged to 15 years in prison. During the court hearings, Zeitullaiev went on hunger strike demanding to stop the criminal prosecution of Crimean Tatars under the articles on “terrorism” and “extremism”, to allow representatives of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Ukraine to visit him, as well as to release other persons involved in the “Sevastopol Hizb ut-Tahrir case”. In November 2017, Ruslan Zeitullaiev was transferred to the penal colony No. 2 in the city of Salavat, Republic of Bashkortostan, to serve his sentence. Human Rights Center Memorial declared Zeitullaiev a political prisoner.

At the end of July 2016, immediately after the arrival of Ruslan Zeitullaiev in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, he was placed into solitary confinement for refusing to undress because of his religious beliefs⁴⁷. In February 2017, Zeitullaiev’s lawyers reported that his health condition deteriorated, but Federal Penitentiary Service officers in the Rostov pre-trial detention center refused to give him the required medicine in the detention center, as well as refused to take the package with the required medicine from his relatives⁴⁸. On April 4, 2017, Ruslan Zeitullaiev went on a hunger strike for 22 days. During the court hearing on April 14, he felt extremely unwell, but the medical treatment was not provided⁴⁹. Ruslan began his second hunger strike 19 days after the previous one; it lasted 12–13 days⁵⁰. On July 27, 2017, after the final sentence of 15 years in prison, Ruslan went on a third hunger strike, which ended on August 19 in connection with the transfer to a maximum security colony in the Republic of Bashkortostan⁵¹. Ruslan’s requirements were not met. Due to hunger strikes, Zeitullaiev’s health deteriorated dramatically and significant weight loss occurred. No medical treatment was provided by the staff of the Federal Penitentiary Service. While in the pre-trial detention center, Zeitullaiev was not allowed to meet with the Ukrainian consul for 2 years⁵².

“In November 2017, before the transfer to the penal colony, employees of the Rostov pre-trial detention center took from the political prisoner all his food. Upon arrival at the penal colony No. 2 of the Republic of Bashkortostan, he was immediately placed into sol-

⁴⁷ See A Crimean from the group of four Muslims tried in Rostov, has spent 4 days in solitary confinement — lawyer: <https://ua.krymr.com/a/news/27897612.html>

⁴⁸ See The new trial of the Crimean Muslim Zeitullaiev began: <https://graniru.org/Politics/Russia/Politzeiki/m.258758.html>

⁴⁹ See Zeitullaiev, who went on a hunger strike, was taken ill in the Rostov court: https://zmina.info/ru/news-ru/zeitullajevu_jiakij_ogolosiv_goloduvannija_stalo_zle_u_rostovskomu_sudi/

⁵⁰ See Zeitullaiev stopped the hunger strike because of the fast: <https://www.pravda.com.ua/rus/news/2017/05/28/7145217/>

⁵¹ See Ruslan Zeitullaiev stopped the hunger strike: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/ruslan-zeitullayev-pripiniv-goloduvannya/>

⁵² See Occupants’ first fabrication of the largest criminal case in the Crimea: “Sevastopol group Hizb ut-Tahrir”: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5e28713c7c251/>

itary confinement for dress-code infraction. In April 2018, he was again placed in solitary confinement, allegedly for violating the prison regime.

On July 25, 2018, it became known that FSB officers visited Zeitullaiev in the penal colony and pressed him to testify against Enver Seitosmanov, also accused of membership in the religious organization Hizb ut-Tahrir. FSB officers threatened Ruslan Zeitullaiev with instituting criminal proceedings for refusing to testify.

Emir-Usein Kuku

On April 20, 2015, law enforcement officials of Crimean de-facto authorities detained a Crimean Tatar human rights activist and a member of the Human Rights Contact Group Emir-Usein Kuku. His detention in fact looked like an abduction. On the same day, Kuku was released. After the release he reported bodily harm inflicted while being detained. Kuku showed bruises on the body, as well as the results of a medical examination, which confirmed damage to the head and a kidney bruise⁵³. On February 11, 2016, Emir-Usein Kuku was detained again, that time in connection with the "Hizb ut-Tahrir case" (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). A criminal case was instituted after Kuku refused to "cooperate" with the Russian intelligence. Detention was applied as a preventive measure and he was placed in the pre-trial detention center in Simferopol. Kuku was further charged under art. 278 of the Criminal Code (violent seizure of power). In December 2017, he was transferred to the pre-trial detention center No. 1 in Rostov-on-Don, on December 28, 2018 he was transferred back to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center after the case was reopened for further investigation, and in February 2019 he was again transferred to the pre-trial detention center No. 1 in Rostov-on-Don. On November 12, 2019, Emir-Usein Kuku was sentenced to 12 years in a maximum security penal colony. A month after the conviction, the prisoner was transferred to the pre-trial detention No. 3 in Novocherkassk, Russia. Human Rights Center "Memorial" stated that it considered the criminal prosecution against Kuku politically motivated, and an international human rights organization Amnesty International declared him a "prisoner of conscience".

While in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Kuku repeatedly described unbearable conditions in solitary confinement, reported deterioration of health condition, and also lack of medical treatment. In addition, he was visited at least twice by the same intelligence officer who was trying to recruit Kuku⁵⁴. On the eve of the arrest, the said officer again proposed "cooperation" to the human rights activist, but Emir-Usein refused again.

In July 2016, Emir-Usein Kuku was registered as a "dangerous person under investigation" and transferred to the special block of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center⁵⁵. In addition, on December 8, 2016, the human rights activist had

53 See Crimean human rights activist showed photos of beatings inflicted by the FSB: <https://gordonua.com/news/crimea/y-krymu-rossiyskie-siloviki-otbili-pochku-pravozashchitniku-77499.html>

54 See Amnesty International. Crimea in the dark. The silencing of the dissent. p. 18: https://www.amnesty.org.ua/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Crimea-in-the-Dark-UKR_web-1.pdf

55 See Crimean political prisoner Kuku returned to the pre-trial detention after in-patient psychiatric evaluation <https://graniru.org/Politics/World/Europe/Ukraine/m.257908.html>

to undergo compulsory psychiatric evaluation, during which, according to his wife, psychological pressure was exerted. Kuku said that surveillance cameras were installed even in the toilet, and for the entire period of the psychiatric evaluation he was kept in solitary confinement”⁵⁶.

“FSB officers also exerted pressure on Emir-Usein Kuku via his family members. In particular, after he was placed in solitary confinement, FSB officers visited the school where the minor son of Emir-Usein studied, and exerted pressure on the child, Kuku’s wife was threatened with deprivation of parental rights. For a year and a half, Kuku was not allowed any family visits.

In January 2017, there was information that Emir-Usein had problems with his teeth and knee. In October 2017, he developed a dental abscess, and dental care was urgently needed, however, it turned out that there was not a single dentist in the pre-trial detention center. In addition, according to the wife of Emir-Usein, the cell in which he was held was intended for 8 prisoners, but 11 people resided in it. As a result, Emir-Usein did not have a bunk of his own, and, due to lack of space, was not able to perform religious rites⁵⁷.

Similar violations pertaining to detention conditions were faced by Kuku after the transfer to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. So, in January 2018, lawyer Alexander Popkov said that in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center Emir-Usein Kuku was held in an overcrowded cell (for 17 prisoners there were 8 bunks), hence the prisoners had to sleep in turns⁵⁸.

In June 2018, Kuku, in solidarity with Oleg Sentsov, went on a hunger strike for 23 days. Hunger strikers demanded the release of Ukrainian political prisoners imprisoned on the territory of the occupied Crimea and the Russian Federation⁵⁹. During the hunger strike Emir-Usein lost 11 kgs, he developed kidney pain, had pancreas problems, dizziness, and general feeling of being unwell. Notably, Emir-Usein Kuku did not receive any supportive therapy, and the administration of the Rostov pre-trial detention center No. 1 threatened him that if he continued his hunger strike, he would be transferred to a hospital where contagious patients were treated. At the same time, Kuku’s lawyer Sergey Loktev was not allowed by the pre-trial detention center administration to visit his client, and consequently Loktev lodged a complaint with the prosecutor’s office of the Rostov Region.

In November 2019, the day after the conviction, the administrators of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 placed Kuku in solitary confinement for 15 days because the human rights activist fell asleep in the cell and did not participate in the evening roll-call⁶⁰.

At the end of December 2019, Kuku was transferred to the pre-trial detention center No. 3 in the Russian city of Novocherkassk, where he was immediately

56 See Front Line Defenders, November 13, 2019. Crimea: Emir-Usein Kuku sentenced to 12 years in a maximum security colony: https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/sites/default/files/crimea_-_ua_-_emir_usein_kuku_-_13_nov_2019_ru.pdf

57 See Arrested Crimean human rights activist Emir-Usein Kuku needs medical treatment — relatives: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28806558.html>

58 See “8 bunks for 17 persons”: lawyer met political prisoner Emir-Usein Kuku: <https://investigator.org.ua/news-2/204897/>

59 See Emir-Usein Kuku stopped the hunger strike in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center: <https://www.kavkaz-uzel.eu/articles/323244/>

60 See Two persons involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” were placed in solitary confinement in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center: <https://graty.me/news/dvuh-figurantov-dela-hizb-ut-tahrir-pomestili-v-karczer-v-rostovskom-sizo/>

placed in a special block with especially strict conditions of detention (single cell, round-the-clock video surveillance). Lawyer Nazim Sheikhmambetov stated that because of the low temperature in the cell, Kuku started having kidney problems. A physician at the detention center after visual examination and without any tests concluded that “there were no kidney problems”⁶¹.

Arsen Dzhepparov

On April 17, 2016, in Crimea in the village of Krasnokamianka (Big Yalta), Russian security officials searched and detained a Crimean Tatar Arsen Dzhepparov, who was charged with being a member of the Muslim religious organization Hizb ut-Tahrir (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Later, during the arrest and imprisonment, he was again charged under part 2 of art. 35, part 1, article 30, art. 278 of the Criminal Code (planning the violent seizure of power). As a preventive measure Dzhepparov was placed in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In December 2017, he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center. A year later, on December 28, 2018, Dzhepparov was again transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center as his case was reopened for further investigation and charges were changed, where he spent 2 months until the end of February 2019, when he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 (he stayed there until December 23, 2019). On November 12, 2019, Arsen Dzhepparov was sentenced to 7 years in a maximum security penal colony. Dzhepparov’s lawyer has appealed against the sentence; and currently Dzepparov is being held in the pre-trial detention center No. 4 in the city of Shakhty, Rostov Region of the Russian Federation. Arsen Dzhepparov was declared a political prisoner by Russian Human Rights Center “Memorial”, and a “prisoner of conscience” by an international human rights organization Amnesty International.

After he was detained and before the preventive measure was applied, Dzhepparov was not fed for several days. Throughout the entire time of incarceration, Dzepparov’s lawyer has informed about his client’s serious health condition, refusal to provide medical treatment, ungrounded placement in solitary confinement characterized by inhuman conditions of detention.

“ In the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Arsen Dzhepparov first was placed in a cell together with those charged with rape, then transferred to solitary confinement, from the solitary confinement to the “press cell”, where the pressure was exerted, and after the “press cell” Dzhepparov was again transferred to the cell with inmates charged with rape⁶², In all these cells, Arsen Dzhepparov was not allowed to perform the five daily prayers (namaz). In addition, according to lawyer Emil Kurbedinov, general conditions of detention in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center are extremely unsatisfactory: prisoners happen to find cockroaches in food, the cells are damp, overrun with numerous fleas and bugs, the water supply is periodically cut off, and all Muslim prisoners are given pork, despite the fact that that this is contrary to their religious beliefs.

61 See The Crimean political prisoner Emir-Usein Kuku started having acute kidney problems - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-emir-usein-kuku-problemy-s-pochkami/30433818.html>

62 See LetMyPeopleGo, Arsen Dzhepparov: <http://letmypeoplego.org.ua/uk/prisoner/arsen-dzhepparov/>

On November 24, 2016, Arsen Dzhepparov was referred to a compulsory psychiatric evaluation.

During the detention in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, he had serious health problems: periodically he got abscesses on his body, accompanied by fever, chills, unbearable pain, that required surgical removal to avoid further inflammation. In November 2016, the lawyers managed to arrange surgery outside prison for Arsen, but human rights activists reported that right after the surgery, while under anesthesia, Dzhepparov was placed into the cell, thus he was put at risk of getting sepsis⁶³. In March 2017, the political prisoner lost hearing in one ear as a result of an inflammation, an abscess was formed in the ear, part of the face got swollen, he started having persistent headache. Dzhepparov and his lawyer Dzhemil Temishev many times in writing requested medical examination and treatment, however, administrators of the pre-trial detention center ignored those requests⁶⁴. In April 2017, according to the lawyer, Dzhepparov went to the infirmary asking to treat the abscess, the physician pressed out the contents of the fistula and right after that Arsen was returned to the cell without dressing materials or disinfectants. According to the lawyer, “Arsen was walking and pus was dripping down his leg”⁶⁵.

It is known that several times he was placed in solitary confinement for far-fetched reasons (for example, allegedly for growing a beard, which he did not really have; for allegedly not opening the cell door at the request of the detention staff)⁶⁶. In June 2017, Arsen Dzhepparov asked the head of the infirmary at the Simferopol pre-trial detention center to examine him, as, while in solitary confinement, he got a kidney infection and had severe pain⁶⁷. There was no response neither from the healthcare staff nor the administration of the pre-trial detention center⁶⁸.

The medical treatment was not provided as well after the transfer to the pre-trial detention center No. 1 in Rostov-on-Don. So, in August 2018, lawyer Ayder Azamatov stated that Arsen Dzhepparov’s state of health was critical. Employees of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, according to the lawyer, refused to provide medical treatment to the political prisoner, and ignored the statements about his poor health (Arsen had high blood pressure, severe headaches over the past 7 months, the right side of his head and arm were numb). At the end of September 2018, Ayder Azamatov received a response from the administration of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, which said that medical treatment

63 See. Human rights activists will prepare a certificate on the health status of political prisoners in the occupied Crimea, — Dzhepparov: https://censor.net.ua/news/415873/pravozaschitniki_podgotovlyat_spravku_o_sostoyanii_zdorovya_polituznikov_v_okkupirovannom_krymu_dzhepparov

64 See The health of a detained person involved in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case dramatically deteriorates: https://news.liga.net/politics/news/u_figuranta_dela_khizb_ut_takhrir_v_sizo_rezko_ukhudshaetsya_zdorove; See Dzhepparov involved in the “case of Yalta Muslims” needs surgery — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28459307.html>

65 See The health of a detained person involved in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case dramatically deteriorates: https://news.liga.net/politics/news/u_figuranta_dela_khizb_ut_takhrir_v_sizo_rezko_ukhudshaetsya_zdorove

66 See. In the Crimea, Dzhepparov involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case,” was placed in solitary confinement — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28547023.html>; The person involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” declared threats and a penchant for “cooperation”: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/figurant--spravi-khizb-uttakhrir--zayaviv-pro-pogrozi-i-skhilyannya-do--spivpratsi-/>

67 See Dzhepparov filed an application with a request to examine him a civilian hospital: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/dzhepparov-napisav-zayavu-z-prokhannyam-obstezhiti-iogo-v-tsivilnii-likarni/>

68 See Arsen Dzhepparov was returned from solitary confinement to a prison cell: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/arsena-dzhepparova-povernuli-z-kartseru-v-kameru/>

had not been provided allegedly because Dzhapparov had not requested it⁶⁹. In April 2019, Ayder Azamatov announced⁷⁰, that Arsen Dzhapparov stayed in the cell with people infected with HIV, tuberculosis and other contagious diseases, as well as with repeat offenders. Moreover, there were 10 prisoners in a 30 square meter cell, due to deterioration of plumbing water and faeces were leaking, the cell was humid and damp, had insanitary conditions, was overrun with insects, even the light was not switched off during the night. Later, after repeated complaints, Dzhapparov was transferred to another cell.

At the end of December 2019, Arsen Dzhapparov was transferred to the pre-trial detention center No. 4 in the city of Shakhty, Rostov Region. According to the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova, Dzhapparov complains of poor conditions at the detention center: non-compliance with the temperature regime, insanitary conditions, lack of ventilation and insufficient natural light in the cell⁷¹. In January 2020, it became known that Arsen Dzhapparov had inflamed furuncles behind his ear (minor surgery was required), that could have led to sepsis. The paramedic at the pre-trial detention center refused to treat the boils, stating that as Dzhapparov had appealed the sentence, due to possible legal proceedings he could be transferred somewhere else at any time⁷². Arsen Dzhapparov's lawyer lodged complaints with the Prosecutor General's Office of Russia, the Rostov Region's Prosecutor's Office and the Main Directorate of the Federal Penitentiary Service of Russia in the Rostov Region⁷³. However, medical treatment was provided only a few weeks later, after the visit of members of the Public Monitoring Commission of the Russian Federation⁷⁴.

Memet Bielialov

Memet Bielialov, an activist of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative, was detained along with five other Crimean Tatars on charges of being a member of Hizb ut-Tahrir on October 11, 2017 (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Later, the charges were changed to organizing a Hizb ut-Tahrir cell, and an additional charge of attempting to seize the power was imposed (article 278 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After the arrest, Bielialov, as well as other detainees in his case, were taken away with bags over their heads in cars without license plates. After the application of the preventive measure Memet Bielialov was held in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In early October 2019, he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. On September 16, 2020, Memet Bielialov was sentenced to 18 years in

69 See Critical Condition. The Russian pre-trial detention center responded to complaints about the failure to provide medical assistance to the person involved in the "Hizb ut-Tahrir case": <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-kriticheskoe-sostijanie-sizo-otvetilo-advokatu-na-zhaloby-po-djepparovu/29516522.html>

70 See Ayder Azamatov, April 12, 2019: https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=2631598776914260&id=100001924915540

71 See Denisova calls for influencing Russia to respect the rights of Crimean political prisoners: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-denisova-politzakluchennim-krymchanam-ne-okazivajut-pomostch-/30426572.html>

72 See Ayder Azamatov, January 17, 2020: <https://www.facebook.com/100001924915540/posts/3416515188422611/?d=n>

73 See Ayder Azamatov, January 20, 2020: https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=3425488674191929&id=100001924915540

74 See Crimean Dzhapparov was provided medical treatment in the Russian pre-trial detention center after the arrival of members of the PMC — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-rossijskom-sizo-krymchaninu-dzhepparovu-proveli-operacyju/30402172.html>

a maximum security penal colony. He was declared a political prisoner by Russian Human Rights Center Memorial.

On October 11, 2017, detained Memet Bielialov was taken to temporary detention facility in Bakhchisaray. The day after the application of the preventive measure, he was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. His wife reported⁷⁵, that Memet had stomach aches due to the quality of food provided in the pre-trial detention center, and his teeth began crumbling. No medical treatment was provided. There were 22 persons in Bielialov's cell, while only 18 bunks were available. Thus, they had to sleep in turns. There were also cockroaches and bedbugs.

“While in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1, on days of court hearings, Memet Bielialov, as well as other persons involved in his case, were given by the detention center staff spoiled packed lunches containing moldy food⁷⁶, as well as pork, which Bielialov does not eat for religious reasons. At the same time, the judge of the Southern District Military Court in Rostov-on-Don refused to issue a private ruling against Mr. Guryanov, the head of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center.⁷⁷ Notably, on court hearing days prisoners leave the detention center before breakfast and return after dinner. Thus, on the days of court hearings, Memet Bielialov practically starves.

In early March 2020, the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative reported that Memet Bielialov had a fever of 40°C. As a result, an ambulance was called right during the court hearing. It is reported that after the examination paramedic I. Gritsenko concluded that Bielialov had viral infection with such symptoms as fever, muscle pain, general feeling of being unwell⁷⁸. At the same time, the paramedic said that the court hearing could proceed. It should be noted that in the context of the COVID-19 virus pandemic declared by the World Health Organization in March 2020, prisoners are at a high risk of getting infected with COVID-19. However, the Federal Penitentiary Service of the Russian Federation does not test prisoners for the presence of COVID-19, even those with symptoms of coronavirus.

Ernes Ametov

On October 11, 2017, six Crimean Tatars were detained in Bakhchysarai on charges of being members of the Islamic political party Hizb ut-Tahrir (articles 205.1–205.2 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). The detentions were carried out after searches, all the detainees were taken away with bags over their heads on buses without license plates. One of the detainees was Ernes Ametov, activist of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative. In February 2019, he, as well as other persons involved in the case, was additionally charged with an alleged attempt to seize power by force (art. 278 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After the application of the preventive measure, Ametov was detained in the

⁷⁵ See Crimean Solidarity, May 10, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/838741406493317>

⁷⁶ See The defendants in the Bakhchysarai “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” were given packed lunches that expired during the previous court hearing — lawyers: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-delo-knizb-ut-takhrir-sukhpajki/30454695.html>

⁷⁷ See The defendants in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case in the Russian pre-trial detention center were given pack lunches with mold and pork in Russian SIZO — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurantam-dela-khizb-ut-tahrir-vydali-suhpaek-s-plesenju-i-svininoj/30295754.html>

⁷⁸ See “The Hizb ut-Tahrir Case”: an ambulance was called for the accused Crimeans in a Russian court: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-rostov-krymchanam-v-sud-vyzvali-medikov/30468248.html>

Simferopol pre-trial detention center. On September 12, 2019, Ametov's relatives learned that he had been transferred from the Simferopol pre-trial detention center to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. On September 16, 2020, Ernes Ametov was acquitted and released in the courtroom. Human Rights Center Memorial declared Ernes Ametov a political prisoner.

In August 2018, the lawyer of Ernes Ametov, Ayder Azamatov, reported that in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center he was transferred from a regular cell to a cell with worse conditions of detention (the “special block”). The cell measurements were 2.5 m by 3.5 m, there was practically no natural light, totally unsanitary conditions, bedbugs and cockroaches. In addition to Ametov, there was another prisoner in the cell, thus, the area per person was 3 sq.m. Ametov said that, in his opinion, the transfer to the worst cell was connected to his religious beliefs (Ernes is a practicing Muslim)⁷⁹. In the same month, Ametov's lawyer stated that his health condition had significantly deteriorated.

On November 25, 2018, Ernes Ametov was placed in solitary confinement, in a special “block”, characterized by most severe conditions of detention and complete isolation.

After the transferal to Rostov-on-Don, Ernes Ametov was registered and placed in solitary confinement, in a “special block”. According to his lawyer Nazim Sheikhmambetov, most likely, the registration procedure was not followed, as in accordance with the law this procedure involves certain actions (for example, interview with prisoners) that were not performed⁸⁰.

“Ametov was kept in a cell, where 3 sq.m. are available per prisoner and round-the-clock video surveillance is maintained⁸¹. There is practically no natural light, hence it is impossible to read and write, there is no ventilation, there are cockroaches. Moreover, another prisoner, with whom Ernes Ametov was kept in the cell, is a smoker (Ernes Ametov does not smoke). Dietary requirements in the pre-trial detention center do not take into account religious beliefs of prisoners, fish, fruits, vegetables are not provided at all, some food is not suitable for consumption. In the cell there is no space and conditions for performing religious rites. In addition, according to lawyer Ayder Azamatov, upon arrival at the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, all medicines were taken from his client, while in the detention infirmary only painkillers are available.

During the detention in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 on days of court hearings, Ernes Ametov, as well as other persons involved in the case, were regularly given by the detention center staff spoiled packed lunches containing moldy food⁸², as well as pork, which Ametov does not eat for religious reasons. At the same time, the judge of the Southern District Military Court in Rostov-on-Don refuses to issue a private ruling against Mr. Guryanov, the head

79 See Ayder Azamatov, August 9, 2018: https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=2139972192743590&id=100001924915540

80 See In the Russian pre-trial detention center they do not comply with the procedure for registering persons involved in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-rossijskom-sizo-profuchet-figuranty-khizb-ut-tahrir/30275462.html>

81 The information was provided based on data received by NGO CrimeaSOS in December 2019.

82 See The defendants in the Bakhchysarai “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” were given packed lunches that expired during the previous court hearing — lawyers: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-delo-knizb-ut-takhrir-sukhpajki/30454695.html>

of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center⁸³. It is worth noting that on court hearing days prisoners leave the detention center before breakfast and return after dinner. Thus, on the days of court hearings, Ernes Ametov practically starved. In addition, he said that he was usually brought to the court building in a portable containment cell (so-called “glass”), measuring 50/65/180 cm.

Marlen Asanov

Marlen Asanov, an activist of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative and the owner of the Salachyk cafe, which hosted meetings of Crimean Solidarity, was detained on October 11, 2017. Asanov was charged with organizing a cell of the Islamic religious organization Hizb ut-Tahrir (part 1 of article 205.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After he was detained, Russian law enforcement officers transported Asanov with a bag over his head. After the application of the preventive measure, he was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In February 2019, while in the detention center, he was charged with preparing for the violent seizure of power (article 278 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). In September 2019, Marlen Asanov was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No.1. On September 16, 2020, Marlen Asanov was sentenced to 19 years in a maximum security penal colony. Russian Human Rights Center Memorial stated that this case was politically motivated. In 2017, after the arrest, Asanov was awarded annual volunteer award from “Euromaidan SOS”.

“ In October 2018, lawyer Emil Kurbedinov reported⁸⁴, that due to the conditions in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Marlen Asanov’s teeth began to crumble. Over the course of several months, he repeatedly applied for dental treatment. However, the administration of the pre-trial detention center did not provide treatment in the detention infirmary, as well as did not allow the dentist from Bakhchisaray, who was ready to come there and treat Asanov, to enter the detention center. In addition, the administration of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center falsified medical records by stating that the treatment allegedly had been provided to Marlen Asanov.

After the transfer to Rostov-on-Don, Marlen Asanov was registered and placed in solitary confinement, in a special block. According to his lawyer Nazim Sheikhmambetov, most likely, the registration procedure was not followed, as in accordance with the law this procedure involves certain actions (for example, interviews with prisoners) that were not performed⁸⁵. In the special block where Asanov is kept round-the-clock video surveillance is maintained. The cell in which he is being held together with another inmate measures 2 by 3 meters. Thus, in order for one person to pass, another must sit on the bed and raise his legs⁸⁶. There are cockroaches in the cell. In addition, Marlen Asanov said that the

83 See The defendants in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case in the Russian pre-trial detention center were given pack lunches with mold and pork - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurantam-dela-khizb-ut-tahrir-vydali-suhpaek-s-plesenju-i-svininoj/30295754.html>

84 See Crimean Solidarity, June 5, 2018: <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?ref=external&v=342482339831035>

85 See The Russian pre-trial detention center in case of persons involved in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case does not comply with the preventive registration procedure — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-rossijskom-sizo-profuchet-figuranty-khizb-ut-tahrir/30275462.html>

86 See Crimean Solidarity, November 29, 2019: https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/988961964804593?__tn__=K-R

administration of the detention center presses him to shave his beard (although the internal regulations does not contain such a rule).

Marlen Asanov's wife informed that her husband had health problems. In particular, he had knee pain (knee arthrosis), problems with teeth (the infirmary physician stated that dental treatments could not be provided in the pre-trial detention center). In February 2020, lawyer Emil Kurbedinov reported that Marlen Asanov started having kidney problems and varicose veins. Asanov in writing requested medical examination and treatment. However, the infirmary paramedic prescribed him medicines without any tests. As a result, Asanov is afraid to take medicines, as he reasonably fears that they can harm him. According to Marlen Asanov, the administration of the detention center does not allow his medical examination on purpose⁸⁷.

During his stay in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 on days of court hearings, Marlen Asanov, as well as other persons involved in the case, are regularly given by the detention center staff spoiled packed lunches containing moldy food⁸⁸, as well as pork, which Asanov does not eat for religious reasons. At the same time, the judge of the Southern District Military Court in Rostov-on-Don refuses to issue a private ruling against Mr. Guryanov, the head of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center⁸⁹. It is worth noting that on court hearing days prisoners leave the detention center before breakfast and return after dinner. Thus, on the days of court hearings, Marlen Asanov practically starves.

Enver Seitosmanov

Enver Seitosmanov, a Crimean Tatar, civic activist and cousin of political prisoner Nuri Primov (a defendant in the "Hizb ut-Tahrir Case"), was detained in connection with the "Hizb ut-Tahrir Case" (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation) on May 10, 2018. He was taken to the temporary detention facility in Sevastopol, and later transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In July 2019, before the hearing on the merits of the case, Seitosmanov was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center. On December 5, 2019, he was sentenced to 17 years in a maximum security penal colony and 1 year supervised release. At the end of December 2019, it became known that Seitosmanov had been transferred to serve his sentence in an unknown location. In February 2020, a lawyer visited him in a pre-trial detention center in Taganrog. Russian Human Rights Center Memorial declared Enver Seitosmanov a political prisoner.

In November 2018, the lawyer of Enver Seitosmanov said that his client's health condition had deteriorated. Throughout his entire stay at the Simferopol pre-trial detention center medical treatment was not provided. In addition, according to

⁸⁷ See The person involved in the Bakhchisaray "Hizb ut-Tahrir case" worsened health in the pre-trial detention center — the lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-hizb-ut-tahrir-zdorovie-sizo/30427368.html>

⁸⁸ See The defendants in the Bakhchisaray "Hizb ut-Tahrir case" were given pack lunches that expired during the previous court hearing — lawyers: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-delo-knizb-ut-tahrir-sukhpajki/30454695.html>

⁸⁹ See the defendants in the Hizb ut-Tahrir case in the Russian pre-trial detention center were given pack lunches with mold and pork — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurantam-dela-khizb-ut-tahrir-vydali-suhpaek-s-plesenju-i-svininoj/30295754.html>

the information of the defenders of Enver Seitosmanov, he was detained in cells where the number of prisoners exceeded the number of available bunks.

In February 2019, the administration of the pre-trial detention center performed preventive registration of Seitosmanov⁹⁰. In addition, the administration wrote an extremely negative opinion about Seitosmanov, that was included into the case file⁹¹. According to his lawyer Emil Kurbedinov, this was done as a revenge for numerous complaints on the conditions of detention that he and his client had filed.

According to the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova⁹², in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center Enver Seitosmanov complained of non-compliance with the temperature regime and basic sanitary requirements, lack of ventilation and insufficient natural light in the cell.

“According to the lawyer Edem Semedlyayev⁹³, in the Taganrog detention center in Enver’s cell there is neither sunlight, as welded metal plates cover the whole window, nor hot water.

Server Mustafaiev

The coordinator of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative, a Crimean Tatar Server Mustafaiev, was detained in connection with the second Bakhchisaray “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” on May 21, 2018 (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). On the next day, the de facto Kiev district court of Simferopol applied the preventive measure of detention, and on the same day Mustafaiev was brought to the Simferopol detention center. In February 2019, another criminal case was instituted against the human rights activist for allegedly “attempting to seize power by force” (article 278 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). In September 2019, Server Mustafaiev was transferred from the Simferopol pre-trial detention center; during the transportation, he spent one month in the pre-trial detention center No. 1 in Krasnodar. On November 8, 2019, the human rights activist was brought to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1, where he has been detained till present. On September 16, 2020, Server Mustafaiev was sentenced to 14 years in a maximum security penal colony. The international human rights organization Amnesty International declared Mustafaiev a “prisoner of conscience”, and Russian Human Rights Center “Memorial” declared him a political prisoner⁹⁴.

Between December 2018 and January 2019, Server Mustafaiev spent 28 days in Ward No. 15 of the Crimean Republican Psychiatric Hospital No. 1 where compulsory psychiatric evaluation was conducted⁹⁵.

90 See Crimean Human Rights Group, February 4, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/crimeahrg/posts/2241773539441608>

91 CSee “Officials” of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center No. 1 retaliate against prisoners for complaining by writing negative prisoners’ opinions — lawyer: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5da7158a7e717/>

92 See Denisova calls for influencing Russia to respect the rights of Crimean political prisoners: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-denisova-politzakluchennim-krymchanam-ne-okazivajut-pomostch-/30426572.html>

93 See Lawyer about the Russian Taganrog pre-trial detention center: “Crimeans are detained their in torture conditions”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-sizo-taganrog-krymchane/30424185.html>

94 See “Memorial” declared 11 Crimeans political prisoners persecuted for participating in Hizb ut-Tahrir: https://memohrc.org/ru/news_old/memorial-priznal-politzaklyuchyonnyimi-11-krymchan-presleduemyh-za-uchastie-v-hizb-ut-tahrir

95 See The coordinator of the NGO “Crimean Solidarity” Mustafaiev is transferred to a psychiatric clinic — Gemadzhi:

While in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, pressure was exerted on Server Mustafaiev. In mid-January 2019, the prisoner was placed in a special block of the pre-trial detention center. Mustafaiev spent 58 days in a cell with round the clock video surveillance (during this period Edem Bekirov, another political prisoner, stayed in the same cell with him)⁹⁶. In addition, due to the fungus and poor sanitary conditions, Mustafayev and Edem Bekirov developed allergies⁹⁷.

Also, according to the lawyer Lilia Gemedzi, Server Mustafaiev was preventively registered for alleged propaganda of extremism in a way violating the Russian legislation. In May 2019, a search was conducted in Mustafayev's cell, as a result of which the administration seized his Koran and notebooks, which contained quotes from his case file and other information necessary to exercise the right to defense⁹⁸. Despite complaints filed by the lawyer, the notebooks were never returned.

An incident was documented when, with the facilitation of detention administrators, Mustafaiev was escorted to the court hearing together with prisoners with suspected measles. Thus, Server Mustafaiev was deliberately put at risk of contracting the disease.⁹⁹

“ In September 2019, Server Mustafaiev was taken out of the Simferopol detention center in order to be transported to Rostov-on-Don. Mustafaiev's wife reported¹⁰⁰, that he, like other prisoners, was transported in a half-sitting position in a portable confinement cell called “glass” (measuring 50/65/180 cm), which was very stuffy, to the first transit destination (pre-trial detention center No. 1 in Krasnodar, the distance between Simferopol and Krasnodar is about 450 km). During the entire trip only 2 stops were made, each lasting 15 minutes.

In the Krasnodar pre-trial detention center No. 1 he spent a month and a half in inhuman conditions. In particular, the human rights activist spent almost a month in solitary confinement, in a cell measuring just 4 square meters. Hot and cold water were almost never available, the bedding was dirty, and the contents of the sewage system periodically flooded the entire floor through the toilet, which was a hole in the floor. In addition, on some days, he was actually starving, since, as a practicing Muslim, he could not eat pork, and packages from relatives were forbidden. Also, staff of the Krasnodar pre-trial detention center seized Mustafaiev's medicines¹⁰¹. In response to the complaint, the Prosecutor's office of the Krasnodar Territory of the Russian Federation admitted¹⁰² violations in connection with Mustafaiev's

<https://krymsos.com/ru/news/koordinatora-go--krimska-solidarnist--mustafayeva-etapuyut-v-psikhiatrichnu-kliniku-gemedzhi/>

96 See Political Prisoner Mustafaiev: 58 days under video surveillance and illegal examination of extremism: krymsos.com/ru/news/polityyazen-mustafayev-58-dniv-pid-videosposterezhenyiam-i-nezakonna-ekspertiza-na-ekstremizm/

97 See Bekirov and Mustafaiev have developed an allergic reaction in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center — Denisova: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-u-bekirova-i-mustafaeva-poyavilas-allergicheskaya-reaktsiya/29755209.html>

98 See Valuable notes were seized, the right to defense was violated: prison guards searched the cell of political prisoner Mustafaiev — lawyer: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/vilucheno-tsinni-zapisi-porusheno-pravo-na-zakhist-siloviki-obshukali-kameru-polityyaznya-mustafayeva-advokat/>

99 See Administration of the pre-trial detention center intentionally exposes Server Mustafaiev to risk of measles — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-sizo-server-mustafayev-kor/30020125.html>

100 See Crimean Solidarity, October 26, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/crimeansolidarity/posts/958931807807609>

101 See Political prisoner Mustafaiev, the occupants seized medicines during the transportation to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5dd2572836b92/>

102 See Russia acknowledged violations during the detention of a political prisoner Mustafaiev: <https://www.ukrinform.ua/>

detention in a cell with less than 4 square meters available per prisoner, as well as his placement in solitary confinement. The remaining complaints were declared ungrounded. In addition, the Prosecutor's office stated that the Russian law does not provide grounds for the substitution of pork products in case of those who do not eat pork for religious reasons.

Since November 3, 2019, Server Mustafaiev has been detained in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention No. 1. Upon arrival at the detention center, the political prisoner was immediately quarantined and later placed in a special block as a person allegedly registered for propaganda of extremism. In Mustafaiev's cell there is a video camera, rusty water tasting metallic flows from the tap. There is no room for performance of Muslim rituals on the territory of the detention center; religious beliefs are not taken into account in dietary requirements. Also, according to other prisoners, there are so-called “press chambers” on the territory of the pre-trial detention center, where detention center staff and Russian law enforcement officials coerce prisoners into self-incrimination or make them incriminate others, by exerting psychological pressure. Reportedly, such cells officially do not exist.

On the days of court hearings, prisoners cannot eat at the detention center, hence FSIN staff provides them with packed lunches. However, according to the lawyer, the packed lunches given to Mustafaiev and other persons involved in his case in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, consist of cookies with mold and pork pate (Mustafaiev does not eat pork for religious reasons)¹⁰³. In addition, often provided packed lunches contained products that passed their expiration date long ago. It should be noted that the organization of the provision of pack lunches of appropriate quality is the responsibility of the Main Directorate of the Federal Penitentiary Service.

According to Server Mustafaiev's mother, during the meeting with her son detention staff disconnected the telephone (during the meeting they could communicate only via phone) due to the fact that they spoke in the native Crimean Tatar language¹⁰⁴.

The political prisoner wrote to the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova, complaining that too intensive court hearing schedule prevented him from exercising his right to medical care in the pre-trial detention, from taking a shower and taking a walk in the open air in accordance with existing standards¹⁰⁵.

On March 4, 2020, it became known that Server Mustafaiev was brought to a court hearing with symptoms of a respiratory illness (fever, dry cough, severe headache, physical weakness). A similar situation took place on March 19. Due to poor health condition, he had to lie down while waiting for the court hearing to begin. Server asked the judge to request an examination, including testing for presence of

rubric-crimea/2861683-u-rosii-viznali-porusheniya-pri-utrimanii-v-sizo-politvazna-mustafaeva.html

103 See “Formal food” — pork pate and moldy cookies: packed lunches given to political prisoners in the pre-trial detention center not suitable for eating: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5dd525d151468/>

104 See “You spoke your native language, so we turned them off”: an employee of the pre-trial detention center turned off telephones during the meeting of political prisoner Mustafaiev with his mother: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5df359beda98d/>; “Two hours of a meeting instead of the prescribed three, a broken phone and a ban on speaking the native language: the wife of political prisoner Mustafaiev speaks about the meeting with her husband in the pre-trial detention center in Rostov-on-Don: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5e380a00ea4cf/>

105 See Lyudmila Denisova, March 3, 2020: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/posts/3504356062970451>

COVID-19, and necessary treatment. However, such requests were not made by the judge¹⁰⁶. Several days later, the condition of the political prisoner worsened. The Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova and an international human rights organization Amnesty International appealed to the Russian authorities with a request to provide Mustafaiev with medical treatment¹⁰⁷, and the Ukrainian Foreign Ministry also expressed its protest. As of the end of March 2020, Mustafaiev had not been diagnosed, medical treatment had not been provided, and the prisoner had not been isolated, as a result of what he infected several cellmates¹⁰⁸. However, on March 25, Mustafaiev's condition improved, and there were no longer any symptoms of acute respiratory illness. According to his lawyer Lilia Gemedzhi, in March the head of the infirmary at the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 Mrs. Sinyugina several times issued a phony certificate, confirming Mustafaiev's allegedly satisfactory health condition. Such certificates were issued regardless of ambulance visits during which the presence of symptoms was confirmed.

It is worth noting that due to long stay in dim lighting conditions Server Mustafaiev started having problems with his eyesight¹⁰⁹.

Dzhemil Gafarov

Dzhemil Gafarov, a Crimean Tatar, was detained in connection with the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” on March 27, 2019 (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Gafarov was detained in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1 and on October 28, 2019, he was transferred to the pre-trial detention center in Simferopol, where he is being held currently. He was declared a political prisoner by Human Rights Center Memorial.

“Dzhemil Gafarov has the 3rd degree of disability, stage 4 chronic kidney disease (out of 5) and various types of heart diseases. During the detention in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, at the request of his lawyer Rifat Yakhin, Gafarov underwent a medical examination twice (according to Russian legislation, his medical condition should preclude his detention in the pre-trial detention center). However, according to Yakhin, healthcare staff concluded that Gafarov's medical conditions did not preclude his detention.”

It is worth noting that after the first examination, the lawyer pressed charges against the head of the pre-trial detention center, due to lengthy consideration of the request for examination and subsequent examination's poor quality. Hence, the second examination was carried out in the hospital, but the conclusion was similar. According to Rifat Yakhin, in the hospital Dzhemil Gafarov was accompanied by nine Federal Penitentiary Service officers (some in bulletproof vests, helmets and armed with machine guns), and was handcuffed to a bed,

106 See Lyudmila Denisova, March 19, 2020.: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/posts/3559307444141979>

107 See Amnesty International Ukraine, The action on urgent assistance to Server Mustafaiev (accessed on 9.04.2020): <https://www.amnesty.org.ua/uamustafaev/>

108 See Taras Ibragimov, “One's getting ill may mean a tragedy for everyone”: are Crimean prisons and pre-trial detention centers ready for the coronavirus pandemic?: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/gotovy-li-krymskie-turmy-i-sizo-k-epidemii-koronavirusa/30507125.html>

109 See “The Hizb ut-Tahrir Case”: Crimeans in the pre-trial detention center started having vision problems - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-sizo-uhudshaetsa-zrenie/30440836.html>

consequently, hospital doctors were afraid even to approach him. Thus, the examination was conducted in a biased way¹¹⁰.

In September 2019, it became known that Dzhemil Gafarov's health continued to deteriorate: his legs got swollen, and gout developed. The detention center staff selectively handed him required medicines provided by his relatives. His lawyer Rifat Yakhin stated that Gafarov's medical condition was critical.

After the transfer to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center in late October 2019, Federal Penitentiary Service employees completely refused to accept medicines from Gafarov's relatives, arguing either that under the guise of medicines illegal drugs could be handed in, or that there were no medical indications (although the medicines were actually prescribed during the examinations). In addition, the request for Gafarov's transfer to the hospital was denied¹¹¹.

In November 2019, due to the lack of medical examination, Gafarov's lawyer Rifat Yakhin pressed charges, that time against the head of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, as well as petitions to the prosecutor's office and the Public Monitoring Commission of the Russian Federation. Later, the claims were partially met, as the inaction of Berezhnuy, the head of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, that manifested in the failure to examine the request for a medical examination within the statutory period, was ruled illegal by the court¹¹².

In December 2019, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova appealed¹¹³ to her Russian counterpart, Tatyana Moskalkova, demanding the medical treatment of Gafarov. In her appeal, Denisova indicated that his kidney disease had exacerbated, he had problems with the intestines, heart and ear, had had persistent cough for several weeks, and that, despite the visit to the infirmary, he did not receive any medical treatment. In his letter Dzhemil Gafarov wrote that his medical condition was aggravated by the cold in the cell, and that he had lost hearing in one ear¹¹⁴. Later it became known that Gafarov in fact was taken to the hospital for examination. However, employees of the Federal Penitentiary Service informed journalists that Gafarov's condition was satisfactory and there was no need for any medical treatment¹¹⁵. In addition, the political prisoner's lawyer informed that after the charges against the head of the pre-trial detention center, Gafarov was transferred to a cell, where the conditions were even worse and that due to the lack of space in the cell he was unable to perform his religious rites¹¹⁶.

In February 2020, the de facto Crimean Ombudsman Larisa Opanasyuk stated that she allegedly had visited Dzhemil Gafarov and he had not needed any medical

110 See The person involved in the Simferopol “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” is in critical condition - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurant-simferopolskogo-dela-hizb-ut-tahrir-nahoditsa-v-kriticheskom-sostoyanii/30183697.html>

111 See In the Simferopol pre-trial detention center required medicines are not handed over to Gafarov, who is involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurantu-dela-khizb-ut-tahrir-ne-peredaut-lekarstva-v-sizo/30265002.html>

112 See The Crimean court partially met lawyer's claims, ruling against the Simferopol pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-jahin-isk-k-sizo-simferopolja/30434165.html>

113 See Lyudmila Denisova, December 6, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/photos/a.708811965858222/3224107227662004/?type=3&theater>

114 See “He's been gradually killed.” Lawyer speaks on the health of Gafarov, who is involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-sostoyanie-zdorovja-dzhemilya-gafarova-uhudshaetsa/30309841.html>

115 See Russian prison administration claims that Crimean Gafarov does not need medical treatment: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-fsin-rossii-dzhemil-gafarov/30404142.html>

116 See The administrators of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center violate the right to religion — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-sizo-simferopolya-narushautsya-prava-na-veroispovedaniye/30384736.html>

treatment. Gafarov’s lawyer denied that Opanasyuk’s visit had taken place. On February 27, 2020, the medical commission of the Federal Penitentiary Service concluded that the prisoner had not the 3rd but the 2nd degree of disability. In addition, his lawyer informed that administrators of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center did not take Gavarov’s disability documentation from the Bureau of Medical and Social Expertise on purpose, making impossible appealing the decision on a preventive measure. On January 28, 2020, Ukrainian human rights organizations launched a campaign for solidarity with Dzhemil Gafarov.

Servet Haziiev

60-year-old Servet Haziiev was detained on March 27, 2019 in Simferopol on charges of being a member of the Islamic political party Hizb ut-Tahrir (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). He was detained during the FSB special operation. After the application of the preventive measure, Haziiev was brought to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, and at the end of October 2019 he was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In March 2020, he was additionally charged with Art. 278 of the Criminal Code (planning violent seizure of power). Servet Haziiev was declared a political prisoner by Human Rights Center Memorial.

“At the beginning of May 2019, after a month-and-a-half stay in the Rostov-on-Don detention center, Servet Haziiev’s health seriously deteriorated (persistent abdominal pain, burning sensation in his chest). Only painkillers were provided by the detention infirmary. Nevertheless, according to his lawyer Alexander Stasyuk, Servet Haziiev twice approached detention administrators requesting a medical examination, without any subsequent response¹¹⁷. Hence, the lawyer filed a petition with the Federal Penitentiary Service, with the detention infirmary and with the Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman) of the Rostov Region of the Russian Federation. Later the examination was carried out, but detention center officials did not provide adequate treatment (only painkillers were injected).

Due to health problems Servet Haziiev had difficulty getting up and actively participating in court hearings. On November 5, Lyudmila Denisova, the Verkhovna Rada Commissioner for Human Rights (Ukrainian Ombudman), stated that Servet Haziiev needed urgent hospitalization¹¹⁸. He had severe pain in the intestines, chest, high blood pressure. In addition, Haziiev had leg problems.

In addition, on the days of court hearings the Simferopol pre-trial detention center administrators, where Haziiev is currently detained, do not give packed lunches to him and other defendants. Thus, on the days of court hearings political prisoners practically starve¹¹⁹. In the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, similarly to the Rostov pre-trial detention center, Haziiev does not receive any medical treatment.

¹¹⁷ See Servet Haziiev, who was arrested after mass searches in the Crimea, does not receive medical treatment in the pre-trial detention center — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-arestovannomu-posle-massovyh-obyskov-v-krymu-servetu-gazievu-ne-okazyvaut-medpomosh-v-sizo/29929159.html>

¹¹⁸ See Crimean political prisoners in Russia need urgent hospitalization — Denisova: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-zdorovie-polituznikov-uhudshaetsa-denisova/30253760.html>

¹¹⁹ See The pre-trial detention center does not give packed lunches, political prisoners are made to starve when attending court hearings — lawyers about the Hizb ut-Tahrir case (Second Simferopol Group): <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5dc974e645b72/>

Tofik Abdulhaziiiev and Remzi Bekirov

Tofik Abdulhaziiiev, an activist of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative, and Remzi Bekirov, a citizen journalist, were detained on March 27, 2019 (“Hizb ut-Tahrir Case”, part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). While Remzi Bekirov was being detained in Rostov-on-Don, officers of the Russian security forces beat him, and then drove him around Simferopol for about 24 hours, while being handcuffed. After the application of the preventive measure, Tofik Abdulhaziiiev was transferred to a pre-trial detention center in Shakhty, Rostov Region, and Remzi Bekirov to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 4. Both were transported on an airplane and were not allowed to raise their heads during the whole trip. In September 2019, Abdulhaziiiev and Bekirov were transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center in connection with investigative procedures. In March 2020, they were additionally charged with planning the violent seizure of power (art. 278 of the Criminal Code). Both of them were declared political prisoners by Human Rights Center Memorial.

In September 2019, lawyer Emil Kurbedinov reported¹²⁰, that during the transferal from Shakhty to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Abdulhaziiiev spent some time in the pre-trial detention center of the city of Krasnodar in a cell measuring 4.5 square meters, where about 50 inmates were simultaneously held. On some bunks 7-8 people slept. There were unsanitary conditions and oxygen was lacking. In addition, Abdulhaziiiev said that he was transported together with another political prisoner, Remzi Bekirov, who, immediately upon the arrival at the detention center, was placed in solitary confinement cell measuring 50 sq. cm. There was water on the floor, the cell was overrun with mice, and Bekirov could not neither sleep nor move.

“After the arrival in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Abdulhaziiiev and Bekirov were placed in the “quarantine”, i.e. a basement room that had a dome ceiling. In the middle of the cell the height of the dome was just above human height. The toilet measured about 50 sq. cm, requiring one to turn sideways to enter, and it was flooded with sewer water. The detention center officials told Remzi Bekirov that he and Abdulhaziiiev had been placed in the basement, because they were “terrorists”. In addition, during the transfer, Tofik Abdulhaziiiev fell ill, got a fever of 40°C, but Federal Penitentiary Service employees refused to provide him with medical treatment. He was given medicines by other prisoners.

On November 28, 2019, Remzi Bekirov was admitted to the Crimean Republican Psychiatric Hospital No. 1 for compulsory psychiatric evaluation. His lawyer Edem Samedlyayev said that in the hospital Bekirov was under constant surveillance, which greatly depressed him. On December 20, 2019, Tofik Abdulhaziiiev was referred for compulsory psychiatric evaluation.

On January 13, 2020, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova reported that while in the pre-trial detention center Abdulhaziiiev had sepsis caused by the unsanitary conditions in the cell¹²¹. There were numerous bugs and fleas in

120 See Emil Kurbedinov, September 10, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/emil.kurbedinov/videos/2563906093673972/>

121 See In Crimea, a person involved in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case” had sepsis — Denisova: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurant-simferopolskogo-dela-hizb-ut-tahrir-zarazhenie-krovi-sizo/30374889.html>

the cell, and their bites led to the development of purulent wounds. The political prisoner did not receive any medical treatment. Hence, Ms. Denisova appealed to the Russian Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman) Tatyana Moskalkova. At the same time, Federal Penitentiary Service officials refused to confirm Abdulhaziev's diagnosis of sepsis and he is staying in the same cell.

Tofik Abdulhaziev and Remzi Bekirov, like other defendants in the case, starve on the days of court hearings as the Simferopol pre-trial detention center does not provide them with packed lunches (they leave the pre-trial detention center before breakfast and return after dinner).

Bilial Adilov

Bilial Adilov, a civil activist, was detained on March 27, 2019 on charges of being a member of the Islamic political party Hizb ut-Tahrir (part 2 of article 205.5 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Earlier in 2017, he was already prosecuted for political reasons (he was sentenced to a fine of 10 thousand rubles). After the application of the preventive measure, he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. At the end of October 2019, Bilial Adilov was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In March 2020, he was additionally charged with planning the violent seizure of power (Art. 278 of the Criminal Code). Human Rights Center Memorial declared him a political prisoner.

“ According to journalist Anton Naumliuk¹²², Bilial Adilov repeatedly complained to the administrators of the Rostov pre-trial detention center about unbearable conditions of detention, but in the end he was transferred to a cell with even worse conditions. Due to high humidity and dampness, Bilial Adilov could hardly breathe in the cell. Detention center guards did not respond to his complaints. Consequently, in order to attract the guards' attention, he had to break electric wires installed in the cell, and, as a result, he was placed in solitary confinement for 15 days. According to Anton Naumliuk, Adilov's defense suggested that the administrators of the pre-trial detention center intentionally kept the political prisoner in unbearable conditions in retaliation for his active position both in the pre-trial detention center and during court hearings.

On August 20, 2019, Bilial Adilov started a dry fast protesting against unbearable conditions of detention. On August 26, 2019, he ceased a hunger strike after being transferred to a cell with better conditions.

Bilial Adilov's lawyer Lyudmila Tyurenkova said that while in the pre-trial detention center, Adilov started having respiratory issues as the result of his staying in damp cells¹²³.

After the transfer to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center No. 1 on the days of court hearings, Bilial Adilov has to starve, since the detention center administrators do not provide him with packed lunches.

122 See Anton Naumliuk, August 23, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=2678537115514545&set=a.167024649999150&type=3&theater>

123 See The person involved in the Simferopol "Hizb ut-Tahrir case" Bilial Adilov stopped his dry fast — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurant-simferopolskogo-dela-hizb-ut-tahrir-prekratil-golodovku/30129947.html>

Case of Ahtem Chiygoz

The Deputy Chairman of the Mejlis of the Crimean Tatar People, Ahtem Chiygoz, was detained on January 29, 2015 in connection with the “February 26 Case”. On September 11, 2017, Ahtem Chiygoz was sentenced to 8 years in standard penal colony on charges of organizing riots (Part 1 of Art. 212 of the Criminal Code). On October 25, 2017, during political negotiations between the presidents of Turkey, Russia and Ukraine, Akhtem Chiygoz, along with Ilmi Umerov, was pardoned and taken to Turkey, from where he later travelled to Kyiv. In 2017, Amnesty International declared Chiygoz a prisoner of conscience, and the expert group “February 26 Case” stated that Chiygoz did not commit any crime.

All the time between being detained and the release, Chiygoz spent in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In attempt to make his conditions of detention more severe, detention administrators transferred him to a special block of the detention center, where persons charged with the most dangerous crimes were held. Thus, Ahtem Chiygoz could not have any contact with the outside world, except the visits from his lawyer. Also, no letters were allowed, and only in August 2017, after 2.5 years in the pre-trial detention center, for the first time letters were delivered to the political prisoner¹²⁴. The detention center officials three times ignored the demands of relatives to conduct a medical examination of Chiygoz¹²⁵. Also, according to lawyer Nikolai Polozov, Akhtem Chiygoz and other prisoners were given food unsuitable for consumption (e.g. rotten cabbage)¹²⁶. In May 2015, Ahtem Chiygoz starved for three days, protesting against an illegal disciplinary measure of placement in solitary confinement.

“After his release, Ahtem Chiygoz told reporters that during his stay in the pre-trial detention center he had been subjected to psychological coercion, in particular, attempts to recruit him had been made by the representatives of the Russian authorities and de facto authorities of the Crimea¹²⁷. He also said that FSB officers tried to make other prisoners to behave violently towards Chiygoz, but the latter refused¹²⁸.

124 See Chiygoz for the first time in 2.5 years received letters of support: <http://old.qha.com.ua/ru/obschestvo/chiigoz-vpervie-za-2-5-goda-poluchil-pisma-podderjki/176859/>

125 See Faces of Crimean political prisoners, “February 26” case: <https://www.5.ua/suspilstvo/oblychchia-krymskykh-politviazniv-sprava-26-liutoho-120846.html>

126 See Tatyana Katrichenko, Deputy Chairman of the Mejlis is sure that through him they want to crack down all Crimean Tatars: <https://glavred.info/politics/354808-proizvol-putina-pochemu-ahtem-chiygoz-god-tomitsya-v-krymskom-sizo.html>

127 See Ahtem Chiygoz: “I was promised good influential position, money, prosperity ...”: <https://fakty.ua/250507-ahtem-chijgoz-mne-sulili-horoshuyu-vliyatelnuyu-rabotu-dengi-blagopoluchie>

128 See Chiygoz: They told me: “Ahtem-aga, we need our Kadyrov in the Crimea.” They offered \$ 3 million. Aksenov personally mentioned the amount: <https://gordonua.com/publications/chiygoz-mne-govorili-ahtem-aga-nam-nuzhen-svoy-kadyrov-v-krymu-predlagali-3-mln-cifru-lichno-aksenov-ozvuchil-269295.html>

Cases of Euromaidan activists

Oleksandr Kostenko¹²⁹

Oleksandr Kostenko is a former Ukrainian policeman, an active participant in Euromaidan, after the Anti-Terrorist Operation (ATO) commenced, he was appointed a commander of the 44th Battalion of the Territorial Defense Force. He also headed the charity foundation “Ukrainian Crimea. Return”. On February 5, 2015, before he was detained and charged, Oleksandr Kostenko was abducted by FSB officers in Simferopol. On the next day, February 6, the Russian occupying authorities in Crimea officially announced that he was detained and charged with inflicting bodily harm to a Berkut officer on February 18, 2014 during the Revolution of Dignity on Independence Square in Kyiv (part 2 of article 115, part 1 Article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). On November 26, 2015, the de facto Supreme Court of Crimea sentenced Kostenko to 3 years and 11 months in prison. Oleksandr Kostenko served his sentence in a standard penal colony No. 5, in Kirovo-Chepetsk of the Kirov region of the Russian Federation. On August 3, 2018, he was released after having served his sentence.

“ At the time of the abduction, Kostenko was tortured by FSB officers, who tried to make him confess, i.a. Andrei Tishenin and Arthur Shambazov (they put a bag over his head, zip tied his hands, bet him, electrocuted, took him into the woods, where a mock shooting was staged, broke his arm and nose)¹³⁰. Under duress Oleksandr signed a self-incriminating confession, which he retracted almost right away. Copies of medical records documenting Kostenko’s subsequent medical examination provide evidence of numerous beatings, shoulder dislocation and a broken elbow.

On February 6, the day after Oleksandr’s detention was announced officially, he was taken to the temporary detention facility in Simferopol. While in the temporary detention facility, Kostenko several times witnessed how special forces officers from Chechnya beat ethnic Ukrainians in holding cells¹³¹. According to Kostenko, they did this by way of training.

On February 9, 2015, Kostenko was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, where he was placed in the “press cell” (a cell in which detention administrators and collaborating prisoners maltreated and humiliated prisoners, subjecting them thus to psychological coercion)¹³². Oleksandr Kostenko stayed in the “press cell” till April 2015. As a result of inflicted tortures, he was extremely unwell, but the detention paramedic refused to give him painkillers, allegedly due to their shortage. Severe pain prevented Kostenko from sleeping, creating additional psychological burdens. To exacerbate physical discomfort, he was allocated a top bunk, where it was difficult to climb with a broken arm. In addition, because of the low temperature in the cell Kostenko kept falling ill:

129 An interview with Oleksandr Kostenko was conducted by NGO CrimeaSOS in December 2019.

130 See Ksenia Kirillova, “I realized that I could disappear.” Crimean Euromaidan activist Oleksandr Kostenko - about tortures by the FSB: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/aleksandr-kostenko-o-pytkah-fsb/29648309.html>

131 See Ksenia Kirillova, “I realized that I could disappear.” Crimean Euromaidan activist Oleksandr Kostenko - about tortures by FSB: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/aleksandr-kostenko-o-pytkah-fsb/29648309.html>

132 See Ksenia Kirillova, “I realized that I could disappear.” Crimean Euromaidan activist Oleksandr Kostenko - about tortures by FSB: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/aleksandr-kostenko-o-pytkah-fsb/29648309.html>

although it was winter, windows in the cell were unglazed and covered with thin blankets. According to Kostenko, the cell was damp, there was mold, vermines, unpleasant odor from the broken toilet, and very poor ventilation. Kostenko's vision deteriorated because of the bright light given out by the lamp that was not switched off even at night. Drinking water was not provided, the food was practically unsuitable for consumption. Moreover, all complaints and transfer requests were ignored by detention administrators. In March 2015, pressure on Oleksandr intensified: FSB officers threatened him with the murder of his mother and abduction of his brother (Fedir Kostenko, Oleksandr's father, was abducted during that period). Two other prisoners (Mr. Guzeev and Mr. Bulba) severely beat Oleksandr, trying to force self-incriminating confession. The beating was observed by detention staff, who intervened only when Oleksandr began to bleed heavily.

After April 2015, Oleksandr Kostenko was transferred to another cell, where prisoners from the Donetsk region of Ukraine were detained, who openly supported Russian aggression, and some of them were members of the paramilitary groups of the so-called Donetsk People Republic (DPR). Oleksandr's political views were known to his cellmates and other prisoners, hence they persisted in calling him the "punisher". According to him, cellmates beat him every time they learned about the aggravation of hostilities in eastern Ukraine. Due to a broken arm, Kostenko could not effectively defend himself. In addition, the "senior" prisoner in the cell forbade him to move around the cell threatening him with physical violence. FSB officers and officers of the de facto Investigative Committee repeatedly beat Kostenko in the investigation rooms of the pre-trial detention center. Investigator Mr. Odarchenko and FSB officers Mr. Shambazov and Mr. Tishenin demanded confession from Kostenko, promising in exchange to release his abducted father (note: nothing is known about the whereabouts of Fedir Kostenko at present). On the days of court hearings, Oleksandr on purpose was not given food in the pre-trial detention center. In May 2015, Oleksandr Kostenko had an arm surgery, after which, despite doctor's orders, he was not given painkillers, wound dressings were not changed as required, and he had to remove his arm cast himself with the assistance of other prisoners. On the occasions, when detention staff saw that his cast was covered with blood, they made Kostenko carry heavy objects under the threat of placement in solitary confinement.

On October 23, 2015, after his was convicted and sentenced, Oleksandr Kostenko was transferred to penal colony No. 5 in the city of Kirovo-Chepetsk in the Kirov Region. During the transfer an incident occurred when a guard sprayed the entire truck with fire extinguishing powder after one of the prisoners lit a cigarette. Oleksandr mentioned that because of the powder it was hard to breathe for a long time.

In the penal colony Kostenko repeatedly complained about an injured joint in his hand (joint replacement surgery was required), but required medical treatment was not provided. He was allocated a top bunk by prison administrators. In addition, throughout his stay in the penal colony Oleksandr, along with other prisoners, was forced to work, allegedly in line with art. 106 of the Criminal Executive Code of the Russian Federation. According to Oleksandr Kostenko, prison administrators made prisoners work for free, and they sewed clothes that later were sold to local

population, while the money was taken by prison officials. If prisoners refused to work, they were threatened with disciplinary sanctions and harsher conditions in which the sentence was served.

Sanitary and epidemiological state of the colony facilities (the “barracks”) as well as food were described by Oleksandr Kostenko as totally unsatisfactory. The electric light in the barracks was never turned off and it disturbed sleep; the toilet area was not separated and was wide open; drinking water was not provided, portions were small, food was spoiled or undercooked (Kostenko was constantly hungry); even in summer barracks had low temperatures and high humidity. In order to get medicines, prisoners each time had to queue for many hours, waiting for medical staff to dispense the medicines. At the same time, Oleksandr noted that medicines sent by relatives were not always handed over.

“According to Kostenko, prison officials incited ethnic hatred towards the Ukrainians, purposefully shaped their low social status and led to their being branded outcasts, constantly provoked them, insulting on ethnic grounds (for example, they claimed that all Ukrainian women were involved in prostitution). Ukrainian prisoners had to undergo repeated unscheduled searches. Oleksandr was regularly beaten and humiliated by other prisoners because of his ethnic background, and the prosecution intensified on various holidays and anniversaries as well as after Russian TV segments about the armed conflict in Ukraine¹³³. Oleksandr’s mother mentioned a similar case when during Orthodox sermon in a colony church the priest of Moscow Patriarchate publicly insulted Kostenko on ethnic grounds. After the incident, Oleksandr had to stop attending the church, thus losing his right to free performance of religious rites¹³⁴.

In addition, prison administrators tried to impose the Russian citizenship on those Ukrainian citizens that officially resided in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea. The following forms of coercion were used: forbidding visits to the dining room and thus not allowing prisoners to eat, refusing parole on the basis of fabricated reasons, as well as beating. In addition, Kostenko was pressured to refuse the visits of the Ukrainian consul. All meetings with the consul took place under the supervision of prison administrators and were video-recorded, the prisoner and the consul were forbidden to speak in Ukrainian.

In September 2016, Kostenko had his one single visit from his mother. Regularly the visit may last three days, nevertheless due to the lengthy verification and waiting procedure, Kostenko could spend with his mother only a day and a half¹³⁵. Notably, right after the meeting, Kostenko was beaten for about two hours by Moscow FSB officers who thought he is familiar with one Ukrainian activist and politician, whom they suspect of collaboration with American intelligence services. During the beating, the security officials pressed Kostenko to confirm that this person was a US intelligence informant, threatening Oleksandr that if he didn’t provide the required information, some accident would happen to his mother on her way back home.

133 See Victoria Veselova, Sniper bullets, torture, prisons: Crimeans that are persecuted because of Euromaidan: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/puli-snajpera-pytki-turmy-krymchane-postradavshye-za-evromaidan/30285020.html>

134 See Olena Kostenko, Mother and Son Meet in a Russian Prison: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/27989611.html>

135 See Olena Kostenko, Mother and Son Meet in a Russian Prison: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/27989611.html>

Also, Oleksandr Kostenko mentioned problems with letters: prison administrators on purpose handed over letters from relatives with a considerable delay (sometimes even 2-6 months later)¹³⁶, and Oleksandr's letters were put into a waist bin, as he was told by a prison official.

While in the penal colony, Kostenko on fabricated grounds several times was placed in solitary confinement, which was characterized by harsher conditions. In May 2016, he was preventively registered as a potential prison escapee which made parole impossible and detention conditions even stricter.

Oleksandr Kostenko informed that prison administrators did not register prisoners' hunger strikes, and refused to accept any complaints or requests. In addition, according to Kostenko, in late 2016 - early 2017, senior officials of the Federal Penitentiary Service issued an internal regulation, allowing prison staff to use physical force against prisoners. Also, Kostenko mentioned that the beatings and humiliation of prisoners intensified after Perminov was appointed as Head of the penal colony. Perminov personally insulted the prisoners, calling them "dogs".

Oleksandr Kostenko reported that he was visited every month by FSB officers who, by making threats against his relatives, tried to obtain information about some members of Ukrainian armed forces, about weapon caches in the territory of the Russian Federation, Crimea, as well as about the corridors in the northern part of the Ukrainian state border. Shortly before the release of the political prisoner, FSB officers tried to recruit him, recommended not to give interviews that would discredit Russia before the world community, and also did not recommend participating in the activities of the "Right Sector".

After his release, Oleksandr Kostenko still has problems with his hand as the bones healed incorrectly leading to arthrosis, all due to the lack of timely medical treatment in the pre-trial detention center and the colony, and the impossibility of reversing the healing process. Consequently, Oleksandr has struggled to find a job (the hand is not working properly). Because of the hand he is unfit for active service.

Andrii Kolomiiets

Andrii Kolomiiets, a Ukrainian citizen, was detained in Nalchik (Kabardino-Balkaria, Russia) in May 2015 and charged with attempted murder of a Berkut officer during the events of the Revolution of Dignity on Independence Square in Kyiv, as well as with drug trafficking (part 3 of article 30, paragraphs "a", "b", "e", "l", part 2 of article 105, part 2 of article 228 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Two months later, Kolomiiets was transferred to the Crimea (pre-trial detention center in Simferopol). In July 2016, Andrii Kolomiiets was sentenced to 10 years in a maximum security colony. In November of the same year, he was transferred to the penal colony No. 14 in the Krasnodar Territory of the Russian Federation, where he is serving his sentence. He was declared a political prisoner by Russian Human Rights Center Memorial.

¹³⁶ See Artem Laptiev, New Year in a Russian Prison: Customs and Traditions: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/noviy-god-v-turme-poryadki-i-traditsii/29681662.html>

“ Andrii Kolomiets, via his lawyer, informed that after the arrest he was tortured in order to force to confession. Hence, at a court hearing in March 2016, Kolomiets’s lawyer filed a motion, which stated that the senior officer of the “Center E” of the Main Directorate of the Russian Ministry of Internal Affairs Mr. Borovik together with other unknown law enforcement officers, put a bag over Kolomiets’s head, attached with large staples electric wires to his fingers, put a damp cloth under them and applied electrical current¹³⁷.

Kolomiets’s lawyer reported on the inhuman conditions in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center: lack of water in the cell (water was available only for one hour during the day), overcrowded cells (10 inmates per 6 bunks), as well as the fact that Andrii was subjected to humiliation and psychological coercion on religious and ethnic grounds¹³⁸.

During his imprisonment in the penal colony No. 14 in the Krasnodar Territory, Kolomiets several times was placed in solitary confinement without reasonable grounds, letters were handed over several months later; he was also persecuted by fellow prisoners on ethnic grounds. So, in February 2017, Kolomiets was placed in solitary confinement for 5 days, allegedly for smoking in the wrong place, the same disciplinary measures were applied for refusing to inform on his fellow prisoners and other far-fetched reasons (for example, sleeping on the floor) in February, March and May 2018.

In February 2017, it became known that the political prisoner’s health had severely deteriorated and he developed psoriasis. A few months later, in June, he started having persistent headaches, nausea and throbbing pain at the base of the head. Kolomiets requested medical treatment in writing, but it was never provided. Subsequently, he had several psoriasis flare-ups and had other health issues, including those caused by his chronic conditions; medical treatment was not provided regularly. Andrii Kolomiets asked the colony’s medical staff to prescribe him medicines that later could be bought and handed over to him by his relatives. The medical staff refused to prescribe any medicine¹³⁹. Notably, the deterioration of health was to a great degree caused by repeated placement in solitary confinement. Only in March 2019, Andrii Kolomiets was referred to the hospital for medical examination. However, even after the examination required medical treatment was not provided.

According to Kolomiets’ wife, he has lost a lot of weight as he cannot eat the food provided in the colony because of its very poor quality, and packages cannot be sent regularly.

In September 2017, it was reported that Kolomiets worked in the colony almost seven days a week from 7 am to 9 pm, for the first month of work he was remunerated with 20 packs of cigarettes¹⁴⁰.

137 See Stories of Kremlin Prisoners: Andrii Kolomiets – fabricated case, inhuman conditions of detention and loss of health: <https://crimeahrg.org/ru/istorii-uznikov-kremlya-andrej-kolomiecz-sfalsificirovannoe-delo-nechelovecheskie-usloviya-soderzhaniya-i-poterya-zdorovya/>

138 See Human Rights Defenders: Maidan activist Andrei Kolomiets is being threatened in the Crimean pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/27653490.html>

139 See Artem Laptiev, “I thought everyone forgot about him.” The wife of the Ukrainian political prisoner Kolomiets visited him in a Russian colony: ru.krymr.com/a/news-zakluchennogo-v-rossii-kolomiyca-posetila-gena/29624194.html

140 See Ukrainian political prisoner Kolomiets in the Russian colony is made to work physically: <https://crimeahrg.org/ru/ukrainskogo-polituznika-kolomiytsa-v-kolonii-rf-privlekli-k-fizicheskomu-trudu/>

Andrii Kolomiiets was also registered by prison administrators as a potential rule-breaker and a person that tend to propagate one's views.

In March 2018, a representative of the Ukrainian Consulate in Rostov-on-Don visited Andrii Kolomiiets. During the conversation a prison staff member was present and it was video-recorded. As confidentiality was not ensured, the political prisoner could not inform the consul about the actual conditions of detention and violations of his rights. The consul later reported¹⁴¹, that the penal colony No. 4 in Krasnodar is characterized by the most severe conditions of detention, in comparison with other Russian colonies, where Ukrainian citizens are imprisoned for political reasons.

As a result of imprisonment Kolomiiets' health has dramatically deteriorated. Currently, he experiences nausea, persistent headaches and stomach pains, as well as psoriasis flare-ups. Despite his requests, the medical treatment has not been provided. In April 2017, his lawyers lodged an application with the European Court of Human Rights.

141 See Artem Laptiev, The EuroMaidan prisoner in Russia has "the most stringent conditions of detention" — Ukrainian consul: ru.krymr.com/a/news-u-ukrainskogo-polituznika-kolomiyca-naibolee-gestkie-uslovia-sodergania/29786405.html

Case of Murad Aliiev

On August 6, 2015, a local resident Murad Aliiev was detained in Simferopol. The Crimean Tatar was charged with violent group robbery, and was convicted under part 2 of art. 162 of the Criminal Code. His family turned to human rights defenders, claiming that before the detention Murad had been followed and that the charges were trumped up. The ex officio lawyer persuaded Aliiev to plead “guilty” so that he would get the minimum sentence. Consequently, Murad Aliiev was sentenced to 2 years and 6 months in prison. While in prison, another criminal case was brought against Aliiev under art. 280, 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, for alleged extremism incitement on the territory of the Kerch penal colony No. 2, where he was serving the sentence. In August 2017, he was transferred to a pre-trial detention center, from where, in February 2018, he was released on his own recognizance due to the expiration of the pre-trial detention time limit. Soon after the release, Murad Aliiev fled from the Crimea to the mainland Ukraine, where he currently resides.

In an interview with NGO “CrimeaSOS”¹⁴² Murad Aliiev said that after the detention he was taken to the Central District Department of Internal Affairs of Simferopol, where he was detained from morning until 2 a.m. The captain of de facto police Kokoryshkin subjected him to psychological coercion forcing him to confess, shouted at him and used foul language. During all that time representatives of the Russian police kept Aliiev handcuffed. He was tortured and beaten: they beat him with bottles of water, clasped hands behind his back, put him in a position when legs were tied and pulled to the hands behind the back (“martinet” position). In addition, he was not allowed to contact his relatives and inform them where he was.

At 2 a.m. he was allowed to contact his mother and was put in police custody in the basement of the temporary detention facility in Simferopol, where he was held for a day.

“After the application of the preventive measure, Aliiev was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. He mentioned that upon the arrival he was kept for about 12 hours in a “tunnel” that connected the entry building and prisoner cell blocks. It was damp and there was no light. During 12 hours Aliiev could not sit down because the floor was wet and there were too many people in the room. After that, he was placed in a transit cell, that was overcrowded. For 18 people there were only 6 bunks, hence they had to sleep in turns. It was dirty and conditions were unsanitary.

Murad Aliiev mentioned, that the food in the detention center was completely unsuitable for consumption. Besides, the detention staff refused to tell Muslims whether the food contained pork. Consequently, he did not eat for the first 2-3 days, and later ate the products that his relatives managed to bring him. After 2 weeks, he was transferred from a transit cell to another small cell, which contained about 30 people. As Aliiev recalls, the cell was so crowded that the inmates could not move around freely and some of them spent all the time on their top bunks.

¹⁴² The interview was conducted by NGO “CrimeaSOS” in 2018.

According to Aliiev, many cells in the pre-trial detention center were in disrepair, some of them had no windows and there was no heating anywhere.

In December 2015, Murad Aliiev was transferred to the Kerch penal colony No. 2. According to Aliiev, he did not observe any serious violations in the colony until the winter of 2016, when 5 Federal Penitentiary Service officers from the Russian city of Omsk arrived in the colony, and began to systematically torture prisoners in the so-called “quarantine” (the place where newly arrived prisoners were detained). Other inmates told Aliiev that they had been beaten by those officers (one of the prisoners had a kidney bruise after being hit with a baton), forced to clean toilets used by prison staff, urine was poured over them, and sexual violence was used (Aliiev knows a case when a Crimean Tatar was raped with a baton for his refusal to clean the toilet). Moreover, Aliiev repeatedly heard shouts and calls for help coming from the quarantine facilities. According to him, the colony infirmary did not document beatings, while torture and beating victims, in order not to attract the attention, were kept in solitary confinement till all the traces of beating disappeared.

“ He started talking to the victims, explained to them the mechanisms for protecting their rights, and sent complaints to the prosecutor’s office. As a result, the above mentioned officers from Omsk called Aliiev to an office and tortured him for an hour: stripped him naked, fastened his limbs with the duct tape, hit his feet with a baton, used a stun gun. At the same time, the torturers stated that they wanted Aliiev to stop asking questions about what was happening in the quarantine.

The prisoners were also forced to sing the Russian anthem, but subsequently, after relevant complaints, the requirement was canceled. Murad Aliiev tried to discuss the tortures with the head of the colony, Mr. Bobrikov, however, Bobrikov said that the orders to apply such methods came from higher officials and the issue was beyond his control. At the same time, according to Aliiev, in several cases, the order to inflict torture came from the deputy head of the colony, Mr. Vitchenko.

Later, the four officers from Omsk left, and only one remained, but the torture did not stop. According to Aliiev, as a result of regular torture, at least 5-6 prisoners tried to cut their veins, but they received medical treatment. He also recalled a case when as a result of torture a prisoner’s leg was broken, the cast was applied incorrectly, consequently, the bone healed wrongly, and later bone cancer developed.

Prisoners were also tortured in solitary confinement. Murad Aliiev said that when he was in solitary confinement, belonging to the special unit masked guards several times grabbed his arms and legs and threw him on the concrete floor. Another prisoner, Ivan Sayenko, while in solitary confinement, had his head broken.

After the Omsk officers left, the Federal Penitentiary Service officer from Saratov by the name of Dvoretzky arrived. He subjected prisoners to psychological coercion and tortured them with a stun gun. As Murad Aliiev recalls, Dvoretzky wore a black uniform without chevrons and insignia.

After about a year in the colony, Murad Aliiev was registered as a person that could spread extremist ideology, which automatically implied more stringent conditions of detention (restrictions on visits and packages).

After Aliiev served 1 year and 8 months, FSB officers became interested in him. Most likely, this happened because of his religious activism and beliefs. In particular, he ensured that a mosque was opened in the colony. Via other prisoners, the Crimean Tatar was provoked to talk about Islam and events in Syria. Soon, they started placing him regularly in solitary confinement and conducting searches on far-fetched grounds. At the end of August 2017, Aliiev was taken to the FSB Investigation Department with a bag over his head, where he was tortured with electric shocks and asked questions about Syria and the Hizb ut-Tahrir Islamic organization.

After that, Aliiev was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center and charged under art. 280 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation “Public incitement to extremist actions” and art. 282 of the Criminal Code “Incitement to hatred or enmity.” According to investigators, on February 7, 2017, Murad Aliiev, during a Friday namaz prayer in a mosque in the colony, called on other prisoners to commit violent acts against people of a different faith. One of the witnesses in the case, sentenced to 5.5 years in prison, was released shortly after he testified against Aliiev.

After returning to the territory of mainland Ukraine, Murad Aliiev for a long time had mental health and sleep problems.

Cases of "Crimean saboteurs"

Yevhen Panov

On August 7, 2016, on the administrative border between Crimea and mainland Ukraine, Russian FSB officers detained the Ukrainian ATO volunteer Yevhen Panov. On August 10, 2016, the FSB officially announced that "a series of terrorist acts", allegedly "prepared by the Chief Directorate of Intelligence of the Ministry of Defense of Ukraine" were prevented in Crimea. Panov was named as one of the saboteurs (part 2 of art. 281 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Subsequently, lawyer Dmitry Dinze told that after the arrest Panov was tortured. For several days he was kept in a basement, after what he was placed in the temporary detention facility, and later, on August 11, he was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In October 2016, Yevhen Panov was transferred to the Lefortovo pre-trial detention center in Moscow. In February 2017, he was again transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, and in December 2018 to the Krasnodar pre-trial detention center. In July 2018, Yevhen Panov was sentenced to 8 years in prison in a maximum security colony. Since February 2019, he served his sentence in the Omsk penal colony No. 6. In September 2019, Panov was released as part of the so-called "big exchange" between Ukraine and the Russian Federation.

“According to Yevhen Panov, on August 7, 2016, after he was detained FSB officers took him to the northern part of Crimea, where they tortured him in the basement of a building. To make him confess, they hung Eugene up by his handcuffs, fastened with duct tape to a chair, beat his head with an iron pipe, used electricity, and sexual violence (they put a clamp on his penis and screwed it), took him out with a bag over his head, staging his shooting.¹⁴³ In the evening of the same day, Panov was transported with a bag over his head probably to Simferopol, where torture continued until August 9. Subsequently he was taken to the de facto Railway Court of Simferopol, where he was sentenced to 15 days of administrative arrest, allegedly for petty hooliganism.

Yevhen Panov was taken from the courthouse to the temporary detention facility (location unknown). On August 11, the preventive measure as part of criminal proceedings was applied and Panov was taken to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. Only there Yevhen Panov was fed and given water for the first time since August 7. The physician at the pre-trial detention center examined the traces of beatings, but no medical treatment was provided.

In October 2016, Yevhen Panov was transferred to the Lefortovo pre-trial detention center in Moscow. The detention administrators forced him to refuse in writing the assistance of Ukrainian consular and of independent lawyers¹⁴⁴. At the same time, obviously as a way of psychological coercion, Panov was not allowed to meet with his lawyer and the letters and packages for him were not accepted. The situation

¹⁴³ See "They put a clamp on the penis and screwed it until it turned blue." Arrested in the case of "Crimean saboteurs", Ukrainian Yevhen Panov told about torture: <https://zona.media/article/2016/08/12/panov-torture>

¹⁴⁴ See Ukrainian "saboteur" Panov forced to refuse the visit from the consul — lawyer: <https://www.ukrinform.ru/rubric-politics/2110269-ukrainskogo-diversanta-panova-vynuzdaut-otkazatsya-ot-konsula-advokat.html>; Alexander Popkov, December 6, 2016: <https://www.facebook.com/alexander.popkov.7/posts/1223882437698774>

was resolved only after the appeal of the Ukrainian Ombudsman to her Russian counterpart.

On December 8, 2016, it became known that Panov lodged a complaint with the Investigation Committee of the Russian Federation, in which he described torture inflicted after he was detained. However, Russian law enforcement officers refused to institute criminal proceedings. The complaint stated that all confessions had been given under torture.

On April 14, 2017, a prisoner with tuberculosis was placed in the same cell with Yevhen Panov in the Lefortovo pre-trial detention center¹⁴⁵. Thanks to the intervention of the Ukrainian Ombudsman Valeriya Lutkovska, three days later he was transferred to another cell.

In February 2017, the political prisoner was again transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. In July, Panov's lawyer Dmitry Dinze lodged a petition to the Prosecutor General's Office of the Russian Federation, complaining about the conditions of Yevhen's detention (insect bites, overcrowded cells, lack of medical treatment). In addition, Eugene reported that his newspapers were stolen, and thus he did not have access to any information from outside.

In March 2019, it became known that Yevhen Panov due to poor health (acute back pain) was taken from the Omsk prison colony No. 6 to the Omsk colony hospital No. 11. Soon after that the political prisoner was returned to prison colony No. 6, as no treatment could be provided to him in the colony hospital¹⁴⁶. Lawyer Olga Dinze informed that Panov was not even given painkillers. Later, in penal colony No. 6, Yevhen Panov complained that he had problems with teeth, vision and persistent severe headache, but no medical treatment was provided. Moreover, after Panov refused to sing the Russian anthem and work in the colony, prison administrators started putting pressure on him. In July 2019, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova turned to her Russian counterpart Tatyana Moskalkova after she got to know that there was a 15-hour break between the meals that were given to Yevhen Panov at the Omsk colony. Yevhen was hungry almost all the time, which created additional health risks¹⁴⁷. It also became known that Panov was forbidden to receive periodicals, hence he was in complete informational isolation.

Yevhen Panov was released as part of the "big exchange" between Ukraine and the Russian Federation in September 2019. Thus, he was deprived of freedom for over three years.

Dmytro Shtyblikov

On November 9, 2016, Dmytro Shtyblikov, an analyst at the Ukrainian non-governmental organization Nomos, was detained in Sevastopol on charges of allegedly planning to commit sabotage acts as a member of an organized group (part 2 of article 281, part 3 of article 222, part 3 of article 222.1 Criminal Code of the

¹⁴⁵ See In a pre-trial detention center in the same cell with a Ukrainian Panov an inmate with tuberculosis was placed — relatives: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28429542.html>

¹⁴⁶ See Yevhen Panov, March 21, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/PanovEugen/photos/a.1818325348284811/2142795105837832/?type=3&theater>

¹⁴⁷ See Lyudmila Denisova, June 26, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/posts/2754561611283237>

Russian Federation). After he was detained, for about a week Shtyblikov was kept in an unknown location. Later he was taken to the temporary detention facility in Bakhchysaraa and subsequently transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. On November 16, 2017, the Sevastopol city de facto court sentenced Dmytro Shtyblikov to 5 years in a maximum security penal colony and a fine of 200 thousand Russian rubles. At the end of April 2018, Shtyblikov was transferred from the Simferopol pre-trial detention center to the Omsk penal colony No. 6, in the Russian Federation (transportation took 2 months), and in October 2018, he was transferred back to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. Information about further transportation from the Simferopol pre-trial detention center is currently not available.

Dmytro "confessed" during the first days of the detention. Private lawyer Alexander Popkov tried to meet with his client for about a week, however, employees of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, the FSB office in Simferopol and Sevastopol, as well as of the temporary detention facility in Bakhchysarai claimed that Dmytro Shtyblikov was not in their custody¹⁴⁸. As a result, only a week later, Shtyblikov was found in Bakhchysarai's police temporary detention facility, but the facility staff told Popkov that the detainee refused his services, allegedly preferring the services of de facto-controlled lawyer Arman Petrosyan¹⁴⁹. At the same time, as reported by the publication Crimea.Realities, Shtyblikov told his cellmates that he was forced to refuse the services of Popkov by Russian law enforcement officers¹⁵⁰. Throughout the entire investigation period, the relatives had practically no information about Shtyblikov's condition and the progress of the investigation. In May 2017, it became known that he took a plea bargain. In the Bakhchisaray temporary detention facility the prisoner did not receive timely and quality medical treatment, as a result his chronic medical conditions aggravated. In particular, on January 11, 2017, relatives reported that he had the exacerbation of urinary stone disease¹⁵¹.

In June 2018, the Russian Ombudsman Tatyana Moskalkova visited Shtyblikov in the Omsk colony. It became known that starting from May 2018, Dmytro spent 6 months in solitary confinement (full isolation)¹⁵². Besides, several disciplinary measures were applied (the grounds are unknown).

In June 2018, Dmytro Shtyblikov wrote to the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine requesting to facilitate his transfer to Ukraine where he would continue serving his sentence¹⁵³.

In October 2018, Shtyblikov was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. Shortly before this, a riot occurred in the Omsk penal colony No. 6.

148 See Alexander Popkov, November 12, 2016: <https://www.facebook.com/alexander.popkov.7/posts/1196311580455860>

149 See Anton Naumliuk, "Under pressure, people can sign anything" — lawyer of "Crimean saboteurs": <https://ru.krymr.com/a/28118869.html>

150 See Anton Naumliuk, the FSB v. Lawyers: <https://www.svoboda.org/a/28267195.html>

151 See Crimean Human Rights Group, January 10, 2017: <https://www.facebook.com/crimeahrg/photos/a.1677121552573479/1834653076820325/?type=3&theater>

152 See The "Ukrainian saboteur" prisoner in Russia is being held in solitary confinement — brother: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-shtyblikov-ukrainskij-diversant/29432953.html>; The "Ukrainian saboteur" prisoner in Russia was transported in an unknown direction — journalist: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-zakluchennogo-v-russia-shtyblikova-etapirovali-v-neizvestnom-napravlenii/29560848.html>

153 See The Secretariat of the Commissioner of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine for human rights 2013-2018, the Ukrainian Consul at the request of the Commissioner Lyudmila Denisova visited political prisoner Dmytro Shtyblikov in Omsk: www.ombudsman.gov.ua/ua/all-news/pr/16618-nj-ukraiinskij-konsul-na-proxannya-upovnovazhenogo-lyudmili-denisovoi-vi/

According to journalist Anton Naumliuk¹⁵⁴, about 200 prisoners rebelled against the torture and beatings applied by the prison staff. The prisoners hung a banner "SAVE" from the windows of the colony. In addition, some prisoners went on a hunger strike. The colony officials responded to the riot by bringing in Spetsnaz and other special ops units, as a result at least 40 prisoners were injured, one was sent to intensive care. As reported, Dmytro Shtyblikov did not participate in the incident and was not injured, which was probably due to the fact that he was kept in solitary confinement separately from other prisoners.

“From the moment when he was detained till the present moment, the case has been a highly secretive one. Neither relatives nor independent lawyers were able to confidentially communicate with Dmitry in order to establish whether torture or other forms of pressure had been used against him in order to obtain the confession. However, taking into account that the confession was given while an independent lawyer chosen by relatives was not admitted and later his services were refused, as well as the closed nature of the case, the authors of the report conclude that most probably both psychological and physical coercion was used against Shtyblikov. A similar opinion was expressed by relatives of Dmytro Shtyblikov¹⁵⁵.

Hennadii Limeshko

On August 12, 2017, a native of the Kharkiv region, Hennadii Limeshko, was detained in Crimea on charges of alleged sabotage actions. He was placed in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. On May 10, 2018 Limeshko was sentenced to 8 years in prison. Notably, he was sentenced not for sabotage actions, with which he was initially charged, but for alleged illegal possession of ammunition and explosives¹⁵⁶ (part 2 of article 222, part 2 of article 222.1, part 2 of article 223.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Since September 2018, he has served his sentence in the penal colony No. 6 of the Stavropol Territory of the Russian Federation.

The video footage of Limeshko's interrogation published by the FSB¹⁵⁷, shows visible traces of physical abuse on his face. Despite the fact that Hennadii Limeshko did not make statements about the use of torture against him, his relatives do not exclude that he could have been pressured into making a confession.

“In March 2019, after the visit of the Ukrainian consul, it became known that Hennadii Limeshko had sinusitis, he had a fever (about 40°C) for several days, but the colony officials did not provide any medical treatment. According to the wife of the political prisoner, generally, in the colony one need to wait for several days in order to get a fever-reducing pill¹⁵⁸.

154 The "Ukrainian saboteur" prisoner in Russia was taken in an unknown direction — journalist: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-zakluchennogo-v-russia-shtyblikova-etapirovali-v-neizvestnom-napravlenii/29560848.html>

155 See Ivan Putilov, "The Case of Crimean Experts": what happens to "saboteurs" Shtyblikov, Bessarabov and Dudka: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/29280668.html>

156 See Pavel Novikov, 8 years for the "Ukrainian saboteur": for what Hennadii Limeshko was convicted: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/29226218.html>

157 See Kianews24, Video of interrogation of SBU (Ukrainian Security Service) agent Hennadii Lemeshko, January 15, 2017 p.: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AmBSndONRNs>

158 See Political Prisoner Hennadii Limeshko Does Not Receive Appropriate Medical Treatment: <https://ctrcenter.org/ru/news/1921-politzaklyuchennyj-gennadij-limeshko-ne-poluchaet-nadlezhaschej-meditsinskoj-pomoschi>

In November 2019, the Human Rights Representative of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (Ukrainian Ombudsman) Lyudmila Denisova reported that Hennadii Limeshko had skin problems (lesions on arms, elbows and legs, as well as a leg rash), medical treatment was not provided¹⁵⁹. According to Denisova's information, published in January 2020, the colony officials subjected Hennadii Limeshko to physical and psychological coercion, constantly insulting him and threatening to kill him for converting to Islam. In addition, according to Lyudmila Denisova, several times Limeshko's cap was set on fire while on his head (it's not clear whether it was done by prison staff or by other prisoners). Hence, the political prisoner stated that he feared for his life and safety. Also, Limeshko's health has deteriorated (toothache and pain in the joints). Medical treatment, as in the case of previous complaints, is not provided¹⁶⁰. At the same time, representatives of the Main Directorate of the Federal Penitentiary Service of Russia in the Stavropol Territory deny the facts of attacks and threats against Limeshko.

¹⁵⁹ See Lyudmila Denisova, November 2, 2019: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/posts/3175156645890396>

¹⁶⁰ See Lyudmila Denisova, January 31, 2020: https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/posts/3402084019864323?_tn_=-R

Case of Ilmi Umerov

In May 2016, criminal charges were pressed against the deputy chairman of the Mejlis, Ilmi Umerov, under Part 2 of art. 280.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation for “public incitement to commit acts aimed at violating the territorial integrity of the Russian Federation”. Recognizance not to leave was applied as a preventive measure. 60-year-old Umerov has Parkinson’s disease, heart problems, and diabetes. Despite this, on September 27, 2017, the de facto court of Simferopol sentenced him to 2 years in an open colony settlement. A month after the conviction and sentencing, Umerov was hospitalized for hypertensive emergency. In an interview with NGO “CrimeaSOS”¹⁶¹, Ilmi Umerov said that the hypertensive emergency was a direct consequence of the criminal prosecution and the conviction. In October 2017, pardon was issued and he was released. Although he was released, the very fact that he was sentenced to imprisonment, regardless of serious medical conditions practically incompatible with placement in open colony settlement, can be regarded as psychological burden and the threat to Umerov’s life.

On August 11, 2016, the de facto court decided to refer Umerov to a compulsory psychiatric evaluation, at the same court hearing he did not feel well and was taken away by an ambulance¹⁶². However, 7 days later, he was transferred directly from the hospital to Ward No. 9 of the Crimean Republican Psychiatric Hospital No. 1 for psychiatric evaluation. In an interview with the Social Organization “CrimeaSOS” Ilmi Umerov explained¹⁶³ that he was kept in a closed ward, where there were about 100 patients. About half of the patients, because of the building renovation, stayed in the courtyard (the beds were placed under a sunshade). Ilmi Umerov was allocated a separate room, but there was no door in the room (only a doorway). According to Umerov, this inflicted psychological burden, since any of the patients, including those who had a mental disorder, could enter his room at any given moment. Sometimes he woke up at night because there was a patient standing next to his bed. There were no doors in the whole ward.

“ According to Umerov, the sanitary conditions in the hospital were unacceptable and degrading. So, for the first 5 days of the hospitalization he could not use the toilet. As he explained, there were only 3 toilets for 100 patients, and they were not separated from another area. A large number of patients were constantly there, as this was the only place where they were not supervised by orderlies. As he was unable to use toilet in such degrading conditions, on the fifth day Ilmi Umerov felt unwell and lost consciousness, after which one of the orderlies allowed him to use the staff toilet. Ilmi Umerov also said that during the whole period of his stay in the hospital (3 weeks in the summer, when the weather was hot) he could not use the shower. The shower cubicle was an open one and any patient could see him, hence, he used wet towels instead of taking the shower.

According to the hospital rules, patients could have one daily visit lasting an hour. According to Umerov, after one of these visits, he was attacked by 25-30 patients

¹⁶¹ The interview was conducted by NGO “CrimeaSOS” in December 2019.

¹⁶² See The Occupants’ “Court” referred the deputy chairman of the Mejlis Umerov to a psychiatric evaluation: www.unian.net/society/1464628-sud-okkupantov-otpravil-zampreda-medjlisa-umerova-na-psihiatricheskuyu-ekspertizu.html

¹⁶³ The interview was conducted by NGO “CrimeaSOS” in December 2019.

who did not like that Umerov's visitor had taken a picture (it was forbidden). The attackers started screaming, seized his hands, tried to hit him, luckily the orderlies intervened. At the same time, while in the hospital, he saw the orderlies mocking some of the patients, shouting at them and using foul language.

Ilmi Umerov's compulsory psychiatric evaluation in the hospital continued for 21 days. Umerov reports that his attending psychiatrist after the first meeting said that she knew he had no mental disorder, but still she could not release him at least for 28 days, since under the law the procedure lasted from 28 to 90 days. According to Ilmi Umerov, the fact that he was released earlier indicates that hospital psychiatrists actually breached the existing rules.

Cases of Ukrainian activists

Volodymyr Balukh

Volodymyr Balukh, a Ukrainian activist and a farmer from Serebrianka, Rozdolne District, was detained on December 8, 2016. FSB officials stated that during the “investigation of the premises”, i.e. search of the attic in the house where Volodymyr lived, 90 cartridges and several TNT checkers were allegedly discovered. The real reason for his prosecution was his active position in supporting the Revolution of Dignity and territorial integrity of Ukraine. Before the arrest, he hung on his house a Ukrainian flag and a sign “Street of the Heaven’s Hundred Heroes”. After the application of the preventive measure Volodymyr Balukh spent some time in the temporary detention facility in the settlement of Rozdolne, and the rest in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center.

In early August 2017, the de facto court sentenced Balukh to 3 years and 7 months in a standard penal colony, as well as to a fine of 10 thousand rubles under part 1 of art. 222 of the Criminal Code (“Illegal possession of ammunition”). After the conviction, on August 22, 2017, additional charges were pressed against Volodymyr under part 2 of art. 321 of the Criminal Code (“Disruption of the work of an isolation facility”). According to investigators, on August 11, 2017, Volodymyr Balukh during a routine inspection of his cell attacked Valery Tkachenko, the head of the temporary detention facility in the settlement of Rozdolne. Balukh said that Tkachenko beat him, swore at him and insulted him for being a Ukrainian. In early October 2017, the Crimean Supreme Court overturned the Balukh’s sentence and referred it back for re-examination by a newly composed panel. In October 2018, the activist was sentenced to 4 years 11 months in a standard penal colony and a fine of 10 thousand rubles. After the conviction Volodymyr Balukh was transferred to the Kerch penal colony. In February 2019, it became known that he had been transferred to the territory of the Russian Federation, notably, without winter clothes and other necessary items. In September 2019, Volodymyr was released as part of the “big exchange” between Ukraine and the Russian Federation.

Human rights activists repeatedly reported that due to cruel and inhuman conditions of detention, the activist’s health deteriorated: medical conditions exacerbated, especially of kidneys and gastrointestinal tract, he started having back, heart problems, had persistent headache due to sinusitis. As Volodymyr was unwell, an ambulance was called several times right during the court hearings.

On December 22, 2016, at a court hearing when new preventive measures were considered, Volodymyr stated he required medical treatment due to the exacerbation of chronic bronchitis and severe back pain. He also reported that in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, where he was detained at that moment, there were only 14 bunks for 34 inmates in the cell¹⁶⁴.

On December 28, 2016, according to Balukh’s wife, an ambulance was called to his cell at the Rozdolne temporary detention facility, where he had been transported

164 See Detention of Ukrainian Volodymyr Balukh threatens his health: <https://crimeahrg.org/ru/nahozhdenie-ukraintsa-vladimira-baluha-pod-strazhey-ugrozhaet-ego-zdorovyu/>

the day earlier. The physician did not disclose the diagnosis, but only provided the wife with a list of required medicines.

In January 2017, while in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Volodymyr had exacerbation of urinary stone disease, however, detention administrators refused to transfer him to the infirmary. In addition, the very poor quality of food in the pre-trial detention center aggravated his disease of the gastrointestinal tract. At the same time his lawyer after the visit reported that there were visible traces of physical abuse on Volodymyr's face.

“In April 2017, Volodymyr stated that he was subjected to ethnic discrimination in the police temporary detention facility in Rozdolne, where he had been transferred, including by the head of the temporary detention facility, Valery Tkachenko, who insulted him and threatened him with violence¹⁶⁵. On August 13, 2017, Balukh's lawyer filed a complaint against the head of the temporary detention center Valery Tkachenko for beating his client, providing the CCTV footage as a proof. However, instead of the investigation, additional criminal charges were pressed, for alleged use of violence against the head of the police temporary detention facility. Later Balukh told that Tkachenko came to his cell on weekends, drunk, swore at him and repeatedly stated that “Ukrainians should be wiped out as a species”¹⁶⁶.

On March 19, 2018, while in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center Volodymyr Balukh went on hunger strike, which continued for over 200 days. As a result of the hunger strike, he lost over 30% of his weight. At the same time, during the hunger strike, Volodymyr was held in standard multi-occupancy cells and did not receive any medical treatment. Later Balukh was transferred to a single cell with video surveillance (even in the toilet), repeatedly informants were put in the same cell with him. Later, in order to avoid forced feeding, Balukh began to consume daily two glasses of oatmeal jelly, 50–70 grams of crackers made from black bread and drank tea with honey. Consequently, detention administrators transferred Volodymyr to a multi-occupancy cell, arguing that Balukh allegedly had stopped the hunger strike. As a result of those actions of prison staff the political prisoner had to start dry fasting¹⁶⁷. Notably, detention administrators did not ensure the conditions required for dry fasting, and instead started pressurizing him. Thus, detention staff repeatedly threatened him with physical violence and frequently searched his cell, even at night, disturbing Volodymyr's sleep; they also documented alleged breach of the internal rules, not allowing Volodymyr to read the document. Notably, in January 2019, the de facto Kerch city court refused to release Volodymyr Balukh on parole, arguing that he allegedly committed 51 disciplinary violations during his detention in the pre-trial detention center.

In April 2018, officials of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, despite the authorization from the de facto court, twice did not admit Archbishop Clement, who was Volodymyr Balukh's voluntary defense counselor, thereby restricting the performance of religious rites and violating the right to defense in criminal proceedings. In addition, the detention

165 See Victoria Veselova, Volodymyr Balukh. Life after the conviction: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/28734823.html>

166 See “To wipe out Ukrainians.” Ukrainian activist spoke about the insults in the Crimean temporary detention facility: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/29313752.html>

167 See Political Prisoner Volodymyr Balukh started dry fasting: https://24tv.ua/politzakljuchennyj_vladimir_baluh_objavil_suhuju_golodovku_n988213?utm_source=rss&lang=ru

administrators refused to give him water, arguing that Balukh was on a hunger strike anyway. Also, after one of the court hearings, Volodymyr Balukh was beaten by escorting him Federal Penitentiary Service officers.

In June 2018, it became known that during the night Sergei Berezhnoy, the head of the pre-trial detention center, personally searched the Balukh's cell, and afterwards the activist as a preventive measure was placed in the "glass" (a narrow cell in which one could only stand or sit). In August 2018, the activist had severe liver pain, but no medical treatment was provided.

“ On September 14, 2018, Sergei Berezhnoy, the head of the pre-trial detention center, came to the Volodymyr's cell, who was still on a hunger strike at that time, and told him to kneel down. After Balukh refused, he was knocked to the floor and severely beaten. After the beating, Balukh's lawyer was not allowed to see him, possibly in order not to see the traces of beating¹⁶⁸. In addition, prison administrators video-recorded Balukh's forced statement that nothing had happened, and that the detention staff treated him well. Also, lawyer Olga Dinze mentioned several incidents when masked detention staff searched Balukh's cell, and beat and electrocuted some of his cellmates¹⁶⁹.

On March 15, 2019, Volodymyr Balukh arrived in the Tver pre-trial detention center No. 1. He was tortured immediately upon his arrival. According to Balukh, detention staff threatened him with sexual violence, beat him using various means that increased his suffering, and used a stun gun. In addition, the activist was placed in solitary confinement on fabricated grounds.¹⁷⁰

Volodymyr Balukh was transferred from the Tver pre-trial detention center to the Torzhok penal colony No. 4 in the Tver Region of the Russian Federation, where he was repeatedly placed in solitary confinement for fabricated reasons (in total, he spent in solitary confinement over 2 months)¹⁷¹. Lawyer Olga Dinze said that while in solitary confinement Volodymyr ate only bread and drank water (in solitary confinement it is forbidden to eat food from relatives' packages, while the food provided was of poor quality) and the cell temperature was very low (because of the cold his limbs were numb and he was shivering)¹⁷², hence his health deteriorated significantly. In addition, upon his arrival Volodymyr was tortured: he was made to do the splits and beaten from the back by several people, stripped naked, forced to perform various degrading acts. According to Olga Dinze, during her visit to Volodymyr Balukh, she noticed that his legs were swollen, which indicated worsening renal function. Notably, prison administrators in the Torzhok penal colony No. 4 repeatedly threatened Balukh with physical injury and did not allow him to see the Ukrainian consul, referring to the fact that Balukh allegedly was a Russian citizen¹⁷³. Probably, prison administrators could have imposed the

168 See "He did not kneel so he was laid on the concrete." Starving Volodymyr Balukh was beaten in the Crimean pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/vladimira-baluha-izbili-v-krymskom-sizo/29490631.html>

169 See Searches and pressure. The lawyer spoke about the conditions in which starving Balukh is detained: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-obyski-i-pressing-advokat-rasskazala-ob-usloviyah-soderzhania-baluha/29482277.html>

170 See Crimea.Realities, September 16, 2019. Balukh tells about torture: <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?ref=external&v=470900430432009>

171 See Artem Laptiev, Months in solitary confinement: Balukh's defense will seek non-pecuniary damage in court: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-sentabre-sud-rassmotrit-galobu-baluha/30156158.html>

172 See Oleg Trokhimovich, "The limbs go numb from the cold": why Balukh is kept in solitary confinement: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/pochemu-baluha-derzhat-v-sizo/29958530.html>

173 See "Stripped naked, hit on the liver and kidneys" — Balukh spoke about torture in a Russian prison (video): <https://ru.krymr.com/a/video-balukh-rasskazal-o-pytkah-v-rossiyskoy-tyurme/30167217.html>

Russian citizenship on Volodymyr Balukh. In addition, prison administrators took away Volodymyr's vitamins and his prayer book.

At the end of June 2019, Volodymyr Balukh again went on a hunger strike demanding warm clothes, the return of his prayer book and the visit of Ukrainian consul¹⁷⁴. That hunger strike lasted 11 days and was stopped because his demands were met. At the same time, lawyer Olga Dinze noted that political prisoner's medical condition was highly unsatisfactory: he had severe headaches, pains in the joints and chest, and swelling of the limbs. Despite this, the prison administrators refused a visit by a physician, without any explanation.

Notably, in 2018, at the request of the European Court of Human Rights, the Russian government provided the Court with an official information about the medical condition of several political prisoners, including Volodymyr Balukh. The Russian side stated that, as of the date of the submission, Balukh was not on a hunger strike and regularly received medical treatment, which was not true.

Oleh Prykhodko

On October 9, 2019, Russian FSB officers detained Oleh Prykhodko, a resident of the Saky District. He was known for the fact that after the occupation of Crimea he did not hide his pro-Ukrainian views and openly displayed Ukrainian national symbols. According to the official FSB statement, Prykhodko as a member of Ukrainian extremist organizations, was planning an explosion of an administrative building in Crimea (articles 223.1, 205 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Later he was also charged with illegal possession of explosives (part 1 of article 222.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After the application of the preventive measure, the activist has been detained in the special block of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center.

It is known that between the moments when he was detained and preventive measure was applied, Prykhodko was not given food for the whole day. Officials of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, despite a request from the lawyer, refuse to let the activist see the priest, thus violating his religious rights. At the same time, the Federal Penitentiary Service of the Russian Federation first reported that Prykhodko allegedly had not requested any meeting with a priest, and later that the meeting with the priest could not be arranged, as it could lead to the disclosure of certain information, potentially impeding the investigation. Motivated by those events, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova approached her Russian counterpart, but without any result¹⁷⁵. At the same time, the activist is kept in a special block of the pre-trial detention center in complete informational isolation.

“ In October 2019, lawyer Nazim Sheikhmambetov reported that the detention administrators handed over medicines from relatives with a delay (Oleh Prykhodko has urologic and gastrointestinal diseases)¹⁷⁶. In January 2020, Oleh Prykhodko informed about the

¹⁷⁴ See Ukrainian activist Balukh in prison again went on hunger strike — Russian bishop: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-ukrainslii-aktivist-baluh-snova-obyavil-golodovku/30023705.html>

¹⁷⁵ See Prykhodko, an activist, who was arrested in Simferopol, is still not allowed to receive priest — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-prihodko-v-tretij-raz-otkazali-v-svidanii-so-svjashchenikom/30421769.html>

¹⁷⁶ See In the Crimean pre-trial detention center, an activist Prykhodko is not given medicine — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-prihodko-ne-otdaut-lekarstva-v-sizo/30223363.html>

deterioration of his health (stomach pain, chills, weakness, body aches). Due to his poor health, he laid down on his bunk during the day, for what disciplinary measures were applied by detention administrators.

Oleh Prykhodko also informed his lawyer Nazim Sheikhmambet that the quality of food in the detention center was highly unsatisfactory (for example, damp bread was given), drinking water was not provided, the radiator in his cell was broken, hence the temperature was very low.

“Vedzhie Kashka Case”

Bekir Dehermendzhi

Bekir Dehermendzhi, born in 1960, a member of the Crimean Tatar national movement, the father of Mustafa Dehermendzhi, involved in the so-called “February 26 Case”, was detained on November 23, 2017 in Simferopol (in connection with the so-called “Vedzhie Kashka Case”). During the detention, force was used. Bekir Dehermendzhi and three other Crimean Tatar activists were charged with extortion (part 2 of article 163 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Human rights activists declared that the case was fabricated for political reasons. On the day of the arrest, Vedzhie Kashka, an 83-year-old lady and a veteran of the Crimean Tatar national movement, died after being detained due to experienced psychological burdens.

Bekir Dehermendzhi has chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and the 3rd degree of disability. Despite health contraindications, detention was applied as a preventive measure. Only on January 24, 2019, the preventive measure was changed to house arrest. Thus, Bekir Dehermendzhi spent 1 year and 2 months in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. On April 17, 2019, the de facto Kiev District Court of Simferopol gave Bekir Dehermendzhi a suspended sentence of three year imprisonment with a probation period of 3 years.

“Due to unsatisfactory conditions in the pre-trial detention center (damp, cold, high humidity), in December 2017, Bekir Dehermendzhi’s chronic obstructive pulmonary disease aggravated. Medical treatment by detention administrators was not provided, which led to pulmonary edema and pneumonia. Only on the 5th day, after numerous requests from his lawyer and after Bekir Dehermendzhi lost consciousness¹⁷⁷, he was transferred to the hospital intensive care unit, where he was connected to the mechanical ventilator (3 days in a coma, 7 days in intensive care). Neither his relatives nor his lawyer could visit him in his hospital room. Later Bekir Dehermendzhi was transferred to the hospital division of pulmonary medicine in a stable serious condition. Due to shortage of beds, his bed trolley was placed in the hospital corridor. In general, Bekir Dehermendzhi stayed in the hospital for 3 weeks, and later was brought back to the pre-trial detention center. Later, the political prisoner was taken to the hospital several times for examination. However, he mentioned that the examinations were very superficial (one of them lasted only 3 minutes), and he was not informed about the examination outcome¹⁷⁸. During one of the court hearings, Bekir Dehermendzhi was not feeling well and an ambulance was called, the doctors gave him an oxygen gas mask, and he wore the gas mask during the hearing¹⁷⁹.

In March 2018, due to the conditions of detention, Dehermendzhi again began to develop pneumonia. No medical treatment was provided. In addition, he started having significant pressure drops and severe headaches. In April, detention

177 See Midat Khalilov, “The condition is very critical”: what happens to the persons involved in the “Kashka case”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/sostoyanie-ochen-kriticheskoe-cto-s-figurantami-dela-vedzhie-kashka/29704060.html>

178 See Oleg Trokhimovich, Ilya Tarasov, “They Are on the Edge”: In what way the prolonged trial may threaten the defendants in the “Kashka case”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/delo-vedzhie-kashka-oni-stoyat-na-krayu/29703601.html>

179 See Poor quality healthcare in Crimea threatens the life of prisoners: <https://crimeahrg.org/ru/sostoyanie-meditsinskoy-pomoshhi-v-kryimu-ugrozhayet-zhizni-zaklyuchennyih/>

administrators transferred him to the infirmary, although the conditions there were highly unsatisfactory. In addition, the infirmary room was damp and humid, which was dangerous in case of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease.

Bekir Dehermendzhi's relatives told that they handed him over powerful medicines, however, whenever they were taken, the patient should have been regularly tested, which was impossible in the detention center¹⁸⁰. In addition, detention staff refused to accept some of the medicines, arguing that they should have been accompanied by relevant documents¹⁸¹.

In November 2018, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova said that she had been informed about Bekir Dehermendzhi's transfer to the special block of the detention center. Later, Dehermendzhi's lawyer stated that the cell where he was held was very cold and that aggravated his medical condition, as he had an allergic reaction to cold temperatures and started to suffocate. In particular, during the court hearing on January 9, 2019, Bekir Dehermendzhi, due to poor health, could not talk and actively participate in the hearing¹⁸². Despite this, the court repeatedly refused to change the preventive measure to house arrest. The preventive measure was changed only on January 24, 2019. In early February, the de facto court allowed Dehermendzhi to come to the hospital in the morning and stay till noon.

Ruslan Trubach¹⁸³

Ruslan Trubach, born in 1966, a member of the Crimean Tatar national movement, an activist, was detained on November 23, 2017 in Simferopol (in connection with the “Vedzhie Kashka Case”). Ruslan Trubach, as well as Bekir Dehermendzhi, Asan Chapukh and Kazim Ametov, was charged with extortion (part 2 of article 163 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). The criminal case was fabricated for political reasons. Despite Ruslan Trubach's age, the detention in the Simferopol pre-trial detention was applied as a preventive measure. On January 24, 2019, the de facto Kiev District of Simferopol court changed the preventive measure to house arrest. On April 17, 2019, the court gave Ruslan Trubach a suspended sentence of three year imprisonment with a probation period of 3 years.

From the moment of being detained on November 23 till December 2, 2017, Ruslan Trubach was held in the Bakhchisaray temporary detention facility. On December 2, he was transferred to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center and placed in the “transit” cell, where he spent 9 days. According to Trubach, the cell measured 8 square meters and there were 10 persons. Thus, only 0.8 sq.m was available per person. On December 11, he was transferred for a week to the Simferopol temporary detention facility, where he was held in a cell measuring 6 square meters together with another inmate (3 square meters available per person). At the same time, neither Ruslan Trubach's relatives nor his lawyer were informed about the transfer.

180 See Pavel Novikov, In the pre-trial detention center without medical treatment: the defendants in the “Vedzhie Kashka case” are at risk of death while being detained: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/29255011.html>

181 See Natalia Smolyarchuk. The health of elderly Crimean Tatar activists dramatically deteriorated in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center: https://lb.ua/news/2017/12/08/384305_pozhilih_krimskotatarskih.html

182 See “Slow murder.” Lawyers talked about the health of the defendants of the “Vedzhie Kashka case”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-advokaty-figurantov-dela-kashka-rasskazali-ob-ih-zdorovje/29699456.html>

183 The information is based on the data received by NGO CrimeaSOS in December 2019.

“ From December 18, 2017 until the change of the preventive measure in January 2019, Ruslan Trubach was detained in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. During his stay in the pre-trial detention center, Trubach was held in five different cells. Four of them were overcrowded, hence not everyone was allocated a bunk (they slept in turns), and only 0.8 square meters or 2.4 square meters were available per person, hence space standards were not met. Also, according to Trubach, in four cells the toilet was just a hole in the floor without proper drainage, that was neither separated from the living space nor from the space where inmates ate. As a result there was strong unpleasant odor in the cells. Cell overcrowding and small size additionally aggravated the situation. There was no drinking or hot water in all the cells, because of the dim light eyes hurt and it was difficult to read or write. Ruslan Trubach also said that there was no ventilation in the cells where he was held. In two cells the windows were unglazed and prisoners covered them with blankets, hence in winter the temperature dropped to 13-15 °C, and in summer the cell was so stuffy that it was difficult to breathe. According to Ruslan Trubach, there were no taps in the bathhouse on the territory of the pre-trial detention center, the water flew directly from the pipes, there was mold on the walls. There was also no place for drying clothes: all prisoners after the shower at the same time dried clothes in the cell, which significantly increased its humidity. Another serious problem, according to Trubach, was that smoking prisoners were held together with non-smokers, as a result the latter had to breathe tobacco smoke.

Between December 13, 2018 and January 24, 2019, Trubach was held in a cell with another political prisoner Edem Bekirov. Trubach told that they were subjected to round-the-clock video surveillance, that led to increased psychological burden. In addition, prisoners could not switch off the light themselves and there was electric light day and night, what made them suffer, especially at night.

According to Ruslan Trubach, the food in the pre-trial detention center was of poor quality and the amount was insufficient (one serving, not more than 200 grams). Basically, the diet consisted of porridge and salted cabbage. Fruits, sweets, salt and certain types of meat (e.g. beef) were not given at all.

Trubach also said that there was no place in the pre-trial detention center where religious rites could be performed and that the attitude of the detention staff towards performing of religious rites was not welcoming. Some religious practices were banned (e.g., Adhan, the Islamic call to prayer).

Like other prisoners, Ruslan Trubach, despite his requests, was not given any medical treatment. He had a knee injury, because of which he could not climb to the top bunk.

On January 24, 2019, Trubach was transferred to house arrest. In February 2019, the de facto Kiev District Court of Simferopol allowed Ruslan Trubach to visit the hospital to undergo medical examinations. After being released from the detention facility, Trubach had problems with his stomach, intestines, and teeth, and his eyesight deteriorated significantly¹⁸⁴.

184 See Alexandra Surgan, “To go into prison and see something good.” The story of Ruslan Trubach: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/popast-v-turmu-i-uvidet-horoshee-istoriya-ruslana-trubacha/29802981.html>

Asan Chapukh

Asan Chapukh, born in 1953, an activist of the Crimean Tatar national movement, was detained on November 23, 2017 in Simferopol (in connection with the "Vedzhie Kashka Case"). Like other defendants in the case, he was charged with extortion (part 2 of article 163 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Later, he was additionally charged with the alleged possession of ammunition (part 1 of article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After being detained and until the preventive measure was changed for house arrest in November 2018, he was held in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, where he went on hunger strike three times, each lasting from 3 to 5 days¹⁸⁵. On April 17, 2019, Asan Chapukh got a suspended sentence of three year imprisonment with a probation period of 3 years.

On December 6, 2017, two weeks after the transfer to the pre-trial detention center, Asan Chapukh suffered a microstroke, as a result of which his right side was paralyzed. The officials of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center ignored the requests from Asan Chapukh and his lawyer Ayder Azamatov to provide medical treatment and transfer Asan to the hospital. The infirmary staff refused to confirm that he had had a microstroke (only a hypertensive crisis was officially diagnosed)¹⁸⁶. As reported, the treatment was limited to injections of medicines that had been brought by the relatives. At the end of December, in protest against the lack of medical treatment, Asan Chapukh went on a hunger strike, which lasted for one day and later was stopped for health reasons. Evgeny Anikanov, the head of the detention infirmary, said that he was ordered to refer Chapukh to the hospital, but for unknown reasons it was not done.¹⁸⁷ On December 28, it became known that Chapukh's right leg was numb, lost after the microstroke mobility of his arm and shoulder was not regained, speech disorders persisted, and the left eye got affected¹⁸⁸. After lawyer's complains, Chapukh was taken to the hospital for examination several times, but his diagnosis was not disclosed.

At the same time, during the court hearings, Asan Chapukh repeatedly complained that he was unwell. On August 23, 2018, due to high blood pressure, he was unable to take part in the court hearing.

On September 15, 2018, as a result of the failure to provide medical treatment, Asan Chapukh again went on a hunger strike that lasted 5 days. On September 25, his health deteriorated and from the Simferopol pre-trial detention center he was transported to the Simferopol City Hospital No. 7¹⁸⁹. On October 10, the preventive measure was changed to house arrest as a result of his critical medical condition and failure to provide necessary treatment in the pre-trial detention. On January 7, 2019, while still under house arrest, Asan Chapukh had a gastritis attack and was

¹⁸⁵ The information provided to NGO "CrimeaSOS" by lawyer Ayder Azamatov in March 2020.

¹⁸⁶ See Victoria Veselova, Artem Laptiev, "Totally different person": Asan Chapukh left the pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/eto-sovsem-drugoj-chelovek-chapuh-vyshel-iz-sizo/29538617.html>

¹⁸⁷ See Chapukh, involved in the "Veggie Kashka case" went on a hunger strike in the Crimean pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28929338.html>

¹⁸⁸ See The arrested Crimean Tatar activist Chapukh was examined by a doctor-lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/28945856.html>

¹⁸⁹ See In Simferopol, the arrested Crimean Tatar activist was hospitalized - relatives: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-chapuha-uvezli-iz-sizo-v-bolnitsu/29508702.html>

urgently hospitalized in serious condition. On January 24, after the court hearing he again felt extremely unwell, and his relatives called an ambulance.

On February 5, the de facto Kiev District Court of Simferopol allowed him to visit the hospital in the mornings. On April 17, 2019, he got a suspended sentence.

“Thus, during the year that Asan Chapukh spent in the pre-trial detention, his health gradually deteriorated. Necessary medical treatment was never provided, examination results by FSIN officers were not disclosed, which led to serious aggravation of his medical condition. During his stay in the pre-trial detention center, he lost about 15 kgs, the mobility of the limbs after the microstroke was not fully regained. According to lawyer Ayder Azamatov, as a result of lengthy detention in the pre-trial detention center and severe stress caused by the refusal to provide medical treatment despite the seriousness of condition, Asan Chapukh is currently struggling with a low mood and anxiety. Chapukh said that in the detention center he had been turned into a “vegetable”¹⁹⁰. Chapukh plans registering as disabled. In autumn of 2019, he was diagnosed with tonsil and throat cancer (stage 4).

Kazim Ametov

Kazim Ametov, a member of the Crimean Tatar national movement, is the fourth person involved in the “Vedzhie Kashka Cases” (charged under part 2 of article 163 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). Ametov was also detained on November 23, 2017 in Simferopol. Like other persons involved in the case, Ametov was detained in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. The preventive measure was changed to house arrest on January 24, 2019. On April 17, 2019 the court gave him a suspended sentence of three year imprisonment with a probation period of 3 years. Notably, Kazim Ametov was illegally detained in the pre-trial detention center from January 15 to March 14, 2018, since Mr. Mozhelyansky, the de facto judge of the Kiev district court probably mistakenly indicated another person’s name in the decision to extend the preventive measure.

In February 2018, lawyer Emil Kurbedinov said that Kazim Ametov’s health deteriorated (vision problems, hypertension, chest pain) because of unbearable conditions in the pre-trial detention center.

“According to Kurbedinov’s information, there were unsanitary conditions in Kazim Ametov’s cell: it was overrun with rats, bedbugs, was damp, lacked fresh air, and food was unsuitable for consumption¹⁹¹. In October 2018, Emil Kurbedinov again stated that Ametov’s health deteriorated even further (eyesight deterioration, blood pressure, heart and stomach problems)¹⁹². In December, he was transferred to a double occupancy cell in a special block in the pre-trial detention center (damp, cold, concrete walls), where video surveillance was maintained around the clock¹⁹³. After a few days in the special block

190 See Oleg Trokhimovich, Ilya Tarasov, “They Are on the Edge”: In what way the prolonged trial may threaten the defendants in the “Vedzhie Kashka case”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/delo-vedzhie-kashka-oni-stoyat-na-krayu/29703601.html>

191 See Health of an arrested defendant in the “Vedzhie Kashka case” Ametov is deteriorating – lawyer: <https://investigator.org.ua/news-2/205638/>

192 See Crimean Solidarity, October 21, 2018, Comments by Emil Kurbedinov after visiting Kazim Ametov in the pre-trial detention center: <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?ref=external&v=342073513234591>

193 See Simferopol: two of the defendants in the “Vedzie Kashka case” were transferred to the special block of the pre-trial detention center: ru.krymr.com/a/news-figurantov-dela-vedzhye-kashka-pereveli-v-specblok-sizo/29661304.html

that were spent in a damp, cold cell, Kazim Ametov developed kidney failure. At the beginning of January 2019, the daughter of Kazim Ametov reported that her father had recurrent choking spells, high blood pressure, and continued to have kidney and back problems. According to his daughter, Kazim Ametov in the special block was not allowed to go for a walk¹⁹⁴. In addition, for six months he kept requesting a medical examination in hospital, which in the end hadn't been performed (once he was taken to the hospital, but the examination was not performed because of an equipment malfunction). Kazim Ametov's daughter mentioned that he arrived swollen at one of the court hearings.

Ametov's lawyer called his condition critical, and stated that walls of the Ametov's cell in the detention center were covered in mold. No medical treatment was provided by the detention administrators during his whole stay there (only some injections were made that did not improve his condition). On January 9, the Ukrainian Ombudsman Lyudmila Denisova asked the Russian Ombudsman Tatyana Moskalkova to ensure that medical treatment was provided to Ametov¹⁹⁵.

Only on January 24, 2019, the preventive measure was changed to house arrest. At the beginning of March 2019, the de facto court granted a motion to remove restrictions, enabling thus Ametov's visits to healthcare facilities. In April 2019, Kazim Ametov was given a suspended sentence.

194 See Midat Khalilov, "The condition is very critical": what happens to the defendants in the "Kashka Vedzhie case": <https://ru.krymr.com/a/sostoyanie-ochen-kriticheskoe-cto-s-figurantami-dela-vedzhie-kashka/29704060.html>

195 See Lyudmila Denisova, December 19, 2018: <https://www.facebook.com/denisovaombudsman/photos/a.708811965858222/2332740150132054/?type=3&theater>

Case of Ismail Ramazanov

Ismail Ramazanov, a Crimean Tatar, was detained by Russian security forces on January 23, 2018. Ramazanov was charged with allegedly inciting hatred towards Russians on the Zello Internet radio app, as well as with alleged possession of ammunition (part 1 of article 282, part 1 of article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). While being detained, Ramazanov was tortured in order to make him confess. After the application of the preventive measure, he was detained in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. On July 16, 2018, Ismail Ramazanov was released on his own recognizance due to the expiration of the pre-trial detention time limit (6 months for crimes of medium gravity). In November 2018, the charge under part 1 of art. 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (illegal possession of cartridges) was dropped for lack of evidence, and in January 2019 the charge under part 1 of art. 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation was dropped as well, due to the partial decriminalization of the article.

In an interview with NGO “CrimeaSOS”¹⁹⁶, Ismail Ramazanov said that during the search he was tortured by FSB officers, among whom he identified Mr. Shambazov and Mr. Maksimenko. Also during the torture an FSB investigator Ms. Glukhova was present. After the search, he was taken out of the house and continued to be tortured in the car (white Volga GAZ with tinted windows, license plates unknown).

“ He was tortured by Mr. Shambazov, Mr. Maksimenko and two other unidentified FSB officers wearing ski masks. According to Ismail Ramazanov, they threatened to rape him with a metal baton, he was blindfolded, beaten for his refusal to become an informant. He lost consciousness because of the beating. After he regained consciousness on the floor of the car, FSB officers started jumping on him, hit him on the head, kidneys and in the temple area. Ramazanov felt a sharp pain in his spine and ribs (later it turned out that 2 ribs were broken and a spinal disc was displaced). Ismail Ramazanov recalls that during the break between the beatings he was asked to sign a document containing Crimean Tatar names. After he refused, FSB officers continued the beatings, tried to strangle him with a plastic bag, break his fingers, threatened to shoot him in the knees. In addition, they demanded to give them the password to his mobile phone. After the security forces saw that there was nothing illegal on the phone, they got angry and continued beating him.

After that, Ismail Ramazanov was brought to a basement. He could not determine his exact location, because during the transportation he had a bag over his head, but he was sure that the basement was located somewhere in Simferopol. There, Ramazanov’s hands were tied with a wire and officers threatened to turn the electricity on. At the same time, the above mentioned FSB officers stated that they had previously subjected Crimean Tatars to electric torture. They continued beating Ismail Ramazanov, threatened to take him into the woods and shot him in the knees, as well as to harm his family members. When Ismail Ramazanov began to pray, the officers intensified the beating.

¹⁹⁶ The interview was conducted by NGO “CrimeaSOS” in February 2020.

On the same day he was taken to the FSB Investigation department in Simferopol. He could hardly breathe as he had been beaten so severely. Ramazanov asked investigator Ms. Glukhova to provide medical treatment, however, she replied that she would ask the doctor to write in official documents that no bodily harm had been inflicted. In the Investigation department Ramazanov was beaten by FSB officer Mr. Shambazov in the presence of Ms. Glukhova. After numerous requests, he was finally taken to the Simferopol City Hospital No. 6. According to Ramazanov, the head physician of the hospital was clearly afraid.

“ In the evening of the same day, Ismail Ramazanov was taken to the temporary detention facility in Simferopol. The temporary detention staff forced him to strip naked and do squats. M. Shambazov and Mr. Maksimenko were present at that time. According to Ismail Ramazanov, detention staff called him a “bonehead”. He was placed in a double occupancy cold cell, where there was no blanket, his outer clothing was taken away. The next day, before the court hearing, Ramazanov was briefly brought back to the FSB Investigation department. There he was insulted by Mr. Shambazov and Mr. Maksimenko. In particular, they called him “bonehead”, “blacky”, “wanker”, adding that they would wipe out all Crimean Tatar people.

At the court hearing, when the preventive measure was applied, Ismail Ramazanov stated that he had been subjected to torture and indicated the persons who had tortured him. However, the judge ignored those allegations, as well as lawyer's requests for medical treatment. After the court hearing, Mr. Shambazov threatened Ramazanov that he had already asked Mr. Berezhny, the head of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, to put Ramazanov into the “press-cell”.

While being detained in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Ismail Ramazanov started having health problems as a result of the inflicted torture (his kidneys were hurting, and he developed leg swelling). Despite numerous requests, medical treatment was not provided. As Ismail Ramazanov recalls, for some time he was kept in a cell with another political prisoner Uzeir Abdullaiev (the defendant in the “Hizb ut-Tahrir case”), whose post-operative wounds were not dressed by the infirmary doctor.

Upon arriving in the pre-trial detention center, for 13 days Ismail Ramazanov was held in the “quarantine”, a very damp cell in the basement. There was shortage of bunk beds, hence the inmates had to sleep in turns.

After the “quarantine” Ramazanov was transferred to a cell where water was flowing down from the ceiling and there was mold. Detention staff told the inmates that a TB ward was located above the cell. As walls and ceilings had wholes, inmates in the cell were at risk of contracting TB. Ismail also said that in all the cells the toilet was not separated from the living space, there was no air extraction system, hence there was strong odor in the cells. The cells were overrun with rats, cockroaches and other insects. According to Ismail Ramazanov, in the detention center in the beginning it was allowed to take a shower once a week, and later only once every two weeks. The food was unsuitable for consumption, as a result Ismail and other prisoners ate mainly food from the packages provided by their relatives. However, detention staff cut all food items in half so that they

spoiled faster. Ismail Ramazanov is sure that this was done on purpose, as the cut-in-half food as a rule belonged to those who were charged under “political” articles. Ramazanov also said detention staff did not give him the majority of letters from his relatives and friends.

However, any complaints about everyday issues and about the provision of medical treatment were completely ignored by the detention staff. Ismail Ramazanov recalls that in some months he sent complaints daily, but there was no response. Only after the visit of the Russian Ombudsman Tatyana Moskalkova his relatives were allowed to bring him medicines.

Later, Ramazanov was placed in a special block of the pre-trial detention center, that was characterized by even stricter conditions of detention in comparison with other cells. In particular, every hour, even at night, checks were held.

According to Ismail Ramazanov, on the days of court hearings or when transferred to another cell, detention staff forced him to strip naked. Also, on the days of court hearings in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center inmates usually leave the detention center before breakfast, without receiving neither packed lunches nor water. Thus, on court hearing days inmates do not receive water or food for the whole day. Ismail Ramazanov said that on one of the court hearing days he was unwell due to dehydration.

Currently, Ismail Ramazanov resides in mainland Ukraine, he left the occupied territory because of further prosecution (in particular, he had been given a warning that any “terrorist activity” is prohibited). Ramazanov still has kidney and spinal problems that were caused by torture.

Case of Yevhenii Karakashev

Yevhenii Karakashev, an activist of the leftist movement from Yevpatoria, was detained with brute force on February 1, 2018. He was charged with calls for terrorism on social networks (article 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, part 2 of article 205.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After partial decriminalization of art. 282 of the Criminal Code, criminal charges under this article were dropped. After the application of the preventive measure, Karakashev was detained in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. Before the trial started, he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. On April 19, 2019, he was sentenced to 6 years in a standard penal colony. He is serving his sentence in penal colony No. 1 of Kabardino-Balkaria, where he was transferred on October 4, 2019. Russian Human Rights Center Memorial stated “with a high degree of probability” that the case was politically motivated.

In the pre-trial detention center Yevhenii Karakashev was visited by two officers of the Center for Combating Extremism, who tried to force him to incriminate himself.¹⁹⁷ In September 2018, it became known that Karakashev had severe pain in the shoulder (the shoulder was visually deformed), joints, had swollen legs and insomnia. Because of his shoulder pain Karakashev 16 times requested in writing an appointment with an orthopedic specialist, his lawyer as well requested the appointment, but all the requests were ignored. The healthcare staff of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center that saw Karakashev at his request, told him that they could not help him and recommended him to take vitamins¹⁹⁸. On October 28, 2018, while in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Yevhenii Karakashev probably had a hypertensive crisis¹⁹⁹. As Karakashev had had medical training, he could make such an assumption. The infirmary physician examined him and gave him medicines only on the next day.

Yevhenii Karakashev's lawyer, Aleksey Ladin, said that his client did not receive medical treatment in the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center. In particular, he had headaches, dizziness, pain in the joints and back, however, the detention physician only interviewed him²⁰⁰.

“After his transfer to the penal colony no. 1 in Kabardino-Balkaria, Karakashev was twice placed in solitary confinement for 15 days, allegedly for dress-code infraction²⁰¹. First time Yevhenii Karakashev was placed in solitary confinement when he refused to become an informant, what had been suggested to him by the deputy head of the colony Mr. Gabiev²⁰². On November 1, 2019, the disciplinary commis-

197 See A leftist activist from Yevpatoria claims that he was intimidated by Russian security forces: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-levyi-aktivist-iz-evpatorii-utverzdaet-cto-ego-zapugivali-rossiiskie-siloviki/29612513.html>

198 See A leftist activist from Yevpatoria Karakashev has severe shoulder pain — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-u-levogo-aktivista-karakasheva-problemu-so-zdoroviem/29512515.html>

199 See The health of a leftist activist from Yevpatoria deteriorated in the pre-trial detention — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-u-karakasheva-uhudshilos-zdorovie/29512515.html>

200 See “I Thought Alcoholics were Breaking in”. In Russia, the Crimean anarchist is on trial: <https://memohrc.org/ru/monitorings/dumal-cto-lomyatsya-alkogoliki-v-rossii-sudyat-krymskogo-anarhista>

201 See Alexey Ladin, November 7, 2019: : <https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=2454865804630790&set=a.1221726251278091&type=3&theater>

202 See Conditions of detention tightened for year for the convicted activist from Yevpatoria Yevhenii Karakashev: graty.me/news/osuzhdennomu-aktivistu-iz-evpatorii-evgeniyu-karakashev-u-na-god-uzhestochili-usloviya-prebyvaniya-v-kolonii/

sion of the colony decided to place Karakashev in the most stringent type of isolation in the Russian penitentiary system, i.e. „Single cell-type facility” (EPKT), for a whole year. Karakashev’s cell measures 3 by 4 meters, there are two more prisoners, and video surveillance is maintained in the cell²⁰³. He is not given any periodicals or letters. In addition, he is allowed only one small package and one short visit once in six months. Currently, Yevhenii Karakashev has high blood pressure and back pain.

203 See Sergey Mokrushin, “He is pressurized because he refuses to become an informant”: how Crimean Karakashev is serving his sentence in Russia: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/kak-otbyvaet-nakazanie-krymskiy-politusnik-evgeniy-karakashev/30426277.html>

Case of Nariman Memedeminov

Nariman Memedeminov is a citizen journalist, media coordinator of the Crimean Solidarity human rights initiative. He was detained by Russian law enforcement officers in Simferopol on March 22, 2018. He was charged with spreading terrorist propaganda for showing on his YouTube channel several videos clips about Islam in 2013-2014 (part 2 of article 205.2 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation). After being detained, Nariman Memedeminov was placed in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center; later, at the beginning of June 2019, he was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1. On October 2, 2019, Memedeminov was sentenced to 2.5 years in an open colony settlement. In mid-December 2019, the journalist was transferred to a pre-trial detention center in the Russian city of Shakhty. His lawyer lodged an appeal against his sentence. At the same time, Russian Human Rights Center “Memorial” declared Nariman Memedeminov a political prisoner and explained his criminal charges by his active participation in the initiative “Crimean Solidarity”. Several international human rights organizations spoke out in support of the political prisoner²⁰⁴. On September 21, 2020, Nariman Memedeminov was released after serving out his prison term.

On May 14, 2018, Nariman Memedeminov was subjected to compulsory psychiatric evaluation, although the Russian legislation does not render such examination mandatory in cases similar to Memedeminov’s. According to his lawyer Edem Semedlyayev, Memedeminov sees the compulsory psychiatric evaluation as a humiliation of honor and dignity²⁰⁵.

In early February 2019, the Simferopol detention staff preventively registered him as a person promoting extremist ideology. In addition, Nariman Memedeminov was transferred to a special block in the pre-trial detention center, where he was held in a cell measuring 8 square meters, where audio and video surveillance were maintained around the clock, and there was no hot water. In May 2019, it became known that officers of the Federal Penitentiary Service of the Russian Federation searched the cell of Nariman Memedeminov. During the search his personal notes pertaining to the case, his detention in the pre-trial detention center and violation of his rights were seized²⁰⁶. After several complaints, detention administrators returned only some of the notes. Thus, the political prisoner’s right of the defense was violated.

In addition, the journalist’s lawyer said that Memedeminov developed serious health problems in the pre-trial detention center, however, his requests for medical treatment were ignored by the detention healthcare staff (the lawyer’s complaint about the refusal of medical treatment to the FSB headquarters, to the head of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center Berezhnoy S.V., to the head of the Medical unit No. 3 was sent on January 17, 2019)²⁰⁷.

204 See 30 international human rights organizations supported the demand for the release of the Crimean journalist Nariman Memedeminov: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/5acf4cf867dda/>

205 See Blogger Memedeminov disagree with his placement in a psychiatric hospital — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news/29378912.html>

206 See In the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, searches were conducted in the cells of Crimean Tatar activists - lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-fsin-obysk-mustafaev-memedeminov/29972038.html>

207 The documents are confidential and were obtained by NGO “CrimeaSOS” when preparing this research.

“ In March 2019, the Public Monitoring Commission of Russia reported that Nariman Memedeminov’s health had significantly deteriorated. On March 14 he was supposed to undergo surgery that did not take place. Human Rights Representative of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (Ukrainian Ombudsman) Lyudmila Denisova approached her Russian counterpart Tatyana Moskalkova, indicating that the condition of the journalist was critical²⁰⁸. In addition, lawyer Emil Kurbedinov said that letters demanding medical treatment were sent to the Russian Ombudsman, to the Public Monitoring Commission, to the Prosecutor’s Office, to the head of the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, to the Directorate of the Federal Penitentiary Service. As a result, the surgery was performed only on March 29, 2019 (2 months after his health significantly deteriorated, during all this time Memedeminov experienced severe pain).²⁰⁹

Also, while in the Simferopol pre-trial detention center, Nariman Memedeminov informed his lawyer about the violation of his religious rights (food containing pork, lack of a room for prayer and other religious rites, lack of access to a Muslim chaplain)²¹⁰.

In June 2019, after the political prisoner was transferred to the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center, without any documented reason he was placed in a special block with stricter conditions of detention, which include, inter alia, complete information isolation. The detention administrators verbally mentioned that it was customary for those charged under “terrorist” articles to be placed in the special block²¹¹.

Nariman Memedeminov was kept in the Shakhty pre-trial detention center, waiting for the court of appeal to review his sentence. The court was deliberately delaying the review of his sentence²¹².

As a result of his long incarceration, he has serious problems with digestion, stomach and teeth.

208 See Denisova turned to Moskalkova because of the “critical condition” of the blogger Memedeminov: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-denisova-moskalkova-kriticheskoe-sostoyanie-memedeminova/29823668.html>

209 See In Simferopol, the arrested blogger Memedeminov had a surgery: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-v-simferopole-prooperirovali-arestovannogo-blogera-memedeminova/29851091.html>

210 The information was provided to the Social Organization “CrimeaSOS” by lawyer Edem Semedyaev in December 2019.

211 See The illegally detained journalist Memedeminov is held in the special block of the Rostov-on-Don pre-trial detention center No. 1: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/nezakonno-zatrimanogo-zhurnalista-memedeminova-mistyat-v-spetsblotsi-sizol-m-rostovnadonu/>

212 See The court deliberately delays the review of the sentence of the Crimean blogger Memedeminov — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-sud-prigovor-blogger-memedeminov/30462532.html>

Case of Oleksandr Steshenko

On April 11, 2018, Oleksandr Steshenko, a resident of Kharkiv, was abducted by officers of the Russian FSB border service at the border checkpoint Dzhankoy. Subsequently, it became known that he spent 12 days in administrative detention in Simferopol (for allegedly smoking at the train station). On April 24, law enforcement officers drove him out of the administrative detention center in a car without license plates, and afterwards Steshenko was held in the basement of the FSB headquarters until July 26, although he officially had been released on his own recognizance²¹³. Oleksandr Steshenko said he was forced to incriminate himself under torture. On the eve of the sentencing hearing, Steshenko was transported to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center.

On July 26, 2018, Steshenko was sentenced to 2 years in an open colony settlement under part 2 of art. 167 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation for alleged membership in an extremist group that “planned to commit crimes motivated by political hostility with the aim of intimidating pro-Russian Crimean Tatars and escalating interethnic tension in the territory of the Republic of Crimea.” From November 30, 2018 till August 6, 2019, he served his sentence in the Kerch penal colony No. 2, and he was released on parole on August 6, 2019²¹⁴.

According to Oleksandr Steshenko²¹⁵, immediately after the abduction at the administrative border, FSB officers took him to an unknown facility, where he was tortured (beaten, jumped on, hit with a stun gun and rubber batons).

“After the second abduction from the administrative detention center in Simferopol and until the conviction, for three months FSB officers kept Steshenko in the basement of the FSB headquarters and tried to coerce him to incriminate himself, members of the Mejlis of the Crimean Tatar People and other persons unknown to him. After he refused, 4 unidentified FSB officers tortured Oleksandr for 4 days: they electrocuted him, strangled him with a plastic bag, pressed on his eyes with a lighter. During those 4 days, Steshenko sat on a concrete floor with a bag over his head, handcuffed to a radiator (even while sleeping), he was not given food or water, and was not taken to the toilet.

While being tortured, Oleksandr lost consciousness several times. On the fourth or fifth day, one of the Russian law enforcement officers began to threaten that if Oleksandr did not “confess”, they would insert a piece of barbed wire in his anus. After Oleksandr Steshenko once again refused to incriminate people that were strangers to him, the FSB officers began to undress him. Then he realized that the threat was real and agreed to incriminate himself and others, which was video-recorded. However, 1-2 weeks later the “confession” was recorded again. Oleksandr Steshenko believes that the FSB officers decided to make a new recording when some traces of beatings disappeared. After the officers coerced him to incriminate himself, he was given a mattress on which he could sleep and was given food once a day, but he was still handcuffed to a kettlebell weighting 24 kg. For 3 months he

213 See Steshenko, who was previously abducted by the Russian security forces, was convicted: <https://krymsos.com/ru/news/vidnosno-ranishe-vikradenogo-silovikami-rf-steshenko-vineseno-obvinuvalnii-virok/>

214 See Kharkiv resident Steshenko after the release from the Crimean colony arrived in mainland Ukraine — Korynevych: <https://ua.krymr.com/a/news-steshenko-zvilnyly-z-krymskoi-kolonii/30096313.html>

215 The interview was conducted by NGO “CrimeaSOS” in December 2019.

was held in the same room that was cold and damp, and he was not taken outside even once.

Steshenko mentioned that after the FSB officers video-recorded his confession, he was taken to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center. However, the detention administrators refused to admit Steshenko who had been severely beaten, arguing that they would not want to be held responsible if he died in the pre-trial detention center. After that, Steshenko was taken back to the FSB basement, where he was held until the trial. In addition, Oleksandr Steshenko said that he was beaten so that he refused the lawyer hired by his mother and signed an agreement with another lawyer, Mr. Okulenko. Oleksandr also mentioned that investigator Romanets was among the FSB officers, and it was he who ordered to torture Steshenko when he refused to incriminate himself and others. Notably, the period spent in the basement was not subtracted from the sentence. Steshenko requested to subtract the time, nevertheless judge Mr. Gulevich stated that Oleksandr allegedly had been out on his own recognizance.

After being sentenced, Steshenko was transferred to the pre-trial detention center²¹⁶, where he was detained from July 26 to November 30, 2018. Oleksandr said that he was held in a special block where the detention administrators hold Ukrainians and Crimean Tatars charged under “political” articles. He described very poor conditions in the special block (lack of windows and heating, constant humidity, medical treatment was not provided at all).

On November 30, 2018, after the arrival, Oleksandr Steshenko and other prisoners who had been transported to the Kerch penal colony No. 2, were made to spend 4 hours outside in the rain and wind, sitting with bended knees on their toes. If any prisoner tried to get up, he was immediately beaten. Right after the transferal, Steshenko wrote a letter to the Ukrainian Consulate in Rostov-on-Don. However, the next day, one of prison administrators, Kuryaev Ramil Rashidovich, showed him his letter and said that no complaints from Oleksandr would be sent outside the colony, and if he kept writing such letters, they would plant on him prohibited items and place him in solitary confinement. Before the visits of his lawyers, other prison administrators threatened Steshenko and told him not to tell the lawyer what was happening in the colony. Besides, when Steshenko talked to his relatives on the phone, they threatened to disconnect the phone whenever he started describing the conditions in the colony.

Oleksandr Steshenko mentioned that no medical treatment was provided to the prisoners in the Kerch penal colony, the infirmary did not even have such medicines as analgin and paracetamol. Steshenko was seriously ill several times, because he did not have any warm clothes in winter. According to Oleksandr, there were unsanitary conditions and vermin in the barracks where prisoners lived. The food was raw, sometimes a worm could be found, and the portions were small.

Also, Oleksandr Steshenko mentioned that officers in one of the shifts had very derogatory attitude towards ethnic Ukrainians. Those 4 officers came to the penal colony from the Russian city of Omsk to teach local officers how the

216 See “Tortured every day till he incriminated himself.” How FSB abducted a Kharkiv resident in Crimea: <https://ua.krymr.com/a/krym-steshenko-tortury/30102067.html>

Russian penitentiary service worked. Those officers called Steshenko “Khokhol” (a derogatory Russian term for Ukrainians) and “Pravosek” (a derogatory name of right-wing activists), asked in an insulting manner why he had come to Crimea. In addition, they contributed to Steshenko’s preventive registration as a potential prison escapee, who consequently, had to see the duty officer every 2 hours.

While Oleksandr Steshenko was incarcerated, his mother died. She was seriously worried about his detention and tortures, which could be one of the factors that caused the deterioration of her health.

Case of Edem Bekirov

Edem Bekirov, a resident of the Kherson region and a Crimean Tatar activist, was detained by Russian law enforcement officers at the Crimean administrative border (border checkpoint Dzhankoy) on December 12, 2018. Bekirov came to the occupied peninsula to visit his 78-year-old mother and other relatives. After being detained, he was taken to the FSB headquarters in Simferopol. Edem Bekirov was charged with possessing over 10 kg of the explosive Trotyl (TNT) and 190 cartridges (part 2 of article 222, part 2 of article 222.1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation) and the preventive measure of detention was applied (he was brought to the Simferopol pre-trial detention center the day after his had been detained). On August 27, 2019, the preventive measure was changed to an obligation to appear in court. On September 7, 2019, Bekirov was released as part of the so-called “big exchange” between Ukraine and the Russian Federation. Edem Bekirov has the 1st degree disability, he had a heart attack and has 4 stents, he is diabetic and his leg has been amputated (he has a prosthetic leg and uses crutches).

“ In accordance with the Russian legislation, pre-trial detention cannot be applied to a person in Bekirov’s medical condition. Despite this, he was detained in the pre-trial detention center where no medical treatment was provided, while detention administrators tried to make his conditions of detention unbearable.

Bekirov was detained in a special block in a cell measuring six square meters, where no adjustments for disabled persons were made. The cell was intended for two persons. The light was not switched off around the clock, video surveillance was maintained all the time, there was no refrigerator, the sanitary and hygienic conditions were unsatisfactory. The food was of very poor quality, hence Bekirov only ate the food items from the packages brought by his relatives. At the same time, FSB investigator Romanets promised to transfer him to a cell with better conditions in exchange for refusing the assistance of his lawyer Alexei Ladin²¹⁷.

Edem Bekirov’s lawyer and his daughter repeatedly reported that the dressing on the amputated leg was not changed, repeatedly vital essential medicines and dressings provided by his relatives were not handed over, and the detention staff took away his prosthetic leg and crutches. Relatives of Edem Bekirov submitted the report of the physician, who had attended Bekirov before the detention, to the Office of the Commissioner of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine for Human Rights Lyudmila Denisova. The medical report clearly indicated that in case of Bekirov’s medical condition, every day spent in the pre-trial detention center endangered his life.

After numerous lawyer’s requests in January 2019, Edem Bekirov, who had leg problems, convulsions, and high blood pressure²¹⁸, was taken for medical examination to the division of endocrinology of the Clinical Hospital named after Semashko in Simferopol. The examination lasted 3 days instead of the required

217 See “VIP-cell with a sea view”: Released Edem Bekirov told how the FSB wanted him to refuse the assistance of his lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-edem-bekirov-fsb-otkaz-ot-advokata/30155506.html>

218 See Crimean Tatar activist Bekirov has heart problems and convulsions — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-u-krymskotatarskogo-aktivista-bekirova-problemy-s-serdtsem/30058448.html>

two weeks, which indicated its superficial nature. After the examination, insulin was prescribed, however, the relatives stated that insulin therapy could cause significant harm, since Bekirov was not insulin-dependent. According to the lawyer, after discharge from the hospital, Edem Bekirov's condition deteriorated further, and in March 2019 he had an allergic reaction to insulin. Subsequently, Bekirov was taken several times to the hospital for examination (one of the examinations lasted only 30 minutes).²¹⁹ Moreover, after his release, Bekirov said that all medical reports at the hospital were issued by part-time FSB employees.²²⁰

Throughout the entire period of his stay in the pre-trial detention center, the political prisoner kept complaining that his health was very poor (high blood pressure, high blood sugar, chest pain, shortness of breath, breathing difficulty, pancreas problems). Because of severe pain, he periodically could not move and was forced to sleep in a sitting position²²¹. In July 2019, he did not get out of bed for 10 days because of the pinched nerve in his back²²². At the end of May 2019, Bekirov's condition became critical²²³: his legs were numb, he started suffocating and coughing up blood. At that time Edem Bekirov was in the detention infirmary, but the healthcare staff did not react immediately (he even had to keep knocking on the door for about 40 minutes before the paramedic arrived²²⁴).

“As reported by the publication “Crimea.Realities”²²⁵, on June 11, 2019, the European Court of Human Rights, in response to Edem Bekirov's application, ruled that the Russian Federation should immediately transfer the prisoner to the hospital, however, FSB investigator Romanets and the de facto Crimean prosecutor's office refused to comply with the Court decision and hospitalize the prisoner.

In addition, according to Edem Bekirov, during his stay in the pre-trial detention center, Russian law enforcement officers committed procedural violations during their investigative actions. So, on December 29, 2018, law enforcement officers took samples of his saliva for biological examination in the absence of a lawyer and by force.

After his release, Edem Bekirov underwent several urgent surgeries on his heart and legs. According to the attending physician his recovery after his stay in the pre-trial detention will take at least a year²²⁶. In addition, Bekirov struggles with serious mental health problems.

219 See Victoria Veselova, Ilya Tarasov. “The conviction should not lead to death: about the medical condition of Edem Bekirov in the Crimean pre-trial detention center: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/prigovor-ne-dolzhen-stat-smertnym-sostoyanie-zdorovja-bekirova/30071661.html>

220 See Edem Bekirov on the detention in the Crimean pre-trial detention center: “I was like a bone in their throats” (+ video): <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-edem-bekirov-ya-u-nikh-byi-kak-kost-v-gorle/30158614.html>

221 See Arrested Edem Bekirov cannot get up due to severe back pain — relatives: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-bekirov-ne-mozhet-vstavat/30108149.htm>

222 See Edem Bekirov did not get out of bed for ten days due to back pain — lawyer: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-edem-bekirov-10-dnej-ne-vstavat-s-kojki-advokat/30083966.html>

223 See “Suffocating and coughing up blood” - lawyer about the medical condition of Crimean Tatar activist Bekirov: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-advokat-o-sostoyanii-zdoroviya-bekirova/29968634.html>

224 See Edem Bekirov in court: “We live in the 21st century, and cases are fabricated as if it were 1934.”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-bekirov-v-sude-dela-shjutsa-kak-v-34-om-godu/30100189.html>

225 See Bekirov's lawyer called his release from the pre-trial detention center in Crimea an “interim victory”: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-advokat-bekirova-ob-osvobozhdenii-bekirova-iz-sizo/30131384.html>

226 See Edem Bekirov will need “at least a year” to recover from the Crimean pre-trial detention center — daughter: <https://ru.krymr.com/a/news-krym-bekirovy-nuzno-god-vosstanavlivat-zdorovie/30160471.html>

